

## I. THE WORST LIAR IN THE STATE OF OHIO

This is a story about Ronald ("Ronnie") Ray Trent, the worst liar in the state of Ohio, the lives he destroyed, and the law enforcement officer that aided him. Multiple documentaries have been done based solely on things Trent told police without the slightest attempt at an unbiased investigation into the facts.<sup>1</sup> What follows is a deep dive into a couple of the cases in which two death sentences and a sentence of life without parole were given based solely on the word of this jailhouse informant. Trent's lies in both of these cases are well documented, and the hope here is to try and achieve some measure of justice and possibly start an investigation into all his previous activities as well as the detective that facilitated him.

Trent is now fifty-three years old and other than a few months here and there has spent his entire adult life, and much of his juvenile life, in prison. In those few months, however, he has been able to do an incredible amount of damage. His life has essentially been a crime spree. He has never held a job for any length of time or made any attempt whatsoever at rehabilitating himself while in prison. Besides the multiple robberies, burglaries, and thefts Trent was convicted of while free, he was charged with molesting a little girl under the age of thirteen, and convicted of raping another also under thirteen years of age. These crimes were facilitated by his ability to avoid punishment by informing on others, which itself has destroyed multiple lives. Trent's prison life has been much the same. A drug confused series of rapes and strong arm robberies that finally ended when he attempted to join a gang and his child molesting and informing caught up to him. Trent is currently in prison, but will be released in 2027.

Trent was born in Columbus, Ohio which is located in Franklin County, and that is where he resides when not in prison. In 1990, at age eighteen, he was sentenced to five to twenty-five years in prison for what can only be described as a crime spree of armed burglaries and thefts.<sup>2</sup> From this very first arrest after age eighteen, Trent attempted to give false evidence against someone in order to reduce his charges.<sup>3</sup> When asked about this Trent testified, "I was just under arrest, I would have told them anything to try and get out of it."<sup>4</sup> This isn't just someone giving information to police. This is someone who admittedly tried to give false evidence on a completely innocent person to escape punishment for crimes he committed. His lies were not effective at that time and he went to prison. However, he would become a much more confident and daring liar over his 30 year criminal career.

While serving this sentence, his name came to the attention of law enforcement multiple times. At one point, he was bragging about being the perpetrator of a triple homicide/burglary of a family on the West Side of Columbus. When investigators began questioning Trent, he immediately attempted to pin the crime on some other innocent person.<sup>5</sup> As it turns out, neither Trent nor the person he tried to frame had anything to do with the murders. The same Trent, just a little bolder.

Sometime around 1992, while Trent was still serving his sentence, an acquaintance of his, Terry Mayle, somehow contacted him. According to Trent, Mayle made an agreement to pay Trent a "couple thousand dollars" to confess to a felonious assault for which Mayle had been convicted.<sup>6</sup> Mayle was in federal prison serving time for other charges, after which he would be moved to a state prison in Ohio to begin serving time for the felonious assault. The statute of limitations had expired for the felonious assault, so there was no risk of Trent

receiving any punishment for his confession. Trent fulfilled his end of the bargain,<sup>7</sup> and the affidavit was duly notarized and filed in a special appeal by counsel for Mayle.<sup>8</sup> Upon receiving notice of this appeal, Tim Braun, an Assistant Franklin County Prosecutor, went to prison to interview Trent. Braun's conclusion was that, beyond Trent's name and birthday, you cannot believe a single word he says. Braun signed an affidavit to this effect in July of 2001,<sup>9</sup> the same time this same prosecutor's office was using Trent in the Franklin County jail as an informant.

Upon Trent's release on parole in 1999, he continued his criminal lifestyle, having multiple run-ins with police. In October of 1999 he was charged with receiving stolen property.<sup>10</sup> Despite the years pending on his 1990 burglary charges, for some reason, Trent only went back to prison for a year or so. By the end of 2001, a few short months after his release, he was charged with Gross Sexual Imposition on a minor under the age of 13.<sup>11</sup> According to Trent, the victim's mother was attempting to frame him, a claim he says is proved by a tape he made of the victim's aunt detailing the frame up.<sup>12</sup> That ploy didn't work, but Trent was able to get these Gross Sexual Imposition charges completely dismissed and not have to register as a sex offender by working as a jailhouse informant and making an agreement to testify against James Conway and Calvin Horton in an aggravated murder case.

Before the cases against Conway and Horton could even be brought to trial, however, Trent caught another charge, receiving stolen property.<sup>13</sup> His defense for this crime is a good example of how deserving he is of the title the Worst Liar in the State of Ohio. Trent testified, under oath, that he did not steal the car, he borrowed the car with the owner's permission, and then reported the car stolen himself.<sup>14</sup> Somehow, less than a year after receiving these felony charges while still on parole, Trent was out on the streets. It was at this time that he was

charged with raping his girlfriend's daughter, who was again under the age of thirteen.<sup>15</sup> There is a long pause here before Trent receives another charge because he spent a decade in prison. By 2016 he was back on the streets and was charged with another armed burglary that year and then another along with a theft the following year.<sup>16</sup>

Prosecutors and law enforcement refuse to provide any information to any defendant or the public regarding Trent working as a jailhouse informant in the Franklin County jail. It is clear he was working nearly the entire time he was in the jail after his release on parole in 1999. Trent did not want to go back to prison labeled as a child molester and sexual predator. So, someone in law enforcement had him moved from cell to cell where Trent lied and used his status with deputies to get information using any means at his disposal. Most inmates stay in the same tank the entire time they are in the jail. Trent was moved eight times in seven months. In addition, on December 18, 2001, he was charged with a jail violation, and found not guilty, which never happens. Then, after another jail violation, he was granted a special appeal by Sheriff Karnes himself on February 14, 2002 and placed in the tank where James Conway was brought just nine days later.<sup>17</sup> Trent has a knack for avoiding consequences, even while in jail. According to Major Al Strickler, who worked in the Franklin County jail for thirty years and personally supervised it for over a decade, all this leads unavoidably to the conclusion that Trent was an agent of law enforcement. When shown the records of Trent's movement from tank to tank along with the not guilty finding and special appeal, Strickler said that such movements only occur when an inmate is providing information to someone in law enforcement, i.e., Trent was a jailhouse informant.

**(a) Detective Zach Scott**

Detective Zach Scott was working cold case homicides for the Franklin County Sheriff's Department when Trent was released on parole in 1999. He and Ronnie Trent were made for each other. According to one individual, Gary Hall, during his interrogation Scott confronted him with an affidavit signed by Trent stating that Hall had confessed a murder to Trent.<sup>18</sup> Hall says the statement Trent wrote was dated 2002 or 2003, but he hadn't spoken with Trent since 1998. Scott essentially testified that this incident never happened and that he never had any dealings with Trent outside of the homicide case involving James Conway and Calvin Horton.<sup>19</sup> Either Hall completely fabricated the interrogation or Scott lied under oath. The Franklin County Prosecutor's office as well as the Franklin County Sheriff's Office and the Columbus Police Department have refused to provide any information regarding Hall's case.<sup>20</sup>

In 2003, there was hysteria in Columbus over someone randomly shooting at cars on the freeway from overpasses. One woman was killed by a bullet ricocheting into her car and Scott was assigned the case. An individual's father notified police that his son wasn't taking his medication and could possibly be the culprit. An arrest warrant was then issued for Charles McCoy Jr, who was in Las Vegas at the time and was detained by law enforcement there. Scott flew to Vegas to interrogate McCoy and got a confession.<sup>21</sup> Before trial, attorneys for McCoy filed a motion to suppress that confession due to McCoy not being on his medication during the time of interrogation. At a hearing on this issue, Scott testified that he actually witnessed McCoy ingest his medication prior to the interrogation. McCoy's father then took the stand and demonstrated that it was impossible for Scott to have witnessed McCoy take his medication because McCoy's meds were at home with his father in Columbus. McCoy's father handed over

a pistol that was linked by ballistics to the shootings before McCoy's arrest, so it was clear that McCoy committed the crimes. The issue at trial was not guilt, but McCoy's mental capacity, and McCoy eventually pled guilty,<sup>22</sup> making Scott's testimony immaterial. Perjury is a felony, though, and Scott did not flinch at crossing that line. In many cases, particularly in cold cases, this behavior can easily lead to the conviction of an innocent person whom Scott has decided is guilty.

Scott also has a reputation for intimidating witnesses and coercing confessions. In 1997, Kareem Jackson was arrested and eventually convicted and sentenced to death for a robbery and double homicide that occurred in Columbus earlier that year.<sup>23</sup> Jackson's conviction was based on witness testimony that seemed incontrovertible. The initial interviews of these witnesses was done by Det. Scott, and, it seemed, after only a short 15 minute interview these witnesses identified Jackson and detailed the crime. However, in 2023, after 25 years of fighting lies and misdirection by Scott and prosecutors, Jackson's attorneys received the entire taped interviews. In fact, these witnesses were not as incontrovertible as initially thought, at least not until they spent hours in an interrogation room with Scott. His behavior in these interrogations cannot be described as anything other than coercive and intimidating.<sup>24</sup> If these witnesses were not, in fact coerced into identifying Jackson, there would have been no reason to create a 15 minute version of the interview to give defense counsel at trial and hide the remainder of the interviews for nearly 25 years. One of Scott's supervisors said Scott had a "gift" for interviews, "[Scott] wouldn't give up, he wouldn't accept a dead end, and he could think outside the box like no other detective."<sup>25</sup> These words were meant as a compliment, but they take on a more

sinister meaning in light of Scott's actual interrogation techniques. Jackson is still sitting on death row.

Another incident regarding Det. Scott occurred in 2002. Shawn Nightingale had been arrested for the murder of a Columbus man along with three codefendants, one of which was represented by attorney Chris Cicero. At that time, Sheriff Jim Karnes was the elected Sheriff of Franklin County and Scott was looking to be his protégé and eventual replacement as a stepping stone to being mayor of Columbus.<sup>26</sup> So, Scott was looking to make headlines. He wanted Nightingale to testify that Cicero was involved and actually ordered the homicide for which Nightingale had been arrested. There was an obstacle, though. Gerald Simmons, Nightingale's attorney, was friends with Cicero and Scott did not believe he could get Nightingale's testimony with Simmons in the way. So, Scott used his connections at the Franklin County Jail to gain entry into the jail and actually into the cell where Nightingale was being held. Because Nightingale was in jail and represented by counsel, this itself was a violation of the law. Scott, who is well over six feet tall, picked up Nightingale, who is 5'8' and 180 pounds, by his shirt and threw him up against the bars. Scott demanded that Nightingale fire his attorney and testify against Cicero.

Instead of firing his attorney, Nightingale reported the incident to the judge presiding over his murder indictment.<sup>27</sup> Of course, there were no repercussions for Scott. Nightingale, while still represented by Simmons, did eventually give a statement as part of a plea agreement accusing Cicero of ordering the murder.<sup>28</sup> Due to Scott's actions, however, Nightingale lost all credibility and Cicero was never charged with any crime. Scott turned what may have been a

credible statement into something unusable in court because of his lack of principles and respect for the law.

Because his abuses were only known in circles related to law enforcement and inmates in prison cells, Scott did eventually become the Franklin County Sheriff. In 2011, he was appointed to replace Karnes when Karnes passed away from a short battle with cancer.<sup>29</sup> Then Scott moved in for the mayoral spot, but even this showed some level of duplicity. Columbus is a Democratic stronghold in Central Ohio. In 2014, Scott decided to run against the Anthony Ginther for the Democratic nomination.<sup>30</sup> When Scott lost the Democratic primary, he ran in the general election as a Republican where he lost in a landslide.<sup>31</sup>

Scott's wrath is not reserved for people he believes are criminals. Any attempt to investigate his history is met with resistance, obstruction, and threats. John Hambel, the uncle of an individual who is on death row for a case which Scott investigated with Trent as the primary witness, requested a copy of any complaints against Scott and any reported misconduct by Scott in his capacity as a detective. This is public information, and has been ruled so by the Ohio Supreme Court.<sup>32</sup> However, no law enforcement agency, including the Franklin County Prosecutor's Office, would comply with the request. Hambel then asked the Ohio Supreme Court for an order forcing any agency with such records to hand them over.<sup>33</sup> Included in these filings was Hambel's cell phone number, as required by the Court. Numerous records were requested. On January 23, 2025, Hambel filed specific interrogatories regarding Scott's misconduct. That evening, just after midnight, Hambel received an anonymous call from an unknown number. The caller asked if he was speaking with Hambel, and then said, "Your supreme court filings will go nowhere fucktwot."

The seriousness of this threat is not apparent from the juvenile nature of the statement itself. Hambel, an IT systems manager, assumed this was Scott, who is a retired detective with no compunction for committing crimes and has many connections within law enforcement, including a daughter and son who are currently law enforcement officers in Franklin County. Scott has the power to do and get away with whatever he likes. In addition, this call came in only moments after Hambel turned out the lights in his house, suggesting Scott could have been watching from outside Hambel's home as he made the call. Hambel contacted law enforcement the next day. He was told nothing could be done because he couldn't personally identify the caller. As if phone records and other evidence aren't available to police on demand. Certainly, had Hambel made an identical call to Scott, there would at least have been an investigation.

***(b) Detective Scott meets with Trent***

In February of 2002, James Conway was arrested for a shooting that happened the month before in which one person was killed and another injured at a night club called Dockside Dolls in North Columbus. Conway was actually in the hospital at the time of his arrest. He should have been placed on the medical floor in the Franklin County jail upon his arrest. However, someone, it is unclear who, overrode this procedure and authorized Conway's placement in the tank with Ronnie Trent. Conway was arrested for the Dockside shooting on February 23, 2002 and was in the cell with Trent by the next day. In the process of Trent attempting to befriend Conway by getting him medical treatment,<sup>34</sup> Trent found out he and Conway were distant cousins.

On April 4, 2002, six weeks after Conway's arrest, Trent wrote a letter to Assistant Franklin County Prosecutor Sheryl Prichard, attempting to cut a deal.<sup>35</sup> The letter said,

To Sheryl Pritchard

I am writing this because I have information about a murder case. I am in the main jail with James Conway whom is my cousin & I know everything about his case because he told me all about it. I would like to speak with someone about this information. This is about the shooting that took place in January at Dockside Dolls where the O.S.U. student "Jarvis" was killed and "Williams" was wounded. Please send someone to see me A.S.A.P.

Thank you

Ronnie Trent

Sheryl Pritchard (should be Prichard) was assigned to Conway's case. The question arises, however, how would Trent know that. When asked about this at Conway's pretrial hearing in December of 2002, Trent didn't have an answer. He was adamant that no one instructed him to write this letter and he testified specifically that Conway never knew he was giving information to law enforcement.<sup>36</sup> A little over a month later at the actual trial, Trent testified that Conway actually instructed him to write the letter so that Trent could be placed in protective custody to kill a witness.<sup>37</sup> Yet he still somehow maintained that he wrote this letter along with another letter because his attorney was dragging her feet in getting him a deal.<sup>38</sup> Trent testified later that Conway gave him the information about the Dockside Dolls shooting so that he could testify against Conway,<sup>39</sup> an obvious lie. By the time of this last testimony in 2008, Trent had told so many lies regarding Conway that he would have needed an assistant just to keep track of them.

A few days after sending the first letter, Trent was awakened late at night and told he had a "professional visit." That is how visits from attorneys and law enforcement are announced in the jail, except that attorneys don't visit the county jail at 2am. Trent refused this visit and immediately wrote the following letter<sup>40</sup>

Ms. Pritchard

Wednesday 4-10-02

Hello once again. I am writing in regards to my information on James Conway! I spoke with my lawyer "Sarah Beauchamp" yesterday at 9:00 & told her I was willing to cooperate with you on this Dockside Dolls shooting. I also sent you a letter telling you I would talk to you. Then at approx. 2:00am this morning a detective shows up to speak with me. I refused to see him because I am not trying to get myself killed in here! That was extremely stupid. I am in a tank with multiple murderers. Do you honestly think these guys don't know who I would be seeing at 2:00 in the morning?! My cousin "James Conway" is in this tank. The first thing he said is that's a cop, only cops come to visit people at 2:00am! I'm sure you already know what Conway is capable of, if he knew or even thought I was talking to you, not only would he clam up on me, I might find myself in a great deal of danger! And no I don't want moved. Anyone that wants to speak with me needs to come down here during civilized hours!

I'm not saying this was your doing or your fault, but I'm not going to get myself killed to help you out! One of the guys testifying on Conway is Brian McWhorder. I don't know him but I know he's in protective custody and that Conway has a contract out on his life. How do I know? Because Conway told me! I told you previously James Conway is my cousin & trusts me completely. He has told me everything about his case! If you want to speak to me come during the daytime so it's not obvious I'm talking to the police!

I am willing to speak to you, but not if it means getting myself whacked! If I am moved I will not speak to you or anyone else! If you or anyone else comes down here after 8:00pm or before 8:00am to talk to me I will refuse to speak with you!

I'm no good to you or anyone else dead. Please contact me or my lawyer "Sarah Beauchamp at 224-0919" in regards to his matter A.S.A.P.

Respectfully

Ronald Trent.

Keep in mind that Trent testified under oath that Conway told him to write this letter.

After another two weeks, on April 25, 2002, Det. Scott showed up to interview Trent. Scott, however, was not investigating the Dockside Dolls shooting. He was investigating a completely different case, the death of Andrew Dotson. None of the detectives investigating the Dockside shooting were present at this meeting with Trent. In fact, the Dockside Dolls case Trent referred to in both his letters wasn't even being handled by the Franklin County Sheriff's Office, it was a Columbus Police case.<sup>41</sup> Both of the letters Trent sent dealt exclusively with Dockside, but that subject was barely talked about during this interview with Scott.<sup>42</sup> What Scott wanted to talk about was Dotson's death. And, what do you know, Trent says Conway confessed to killing Dotson too.<sup>43</sup> When asked why Dotson wasn't mentioned in any of his letters, Trent at first said he didn't hear about it until after he wrote the letters.<sup>44</sup> Then he said Conway had told him about it but he didn't believe it at the time,<sup>45</sup> as if Trent wouldn't have said anything to get prosecutors interested enough to pay him a visit and cut him a deal.

Prosecutors maintained throughout Conway's trial and appeals that no one in their office had been contacted by Trent prior to the April 4, 2002 letter to "Pritchard".<sup>46</sup> Which was

suspect at the time because in Trent's April 10 letter he is so adamant that he doesn't want moved, as if there had been some previous conversations about him moving. It wasn't until a decade after Conway's conviction and death sentence that a federal court ordered limited discovery that several other communications between Trent and law enforcement were exposed. Trent and his attorney attempted to directly phone the Dockside Dolls lead detective, Columbus Police Department Detective Mike Cone, on March 11 and March 13, 2002.<sup>47</sup> There was also a note written by another detective on March 26, 2002 to Det. Cone saying prosecutors wanted Det. Cone to talk to Trent,<sup>48</sup> and a letter written by Trent directly to the elected Franklin County Prosecutor Ron O'Brien on March 12, 2002.<sup>49</sup> So much for Conway instructing Trent to write the April 4 and April 10, 2002 letters directed to "Sheryl Pritchard".<sup>50</sup>

Despite the federal court's order in Conway's appeal, prosecutors never handed over any direct evidence Trent was working as a jailhouse informant. So, Conway subpoenaed Trent's lawyer, Sarah Beauchamp, along with her files. Beauchamp failed to comply with the subpoena and bring her files because she said she just got the subpoena and didn't have a chance to search through her files or review any records. She also claimed to have back problems and couldn't go digging for them in the storage facility where they were kept.<sup>51</sup> When asked about whether Trent was working as a confidential informant in the Franklin County jail, she essentially claimed she had amnesia. Beauchamp said she had a previous head injury and didn't remember anything about any involvement Trent may have had with law enforcement while being held in the Franklin County jail. She also said she had a practice of shredding any notes she would have taken at any such meeting as soon as the meeting was over.<sup>52</sup>

At a hearing to determine exactly when Trent started working as a jailhouse informant, prosecutors did not just hide evidence, Trent and Scott actually lied to cover up the fact that Trent had been working as an informant at least since Conway was arrested, and likely long before. Evidence arose at this hearing that information was received by the Chillicothe Police department regarding Conway on March 22, 2002, from a "confidential informant".<sup>53</sup> When asked where this information came from, Scott testified

Do I know who gave [Chillicothe police] the information? ... Yes ... It wasn't Ronnie Trent... It was not Ronnie Trent.<sup>54</sup>

Moments later Trent was called to testify and admitted providing this information through his attorney, Sarah Beauchamp.<sup>55</sup>

***(c) Despite lies, Detective Scott decides to use Trent***

There is one other dimension of this supposed "first" interview between Trent and Scott that is remarkable. Throughout this interview, Trent tells Scott that Conway had Calvin Horton put \$2,000 on Trent's inmate account as a down payment on \$30,000 Trent was to receive to kill multiple witnesses for Conway. Trent told Scott "I got the receipt",<sup>56</sup> which was dated April 9, 2002.<sup>57</sup> As it turns out, Conway's brother Jeff had already put \$3,000 on Trent's books on March 15, 2002, a fact Trent neglected to mention to anyone.<sup>58</sup> Detectives actually went back themselves and discovered this deposit. Apparently, Trent had not come up with his scheme to frame Conway at the time of this first deposit. Shortly after this money was placed on Trent's books, Trent bought a washer and dryer from Conway which was delivered to Trent's family by Horton. Trent paid for this washer and dryer by releasing \$300 from his books to Conway's

friend.<sup>59</sup> So, according to Trent's story, Conway made a down payment of \$2,000 (which later detectives claim was \$5,000) on \$30,000 to kill witnesses, then charged Trent \$300 for a used washer and dryer.

The story Trent gave Conway was that Trent had left some money and jewelry at his brother's house and he was worried about his brother's girlfriend stealing it.<sup>60</sup> Trent wanted to use this money to pay his bond, so he needed it on his personal inmate account. In return for getting Conway medical treatment, Trent asked Conway to have someone pick up the money from his brother and put it on his books so he could pay his bond. Scott testified that he investigated this accusation and determined that no one in Trent's family had that kind of money.<sup>61</sup> Trent was a criminal, so there is no way Scott could have determined that Trent didn't have access to this amount of money. And there is no way Scott could have investigated every individual Trent had contact with and determined that they did not have enough money, individually or collectively, to put on Trent's books. This just shows Scott will lie at the drop of a dime. There is no way he did any investigation. He just testified as to what was necessary to support the case against Conway. In any case, Trent released the money to his family within days of it being placed on his books, before detectives were made aware of the deposit. Detectives never actually confiscated the money, money Trent alleges he was paid to kill witnesses. They just have a record of the deposit.

Both Conway and Conway's brother Jeff testified that Trent asked them to get this money from Trent's brother and put it on his books so Trent could pay his bond.<sup>62</sup> In an attempt to cover this up, Trent testified "[Conway] didn't put no money on my books for bond."<sup>63</sup> However, a summary of the case written by Scott says "CI2 [Trent] states that Jim Conway had

large amounts of money placed on CI2'S books so the CI2 could make bond..."<sup>64</sup> When someone is telling so many lies, sometimes a few slip through the cracks.

Scott knew many of the things Trent was saying in that first interview were pure fiction, and eventually admitted as much.<sup>65</sup> It is inconceivable that Scott never asked Trent why he kept the first deposit secret. Apparently Scott didn't care that Trent was a liar, probably because he was already well aware of the fact. Whatever his knowledge of Trent's reliability, Scott enlisted Trent's help to investigate the death of Andrew Dotson. Scott had Trent placed on a kind of work release program where he was released daily from the jail into Scott's custody to wear body microphones and record phone conversations with Conway, Shawn Nightingale (referred to above), and Calvin Horton.<sup>1</sup> Had these recordings ever actually been examined and properly presented to a jury, Scott's decision to trust Trent would have backfired. As it was, no one really dug into these recordings, allowing Trent to claim they corroborated his statements and testimony in every respect.<sup>66</sup>

***(d) Trent lies about getting "paid to do a job"***

Failing to disclose the first money deposited on Trent's books is just the tip of the iceberg. In Trent's first interview, in addition to claiming Conway confessed to him, Trent told Det. Scott that Conway had agreed to pay him \$30,000 to kill witnesses. Trent's story about getting paid to be a hitman is so convoluted, if all Trent's recordings, statements, and trial

---

<sup>1</sup> In all of these transcripts, the handwritten statements are those of Trent, written after the transcripts were created, based solely on his "recollection" of what was said. In the recreated transcripts in the notes, these statements are written using a script text to identify the statements included by Trent. For example, in endnote 68, "*I put mad loot* somebody's books man put two grand on somebody's books". "*I put mad loot*" was written in the transcripts by Trent.

testimony are taken together, it is impossible to pull together a coherent narrative. In Trent's April 25 interview, Scott was adamant that he wanted Trent to get Conway on tape explicitly stating that the \$2,000 put on Trent's books was to kill a witness.<sup>67</sup> Trent never once at any time during the conversations he recorded mentioned this money to Conway. When it was brought up by Horton, Trent didn't say a thing about what the money was for.<sup>68</sup> Trent later said the \$2,000 was payment to make a video of someone confessing to the Dockside homicide and to kill a witness (more about this later).<sup>69</sup> After these deposits were made, Trent said he still hadn't been paid for the video.<sup>70</sup> Then he testified that it was only to kill a witness.<sup>71</sup> Trent also complained to Horton that he was broke when he got out,<sup>72</sup> which he wouldn't be able to claim if he had been paid \$5,000 only weeks before. Claiming to Horton he was broke makes sense, however, if Trent represented that he used the money to bond out of jail.

Trent can't even keep his story straight as to how much he was supposed to be paid. He first said \$30,000.<sup>73</sup> Then he says it will cost \$20,000.<sup>74</sup> Trent also says multiple times that he "put a lot of money in this" himself and he put "everything he's got into this."<sup>75</sup> And he's "out a lot of money."<sup>76</sup> So, at this point, he was claiming to be the one paying to kill witnesses. Then he says he and Conway have \$50,000 tied up in "this"<sup>77</sup> as if there has already been some large amount of money exchanged. At another time he says he has \$40,000 tied up in this.<sup>78</sup> Or he borrowed \$20,000 for this from his dad<sup>79</sup> to take care of things. And somehow, this investment of "30 or 40 grand" by Trent is supposed to return "30 or 40 million" dollars.<sup>80</sup> These statements are just bizarre. Trent is obviously a habitual liar, who has difficulty distinguishing fact from fiction, and cannot keep track of all the lies he is telling.

This \$30,000 payment was supposedly to be given to Trent through Horton. Trent says he was standing right beside Conway on the phone when Conway instructed Horton to give Trent whatever Trent wanted.<sup>81</sup> From the very first conversation between Horton and Trent, however, it is obvious that that wasn't true. Horton clearly had no idea who Trent was when they first met, a fact Trent was forced to admit under oath.<sup>82</sup> Horton actually says he will just give Trent what Trent asked for based on Trent's word without consulting Conway.<sup>83</sup> Horton tells Trent in their first meeting that he doesn't know anything about what Trent is supposed to be doing, and he had no idea that Trent and Conway were related.<sup>84</sup> Then he tells Trent he didn't even know Trent was in jail with Conway.<sup>85</sup> Det. Scott is listening to all this through the body wire worn by Trent.<sup>86</sup> It is unbelievable that he did not realize from the first time Trent met Horton that the entire story Trent told detectives was pure fiction. Scott just didn't care.

To make matters worse, Trent is recoding his conversations with Conway in an effort to collect evidence to corroborate what he has told police, and to use against Conway at trial. Yet, Trent is constantly telling Conway to stop asking questions, and not to say anything on the phone.<sup>87</sup> Conway is in jail at this time, and cannot speak with anyone other than Trent. Trent says he just wants Conway to make sure everyone knows he is in charge.<sup>88</sup> And Trent gets pissed when his orders are not followed immediately, or when Horton doesn't cooperate with him.<sup>89</sup> These facts only make sense in the context of Trent lying to detectives and running a scam Conway wasn't completely aware of. At one point Conway actually tells Trent that he doesn't have Trent doing anything for him.<sup>90</sup> Later that same day Conway tells Trent to stop whatever it is that he's doing and Trent flat out refuses.<sup>91</sup>

During his first interview, Trent tells Scott that Conway and Horton deal in 30, 40, 50 kilos of cocaine at a time.<sup>92</sup> That amount of drugs would have a street value of millions of dollars. From the start it is clear, not only that this was a lie, but that Conway didn't have any money to pay Trent anything. Multiple times Trent refers to knowing Conway doesn't have any money.<sup>93</sup> At one point Trent demands that Conway tell Horton to give money to Conway's lawyer so that Trent can get it from Conway's lawyer. Conway responds that Horton doesn't have any money.<sup>94</sup> Nightingale also tells Trent he doesn't have any money.<sup>95</sup> Nightingale later tries to sell Trent a motorcycle because Nightingale needs money,<sup>96</sup> then Nightingale tries to borrow money from Trent to rent a hotel room.<sup>97</sup> Trent tells Horton "I'm not making nothing you know".<sup>98</sup> In fact, Trent actually tells Horton that he is going to use the proceeds from his drug deals to pay Conway's attorney because he knows Conway doesn't have the money to do it.<sup>99</sup> It is just inconceivable that Conway agreed to pay Trent anything, much less \$30,000. A fact that would have been obvious to anyone listening to the recordings Trent made, including Scott.

Nearly the entirety of what Trent claims to be his compensation came in the form of drugs he received from Horton on two separate occasions. However, in both of these transactions, Trent agreed to pay Horton for the drugs once Trent sold them.<sup>100</sup> Scott admitted as much under oath.<sup>101</sup> When Trent attempted to make a third transaction, Horton said Trent would have to have the money up front, to which Trent readily agreed.<sup>102</sup> Somehow when it came time to testify at trial, Trent was allowed to claim that when Horton asked him for money he flat out refused and said, "I told them I was done fucking with them."<sup>103</sup> Or, alternatively, "I told him, you want me to kill people for you and give you money?"<sup>104</sup> Trent never said any such

thing. His actual response both times Horton requested money was that he would pay, he just didn't have any money to give Horton "up front...I can shoot you some back that ain't shit, but I just need something to start with."<sup>105</sup> Trent needed something to start with because he says he was broke.<sup>106</sup> The bottom line is Conway and Horton believed Trent was trying to make some money for himself and to help Conway pay his attorney, as Trent said.

There were also times when Trent borrowed money from Horton.<sup>107</sup> When Trent borrowed \$1,000 from Horton,<sup>108</sup> he assured Horton that he wouldn't be asking for money if he wasn't broke.<sup>109</sup> Keep in mind the specific goal of recording conversations with Conway is to get it on record that Conway is paying Trent to kill people. Trent was never able to accomplish this because it was all lies. There was never any agreement. You don't loan someone \$1,000 to "make ends meet"<sup>110</sup> as Trent claims when you owe them \$30,000.

Of course Trent cannot reveal that he is working to try and reduce his charges. Since he isn't going to receive any compensation, Trent explains to Horton that he personally wants to help Conway get out of jail because Conway is Trent's distant cousin and Trent "values family"<sup>111</sup> and Trent says he "has love" for Conway.<sup>112</sup> When Horton attempts to stop cooperating with Trent, Trent says, "I am going out of my way for you guys."<sup>113</sup> What happened to getting paid to do a job? Trent had nothing to lose and was taking a gamble. He was attempting to bullshit Conway and Horton, as well as detectives to see what he could do to get his charges reduced. And Scott was willfully blind, listening in the entire time.<sup>114</sup>

There is another twist to Trent's lies about Conway offering him money to kill people. For some reason, in addition to Trent saying he was a hitman, Trent says his father was a hitman too.<sup>115</sup> Trent also says his dad has a lot of money "tied up in this".<sup>116</sup> Money Trent says

Conway agreed to borrow from Trent's dad.<sup>117</sup> If Conway came to Trent asking Trent to kill people for him as Trent claims, why would all these lies be necessary? Trent was asked under oath why he pretended to be a hitman, to which he responded because that is what Conway wanted him to do.<sup>118</sup> It wasn't until after Conway had been convicted and sentenced to death that Det. Scott admitted to coming up with the idea for Trent to pretend to be a hitman.<sup>119</sup>

Once Trent's lies about getting paid were so compounded that detectives could no longer ignore them, they confronted Trent. It wasn't until this confrontation occurred on May 26, 2002 that Trent came up with a completely new narrative to explain to detectives why all the things they were hearing Horton and Conway say didn't track with what Trent had previously told them. Now, according to Trent, he at first was actually going to kill a bunch of people, then he changed his mind and decided to "fuck Conway over".<sup>120</sup> It wasn't until Conway had been convicted and been on death row for nearly a decade when Scott finally admitted Trent had lied to him in the April 25, 2002 interview. Scott said Trent was "inaccurate in some of the things he said",<sup>121</sup> and that law enforcement were very reliant on Trent for what was said in the recordings.<sup>122</sup> Trent was actually given the transcripts and allowed to write what he "remembered" being said.<sup>123</sup> These transcripts with his handwritten statements were used at trial as the official transcripts.

**(e) *A Few Assorted Lies***

The new narrative Trent invented at this May 26, 2002 confrontation with detectives was that Trent wrote the April 4 and April 10, 2002 letters referred to above at Conway's instruction. Trent said he was going to pretend to be a witness so he would be put in protective custody with another witness in the Dockside case, Brian McWhorter, so that he could kill this

witness. This newly minted story isn't told to detectives until months after Trent first attempts to contact detectives. Trent did mention McWhorter in his April 10, 2002 letter, but did not mention that Conway wanted him to kill McWhorter.<sup>124</sup> This is typical Trent, he finds out a little fact about someone's case, such as the name of a witness, and then continually enlarges it until he comes up with some fantastical story that he believes will interest law enforcement. First, in Trent's April 4, 2002 letter to "Pritchard" McWhorter wasn't mentioned at all.<sup>125</sup> Then in his April 10, 2002 letter, Trent said there was a "contract" out to kill McWhorter.<sup>126</sup> By the April 25 meeting, Trent said he was supposed to find someone to kill McWhorter.<sup>127</sup> Once he was confronted by detectives with all the lies he told, Trent comes up with the absurd story Conway instructed him to contact authorities to become a witness and get put into protective custody to kill McWhorter. More ridiculous is Trent's claim that he actually planned on killing McWhorter, then changed his mind.<sup>128</sup> If he had actually originally planned on going into protective custody to kill a witness, he would have requested protective custody in his first meeting when he was telling the original lies. He doesn't say a word about protective custody in that meeting. Instead, he told Scott that he wanted to "leave everyday to go to work for 8 hours a day and I wouldn't have to be at work you know what I mean and we could be doing whatever we need to get done."<sup>129</sup> A type of "work release" where he could collect evidence for Scott, not protective custody with McWhorter.<sup>130</sup>

Also among those Trent told detectives Conway wanted killed was Shawn Nightingale,<sup>131</sup> though Trent said Conway never gave him a reason why.<sup>132</sup> Despite the fact that Trent had never met Nightingale, he managed to persuade a willfully blind Scott that he could convince Nightingale Conway was trying to have him killed.<sup>133</sup> Scott desperately wanted Trent to get

Conway to admit this on tape so that it could be used to get Nightingale to testify against Conway.<sup>134</sup> Within two days of putting Trent to work, Scott discovered from both Horton and Conway that Trent had fabricated the plan to eliminate Nightingale.<sup>135</sup> First, in one of the first conversations Trent recorded, Conway told Trent to leave Nightingale alone.<sup>136</sup> Later that same day, Conway told Trent. “[Nightingale] really ain’t never...I mean...he never really done anything to really face anything serious” ...“I mean...I trust him with everything. You know.” Trent replied “Right...”<sup>137</sup> However, this page of transcripts was intentionally hidden. The page numbers at the bottom of the transcripts skip from page 10 to 12, leaving out page 11 where this statement is located. It is clear that this transcript was withheld from Conway because the official filing stamp in the lower right hand corner goes from page 000296 to 000297.<sup>138</sup> The only reason this statement is even known to Conway is that he actually listened to the recordings, something his trial attorneys never did. Trent says Conway changed his mind about killing Nightingale for some unknown reason.<sup>139</sup> Listening to these conversations reveals Conway never agreed to it in the first place.

Once it became clear that Scott’s plan for Nightingale wasn’t going to work out, all of a sudden, Trent decided Conway had said he wanted someone named Mike Arthurs killed. Arthurs was an acquaintance of Conway’s who is actually responsible for the death of Andrew Dotson, the case Det. Scott was investigating. Trent first mentions this to detectives on May 26, 2002, again, months after his first contact with law enforcement. At that point Trent claimed that Conway told him to kill Arthurs two-and-a-half months earlier in March of 2002.<sup>140</sup> It was not mentioned in any of Trent’s April letters to law enforcement and Trent failed to mention it in his April 25, 2002 interview even though Arthurs was discussed at length for his involvement

in Dotson's death.<sup>141</sup> At one point, Trent testified that prior to him leaving the jail, there was never any plan to kill Arthurs.<sup>142</sup> With all the lies, it is understandable that things could get confusing for Trent.

At Conway's trial, Trent testified that Conway wanted him to take a picture of Arthurs after Trent killed him and bring it to Conway on a visit in the jail so that Conway would "know that it was done."<sup>143</sup> A picture was taken of Arthurs pretending to be dead by Det. Scott, which Trent claims he took with him to visit Conway in the jail. On this visit, Trent supposedly showed Conway this picture of Arthurs, and Conway just smiled.<sup>144</sup> A smile doesn't show up on an audio recording, so of course no one can corroborate any of this. This visit was spur of the moment,<sup>145</sup> and Conway found out about it from someone else.<sup>146</sup> So, the whole idea that Conway planned the visit didn't make any sense in the first place. At Conway's trial, though, there was nothing to contradict Trent. It wasn't until after Conway's conviction and death sentence that Scott and Trent both admitted it was Scott's idea to take the pictures and set up the visit with Conway.<sup>147</sup>

***(f) Scott's Flare for the Dramatic***

One thing Trent mentioned in his April 25 interview that seemed to particularly catch the attention of Det. Scott was what Trent said about Conway's attorney, Chris Cicero. Trent told police that Conway used Cicero's cell phone and would confirm, with Cicero listening, that Trent was supposed to kill people.<sup>148</sup> Scott immediately recognizing the publicity that would result if this actually happened, responded, "...things on the phone with Sisscro [Cicero] setting there would be really interesting to hear."<sup>149</sup> Typically, however, Trent's lies frustrated Scott's ambitions. To begin with, Conway didn't set up the call. Trent called Horton and told him to set

up the call for “like 2:30”.<sup>150</sup> During this call with Conway through Cicero’s phone, Conway told Trent to leave Nightingale alone,<sup>151</sup> and that he wasn’t worried about McWhorter.<sup>152</sup>

The failure of this phone call to incriminate Cicero in any way did not perturb Scott. He repeatedly had Trent try to force a meeting with Cicero.<sup>153</sup> At one point, Trent even called Cicero directly<sup>154</sup> and tried to trick him by telling him Conway wanted them to meet up, which was another lie.<sup>155</sup> When Trent is told that Cicero didn’t want to meet him,<sup>156</sup> Trent gets really mad and says, “he doesn’t have no choice, a, dog, I go myself, fuck him”.<sup>157</sup> The next day Trent says he is going to see Cicero, “...anyway... So, he don’t know it, but I am, I’m tired of playing his little fucking pussy boy games.”<sup>158</sup> As effective as this hitman persona was at intimidating Conway, Horton, and Nightingale, it didn’t work on Cicero. Being a lawyer familiar with the legal system, Cicero was able to withstand such pressure.

With his ambitions to gain publicity ruined in regard to Cicero, Scott invented a new plot. Under the guise of helping Conway, Trent and Scott had made a video of someone other than Conway confessing to the Dockside Dolls shooting. On a few of the recorded conversations, Trent and Horton discuss where to mail this video confession.<sup>159</sup> Besides the news, Horton said they should mail a copy to the prosecutors.<sup>160</sup> Trent then began questioning Horton on whether it should be mailed to Ron O’Brien the chief Franklin County prosecutor, or to Sheryl Prichard, the prosecutor to whom Trent had sent his letters. With a little creative ambiguity here and some strategic blanks on the transcripts of this recording, Trent made it look like they were trying to decide whether to kill Ron O’Brien or Sheryl Prichard. The recording clearly says,

Trent: What's up with the fucking, which prosecutor does he want me to give this to Prichard or O'Brien?

Horton: It don't matter, its just going to fall into the hands of one of these people anyway. It don't matter.

Trent: It don't matter? Jim's [Conway] saying to O'Brien.

Horton: [inaudible].

Trent: Why I mean cause

Horton: [inaudible].

Trent: Alright, I did, I mean, I just wanna. Fuck it, it ain't none of my business.

Horton: I don't know either, I don't know. Any of 'em, it don't matter. Just send it to someone on the 8th floor \_\_\_\_\_.

Trent: (laughs)

Horton: They'll be like 'What the fuck?'

However the transcripts are slightly different. They read,

CI [Trent]: What's up with the fucking, which Prosecutor does he want me to deal with Prichard or O'Brien. \_\_\_\_\_. *Jims saying do O'Brien.*

CI: O'Brien? Why I mean cause I mean fucking.

Horton: *it's all going to fall into place perfectly it will be alright*

Horton: I don't know either, I don't know Jimmy knows.<sup>161</sup>

Both the statements, "Jims [Conway] saying do O'Brien." and "It's all going to fall into place perfectly it will be alright." are handwritten in the official transcripts used at trial by Trent. Later that day, Trent wrote a statement summarizing this conversation with Horton that reads

...I asked Horton why they "Conway & crew" wanted me to "do" Ron O'Brien?  
Horton stated "Just do it, trust me its all gonna be good." I said okay fine...<sup>162</sup>

A little fudging of the transcripts coupled with a backdated statement by Trent,<sup>163</sup> and there you are, now Conway wanted the prosecutors killed.

There was never any discussion with Conway having anything to do with any prosecutor whatsoever. In addition, Trent doesn't mention it in any letters or his April 25, 2002 statement. The first time he mentions it that can be definitely dated is his May 26, 2002 interview in which he tells detectives Conway gave him Sheryl Prichard's license plate number while they were in jail together.<sup>164</sup> How Trent got this license number isn't clear, and why he didn't say anything about it prior to May 26 is also unclear. By this time, though, Trent had met with Prichard multiple times during his undercover work with Scott. He could have gotten it at any of those meetings, or Scott could have given it to him. There is also no reason for Conway to target Prichard, who was only an assistant to the lead prosecutor in Conway's case, Dave Devillers. When asked about it in a federal deposition Ron O'Brien, still the chief prosecutor in Franklin County at the time, said he never believed the idea originated with Conway. He said he believed the entire time that Trent had fabricated the whole plot.<sup>165</sup> O'Brien also insisted that he never received any police protection because he knew the plot to be fictitious.<sup>166</sup> That didn't stop "officials" from leaking to the local news that "Measures were taken to protect O'Brien and his

family...<sup>167</sup> to sensationalize the story and taint the jury pool. Something Scott, in his bid for notoriety to achieve his political ambitions, would not hesitate to do. This fabrication was front page news for weeks after Conway was charged and every time Conway went to court.

One other falsehood that ended up garnering much publicity for Scott in his bid for mayor of Columbus was something he was able to create from Trent's final reimagined narrative. When detectives confronted Trent about his lies in his May 26, 2002 interview, the new narrative he came up with was that he had been planning on killing people and making money from it, then he decided to fuck Conway over because he was tired of being in prison and he was going to use this "opportunity to get himself straightened out."<sup>168</sup> He was making this deal with prosecutors for him and his family because his dad is 54 years old and when he dies Trent wanted him to be happy.<sup>169</sup> Initially, in his April 25, 2002 interview Trent said "I'm not asking for a lot you know it's like I told my Lawyer and the Prosecutor I'm not asking for a lot."<sup>170</sup> Trent said he had been in the Franklin County Jail for 8 months and it was "getting old" and he wanted "work release" so he could leave the jail every day.<sup>171</sup> He made no mention of any other reason for him trying to make this deal.

By the time of Conway's trial, however, a completely new narrative had arisen. While Trent was in jail with Conway, Andrew Dotson's mother, Lora Eberhard, had attempted to visit Conway to ask him if he knew anything about her son's death. Before Eberhard attempted to visit Conway, she consulted Det. Scott, who approved of her visit.<sup>172</sup> Although Conway declined the visit because he was only allowed two fifteen minute visits a week, he exchanged a few words with Eberhard. When she testified at trial, Eberhard said Conway was nothing but respectful in their short exchange.<sup>173</sup> After the visit, she sent Scott an email summarizing what

had happened.<sup>174</sup> When Trent testified, however, he said this event is what caused him to change his mind about killing people and begin working with Scott.<sup>175</sup> Trent testified that Conway, "laughed at [Eberhard's] pain" and this affected his conscience so much that he changed from a hitman to a snitch in that instance.<sup>176</sup> Trent testified that he actually pictured Conway laughing at Eberhard's face,<sup>177</sup> which undeniably did not happen. Clearly, Trent, with his rapes and armed burglaries, did not all of a sudden grow a conscience. During Trent's conversations with Horton he described to Horton what he had been charged with to end up in the jail with Conway. Trent told Horton he was in jail for "...letting a bitch suck pit bull dicks for crack..." to which Trent began laughing hysterically.<sup>178</sup>

More to the point, this visit between Eberhard and Conway took place on April 11, 2002.<sup>179</sup> By this time, Trent had been attempting to give information on Conway for well over a month. This was hidden from Conway at trial. Trent and his attorney had both made several attempts to directly contact detectives in early March of 2002,<sup>180</sup> and Trent's attorney had conversations with the prosecutor handling Trent's case at that same time.<sup>181</sup> Besides his trial testimony, the only time Trent mentions this incident is in a written statement that is dated May 18, 2002.<sup>182</sup> The date on this statement is not even written by Trent, it appears to be dated by Scott. On all Trent's correspondence, including this one, he writes dates using a dash, like 8-5-72, not a slash, like 5/18/02, as Scott does. So, Trent could've written this statement at any time, allowing Scott to pick the earliest possible date that didn't conflict with anything else. When asked why Trent never mentioned this life changing statement at any other time, including the interview with Scott that took place a mere two weeks later, Trent had no answer. He just stuck to his testimony.<sup>183</sup> Years after Conway had been convicted and sentenced to

death, Trent testified in a federal deposition. He didn't even recall this life changing event. He admitted once and for all that he began working with police to get out of his charges.<sup>184</sup>

Lying about Trent's first contact with law enforcement allowed Trent to claim, and prosecutors to argue, that Trent didn't come forward to get a deal. Prosecutors made much of Trent's supposed coming to Jesus moment at Conway's trial. In closing, they argued that Trent did not want to make a deal to get out of his charges even though Trent specifically said that multiple times in his interviews. No, prosecutors argued, Trent only made a deal because "Conway came back into his cell after a meeting with Lora Eberhard ... [and said] that stupid bitch thinks I'm going to tell her I killed her son."<sup>185</sup> Prosecutors even argued to the jury that Trent could not have possibly gotten this information from anywhere other than Conway, even though they knew that was not true.<sup>186</sup> They knew that Scott was well aware of this visit and had multiple interactions with Trent prior to Trent's statement concerning this visit. Trent was desperately trying to get a deal. So, surely when Scott was asking him about Dotson in Trent's April 25, 2002 interview, just two weeks after this visit had taken place, he would have mentioned it, as he did with any other tidbit of information he had. In fact, given the frequency with which Trent attempted to contact prosecutors and detectives, he would certainly have sent a letter as soon as he became aware of this visit. In fact, the only thing that makes any sense is that Scott told Trent about this visit long after it happened, and that prior to that Trent had no knowledge of it whatsoever.

That is not the end of the story. Years later, after Scott replaced Sheriff Karnes as Franklin County Sheriff and was gearing up for his bid for Mayor of Columbus, somehow he was able to interest ABC in this particular aspect of Andrew Dotson's death. ABC created an episode

of the series *Final Witness* around Dotson's mother being a heroine and solving the mystery of her son's death by visiting Conway. In preparation for this episode, entitled "A mother's revenge",<sup>187</sup> ABC apparently never did any kind of review of the evidence surrounding this visit, because they aired the story in 2012 exactly the way Trent portrayed it. Had they even interviewed Trent at that time, he would likely have told them the same thing he said in his federal deposition a couple years earlier, that his motivation was purely self-interest.<sup>188</sup> It seems the truth is not relevant to anyone these days.

***(g) Despite his lies, Trent gets a sweetheart deal***

Even with all the contradictions in Trent's story, the blatant lies, and the intimidation, prosecutors still cut a deal with him that reduced all his felony child molestation charges to misdemeanors, and kept him from having to register as a sex offender. Normally, the victim of Trent's charges would have some power to prevent him from getting such a sweetheart deal. The mother of the victim in Trent's case, however, was poor, so that did not happen. She testified that she felt intimidated by prosecutors and agreed to Trent's deal under duress. She said it was made clear to her that the charges against Trent for molesting her daughter would be reduced whether she agreed or not.<sup>189</sup> She believed, however, that the parole board would revoke Trent's parole for his previous burglary charges, and that he would be going back to prison.<sup>190</sup> What she did not know, was that part of Trent's agreement was that prosecutors would testify in front of the parole board on his behalf. With the prosecutors testifying on Trent's behalf at his parole hearing, he was allowed to walk free. That facilitated the rape of his girlfriend's daughter just over a year later.<sup>191</sup>

Prosecutors decided that this was an acceptable tradeoff for Trent testifying in the Dockside Dolls case and learning the details of Andrew Dotson's death. Two cases in which James Conway was given two separate death sentences, something that has never happened before in the history of the United States, and Calvin Horton was given life without parole. The foundation of this idea, however, is that the truth came out, and the right people were convicted. What if in the blind process of using a known liar like Trent, the facts of the case were actually obscured and the wrong people were convicted?

## II. DOCKSIDE DOLLS SHOOTING

### *(a) Prosecution's Case*<sup>192</sup>

The first death penalty trial against James Conway began in January 2003. From the outset the cards were stacked against him. At the end of the day during the jury selection process, one juror was waiting for the elevator when Conway's cousin Tina got in line behind her. This elevator is the only one available to the public, but the jurors have the option of using a different elevator. Conway's cousin had been observing the proceedings that day and was finishing a phone call relaying the events of the day to Conway's mother who was not allowed to attend any of the proceedings. No interaction took place between the juror and Conway's cousin.

The following day, the juror reported the incident to the Court, who held a hearing on the matter. The Court found no impropriety because there was no interaction whatsoever between the juror and Conway's cousin.<sup>193</sup> However, after being questioned about what transpired, this juror blurted out, "it was a bold move" as if Conway's cousin had made some attempt to influence her.<sup>194</sup> This juror ended up being the jury foreperson. In addition, she

showed up at Conway's sentencing hearing a month after the trial was over and the jury had been dismissed. She sat holding hands with another juror, both heads bowed in prayer. When the judge pronounced the sentence of death, she looked up at the ceiling and said, "Thank God."

The case presented by prosecutors was that on the night of January 19, 2002, Jeff Conway, James Conway's younger brother, was at the Dockside Dolls night club, where Jeff had arrived with his friend Brian McWhorter. A situation supposedly arose, and Jeff called James Conway to the bar to deal with it. According to prosecutors, James Conway was driven to Dockside by Rob Meyers and Calvin Horton who had a .45 Colt pistol locked in their trunk. As evidence that this gun belonged to James Conway rather than Horton who owned the car, prosecutors introduced a photo taken in James Conway's bedroom of an empty Colt .45 gun box.<sup>195</sup> As the Dockside Dolls night club was closing, a fight broke out in the parking lot in which Mandel Williams sliced Jeff's stomach open with a knife or box cutter of some kind. Prosecutors claim that once James Conway found out his brother had been stabbed, he and Meyers retrieved the .45 Colt pistol from Horton's trunk and went to find Williams. Witnesses describe Meyers retrieving a large semi-automatic handgun from his trunk.<sup>196</sup> James Conway supposedly approached Williams as Williams was running away and James Conway opened fire. A total of eight shots were fired which witnesses say happened as fast as the trigger could be pulled. At this time, prosecutors claim Jeff was at the opposite end of the parking lot.<sup>197</sup>

As the gun was being fired, according to witnesses, Williams grabbed the nearest person to him, Jason Gervais, and used Gervais as a human shield.<sup>198</sup> Prosecutors admitted a diagram of the parking lot created by Columbus Police that indicated a trail of shell casings leading up to

where Williams and Gervais were shot. This diagram was used to argue that James Conway walked up on Williams and Gervais, and the final shot was at nearly point blank range.

Then, of course, prosecutors also called the jail house informant Ronnie Trent, who essentially supported their version of events. Trent claimed that James Conway had confessed that he was called to the bar by his brother Jeff because Jeff was having a problem with some people. Crucially, Trent claimed James Conway told him that once Williams pulled Gervais in front of him, James Conway kept firing because he knew the bullets would go through Gervais and hit Williams. Trent also claimed as stated above, that while they were in jail together, James Conway concocted a plan to have Trent find someone to falsely confess to the shooting at Dockside and for Trent to kill Brian McWhorter because McWhorter witnessed the shooting. Trent also claimed, as already addressed, James Conway agreed to pay him \$30,000, for which he received a down payment of \$2,000, or \$5,000, depending on which version of Trent's story you hear.

***(b) Did Jeff Call his Brother for Help?***

The answer to this question is critical because it relates to premeditation. If Jeff Conway was at a bar and called his brother James Conway to come to the bar to fight, and James Conway brought a gun, this could support a charge of premeditation and would prevent James Conway from claiming self-defense. There was never any evidence to support this other than Trent's statement and in fact this was contradicted at trial by Brian McWhorter's testimony. McWhorter testified that he arrived with Jeff and Jeff's brother James Conway was already at the bar.<sup>199</sup> This did not slow down prosecutors one bit. They argued to the jury repeatedly in

closing arguments that James Conway was summoned to the bar by Jeff because there was a problem and James Conway arrived with Meyers, Horton, and the .45 pistol.<sup>200</sup>

What jurors were never made aware of because James Conway's attorneys failed to submit the evidence, was that the surveillance footage from the bar that night showed conclusively that the prosecutors version of events were incorrect. All the times seem to be off by an hour, maybe due to daylight savings time, but the order of arrival is indisputable. The actual shooting was not visible, clear on the footage, though, is Meyers arriving at 12:23am with Horton, then James Conway arriving at 1:18am and going directly to receive a private dance. It wasn't until 1:36am that Jeff's car shows up on the surveillance footage and McWhorter is seen entering the bar at 1:37am. Corey McCormick, an associate of Williams, arrives at 2:26am, and Williams himself doesn't show up until 2:44am, only 15 minutes before closing time.<sup>201</sup> Prosecutors had this surveillance footage in their possession at the time of trial, and even had it processed so that the relevant individuals were marked for presentation to the jury. They even had a detective in the case, James Gravett, testify that none of the relevant people were visible arriving on the surveillance footage,<sup>202</sup> which is clearly untrue. Certainly, they couldn't allow the jury to see this and still make the argument they wanted. So, they didn't present the evidence and in fact made an argument to the jury they knew to be false.

What actually happened is the exact opposite of what prosecutors claim. Corey McCormick, with whom Jeff had problems with in high school, came to Dockside and saw that Jeff was there. McCormick then called his friend Mandel Williams, who arrived at Dockside just before closing time with a car load of people, a gun, and a knife. Williams claims he was there to pick up a female friend. No evidence of who he was going to pick up has ever surfaced.

**(c) *The .45 Gun Case***

Another deceptive argument prosecutors made to the jury is that the gun taken from Horton's trunk belonged to James Conway. They submitted a photo from James Conway's bedroom that showed a gun case of identical make and caliber, a Colt .45. Prosecutors then argued that James Conway was lying when he said the gun used at Dockside did not belong to him.<sup>203</sup> Conveniently, the photo used at trial by prosecutors did not show the side of the gun case with all the information relevant to the gun. The gun used at Dockside was never recovered, but testimony at trial was that the gun used was a large semi-automatic pistol.<sup>204</sup> The gun in the gun case was a "compact" and had a "matte blue finish." In addition, the serial number of the gun was listed as CP29695.<sup>205</sup> The gun with this serial number was in the possession of the prosecutors at the time of James Conway's trial. Prosecutors refuse to hand over the ballistics report for this gun.<sup>206</sup> Surely if it had matched that of the gun used at Dockside it would have been used against James Conway.

**(d) *Parking Lot Diagram***

Not only did prosecutors use evidence they knew was inaccurate, they also were involved in fabricating evidence. Part of their argument to support intent to kill and premeditation was that James Conway walked a long distance right up on Williams and Gervais and fired the final shots at point blank range. To support this they had police Detective Kevin Jackson create a diagram of the side parking lot at Dockside where the shooting took place.<sup>207</sup> This diagram was supposed to be based on measurements Jackson made at the scene that night. However, the diagram contradicts the photographs from the scene.

On the diagram, the front bumper of a car license plate number CSQ-6099 is directly next to a crime scene placard #9. Placard numbers 2 through 9 were all spent shell casings, and on the diagram placards 2 through 8 are within a small radius, two parking spaces. However, the diagram has the last shelling casing, marked #9, only feet away from where Williams and Gervais were shot, next to where placards 10 and 11 are in the diagram.<sup>208</sup> The actual crime scene photos from that night show something completely different. In the photo, Cruiser R-26 is nearly bumper to bumper with car CSQ-6099 (the maroon Chrysler on the right side of the photograph), and placard #9 is even with the front bumper of this car.<sup>209</sup> It is obvious from the photographs that Placard #9 is actually closer to Cruiser R-26 than placard #5.<sup>210</sup> The actual crime scene didn't fit the prosecution's theory, so in the diagram they had created, they simply moved car CSQ-6099 and placard #9 up about twenty feet closer, next to placards 10 and 11, where Williams and Gervais were found.

In front of the northern most car on the north side of the diagram, license number CNW-7774, is a "Light source". This light source is clearly visible in the crime scene photographs taken by Jackson in front of what is marked on the diagram as Cruiser 181.<sup>211</sup> This cruiser is next to three empty parking spaces in the center of which is placard #1, which is marked by a cone in one photograph. James Conway's attorney spent nearly his entire cross examination of Jackson talking about the problem with the location of this light source on the diagram.<sup>212</sup> Jackson would not admit there was even a problem. Clearly, the diagram was distorted for the purpose of supporting the prosecution's theory of the case.

In closing arguments, prosecutors actually said, "The fact that James Conway goes to get the gun somewhere around where the first round is jacked, where the number 1 is on the

diagram, and then walks towards number 9, where the shell casing is, and continues to fire as he walks up on Mandel and Jason is time enough for him to form the plan to kill Mandel Williams and ultimately killing Jason Gervais. It's plenty of time."<sup>213</sup>

***(e) Expert Reconstruction***

As a defense against the prosecutors theory that the final shots taken at Dockside were from point blank range and that Mandel Williams was running away when he was shot, James Conway's attorneys hired a professional accident reconstructionist. Using Williams's medical reports, the autopsy reports and measurements from the scene as well as all other available information, this expert was able to create a computerized rendition of the trajectory of the bullets fired at Dockside the night of the shooting. This computerized rendition demonstrated that the shots were all fired in rapid succession as Williams was running toward the shooter, and that they struck both Williams and Gervais as they fell. Importantly, the shot that actually killed Gervais struck him below his waste and was only fatal because of the way Williams had tried to use Gervais as a human shield.<sup>214</sup>

The jury, however, was never allowed to view this reconstruction, and the expert was not allowed to testify because Conway's attorneys didn't give prosecutors proper notice. Thus, James Conway was unable to put on a real defense.

***(f) Ronnie Trent's Testimony at the Dockside Trial***

James Conway's attorneys also did a terrible job cross examining Ronnie Trent. Some of the things they could've used were hidden by the prosecutors, but by the time of Conway's trial Trent had changed his story so many times and told so many lies that a thoroughly prepared

attorney would have completely discredited him. For example, Trent's allegation that Conway confessed to him. None of Trent's letters to prosecutors to get a deal actually said Conway confessed.<sup>215</sup> He merely says he has the "details" of the case, and wants to make a deal. The only reason to word it like that is because Conway didn't confess to him. Being familiar as Trent is with the justice system and providing information to law enforcement, Trent knew the details were all he needed. Once he got the details of Conway's case from various sources, including watching the local news, he used those details to fabricate as shocking a story as possible knowing the worse he made it for Conway, the better it would be for him. The more sensational the case, the more interested the prosecutors, and the better the deal for Trent. That is how a case like the shooting at Dockside Dolls gets turned into a death penalty case.

What really happened is Trent befriended Conway by helping him receive medical treatment. In a weird twist of fate, it turned out Trent and Conway were distant relatives. Trent ingratiated himself with Conway, getting to know who Conway's friends were and getting some of the particular facts of Conway's case from news coverage and by telling Conway he was trying to help.<sup>216</sup> All the while planning to distort what he was learning to get out of the charges he was facing. Trent also asked a few little favors of Conway, which Trent then used as corroboration when he went to police. Trent told Conway he would try and help him by helping pay his lawyer and see what else he could do. No specifics, just a general promise to try and help. Then Trent came up with this outlandish story about Conway confessing and having this extensive hit list, which supposedly included prosecutors.

Besides the confession Trent says he got from Conway, his testimony in the Dockside Case was important in two other respects. Trent testified that Conway came to him with a plan

to have someone confess to the Dockside shooting. However, it is Trent with the history of creating false confessions. He has done it at least twice, for Terry Mayle, and at least one other time to get out of the child molestation charges he was facing at the time. So, there is little doubt that this idea originated with Trent. Trent has also admitted to attempting to lie on an innocent person to get out of his charges more than once. The original purpose behind Trent's idea to make a false confession to use in the Dockside case was so he could learn some of the details of the Dockside shooting to use to fabricate a story. Trent used an identical scheme to attempt to get information on the death of Andrew Dotson. He told Horton and Nightingale he had a "beautiful plan". Trent wanted Horton and Nightingale to give him all the details of Dotson's death so that, according to Trent, he could make a video of someone confessing to killing Dotson,<sup>217</sup> "just like he did with Dockside".<sup>218</sup> Even though Trent literally conceives this plan while on a recorded conversation with Horton, he testified under oath that it wasn't his idea.<sup>219</sup>

The other significant part of Trent's testimony in the Dockside case was his allegation that Conway wanted him to kill Brian McWhorter. According to Trent, Conway wanted Trent to kill McWhorter because McWhorter witnessed the shooting at Dockside. Again, Trent's testimony would have been easily discredited had Conway's attorneys been thoroughly familiar with all his statements. The evolution of this allegation is the most powerful evidence of the fact that it is pure fiction. First, Trent says Conway has a "contract out" on McWhorter's life;<sup>220</sup> then Trent says he was supposed to find someone to kill McWhorter;<sup>221</sup> then Trent says he was supposed to go into protective custody and kill McWhorter.<sup>222</sup> When they first met, Horton told Trent that Conway wasn't worried about McWhorter,<sup>223</sup> and thus wasn't trying to have him

killed. In addition, the only two recorded conversations between Trent and Conway about McWhorter, Conway says neither he nor his attorney is worried about McWhorter.<sup>224</sup>

To make matters worse, the \$2,000 was put on Trent's books on April 9, 2002, the day before he wrote the April 10, 2002 letter claiming Conway had a contract out on McWhorter. If Conway had paid Trent to kill McWhorter, why wouldn't he mention that he was the one with the "contract"? And why would he tell detectives two weeks later that he was supposed to "find someone" to kill McWhorter, not that he was supposed to do it himself? Even prosecutors were forced to admit Conway did not want McWhorter killed when Trent actually spoke directly to Conway about it.<sup>225</sup> They just refused to admit to the jury that Trent had been lying from the beginning.

### ***(g) The Importance of Trent's Statement***

In the Dockside case, Conway was charged with premeditated murder with a mass murder death specification. The entirety of the evidence supporting the mass murder death specification was Conway's supposed confession to Trent. According to what Trent testified to at trial, Conway said that he saw Williams pull Gervais in front of him, but Conway said "It's a .45, you know, it would go through him [Gervais]. So he kept shooting."<sup>226</sup> Initially, Trent said James Conway had told him "fuck it I got a 45, I'm just going to keep on shooting."<sup>227</sup> Critically, this statement was made on May 26, 2002, and Trent never spoke with Conway after that date. So, Trent added the part about the .45 going through Gervais to get to Williams without speaking to Conway, and then attributed the statement to Conway as he has done over and over. There was no other evidence that Conway ever intended any harm to Gervais. Without that statement by Trent, Conway would not have been eligible to receive the death penalty.

In addition, there is no corroboration whatsoever for this statement in either form, just what Trent said Conway told him. First of all such a train of thought would be extremely unlikely in the actual heat of passion in the less than two second interval between the first and last shot. More importantly, Trent's word alone should not be sufficient to give someone the death penalty. The long and short of it is, Conway never made any such statement. Trent got a few details of the case and fabricated a story to make Conway look as wicked as possible for his own benefit.

***(h) All the Evidence Supports that Conway was Defending his Brother***

Another important consequence of Trent's testimony was that it made it difficult for Conway to claim he was defending his brother against a second attack by Mandel Williams. When someone is at fault in creating a violent confrontation, he cannot turn around and claim he was defending himself or another. Therefore, Trent's claim that Jeff called his brother James Conway to the bar because Jeff was having problems allowed the jury to ignore the circumstances during the actual shooting. Clearly, as stated above, that was not true, and prosecutors knew it wasn't true. What makes this argument to the jury all the more shocking is all of the circumstances directly surrounding the shooting demonstrate that James Conway was defending his brother Jeff.

James Conway was dropped off at the bar by his girlfriend, which is visible on the surveillance footage from Dockside that night.<sup>228</sup> All patrons must pass through a metal detector to enter, which James Conway did.<sup>229</sup> Thus, he had no weapons on him and did not have a vehicle in the parking lot with any weapons. He arrived at the bar after Calvin Horton and Rob Meyers, and was getting a lap dance within five minutes of his arrival,<sup>230</sup> clearly not

there to fight or cause problems. James Conway's brother Jeff arrived twenty minutes later and still there were no altercations.<sup>231</sup> Corey McCormick then arrives fifty minutes later.<sup>232</sup> McCormick had a prior altercation with Jeff in which McCormick and his friends damaged Jeff's 1994 Ford Thunderbird with baseball bats,<sup>233</sup> the same car Jeff drove to Dockside the night of the shooting. A police report was made of this incident.<sup>234</sup> So, McCormick and Williams were both well aware of the car Jeff drove, which was parked in the rear parking lot, behind the building and to the north of the east side parking lot displayed in the diagram used at James Conway's trial. Twenty minutes after McCormick arrived, Williams arrived<sup>235</sup> as the bar was preparing to close with a carload of guys, armed with multiple weapons, including a fully loaded semi-automatic hand gun and a "razor with a black handle."<sup>236</sup> A half hour later James Conway was still having a good time getting another lap dance, and there had still been no altercations.<sup>237</sup>

When Williams arrived, he did not park in a parking space, he whipped his car in between the exit door and the rear parking lot where Jeff's car was, knowing full well that Jeff would have to pass by him to leave. His car was a maroon Chrysler, license plate CSQ-6099,<sup>238</sup> prominent on the diagram, though the diagram depicts it about twenty feet further from the entrance/exit than the crime scene photographs show.<sup>239</sup> Once the bar closed, someone knocked an individual out near the front door. Troy Ankrum, a bouncer at Dockside, is the only person who testified about this fight. At the time of James Conway's trial, Ankrum had to be transported to the Franklin County courthouse because he was in Pickaway County jail for not paying child support.<sup>240</sup> Initially, Ankrum testified that a black man had knocked out a white man who was just standing in the parking lot, but he couldn't tell "honestly who exactly hit him

in the commotion, I couldn't pick somebody out, no."<sup>241</sup> Then, Ankrum was allowed to "refresh" his memory during a recess.<sup>242</sup> The prosecutor specifically requested that she be able to refresh his memory out of the presence of the judge, which is highly unusual and inappropriate when a witness is in the middle of testifying.<sup>243</sup> When Ankrum returned to the stand, he said that Jeff, who is white, threw the first punch and knocked the other white guy out with so much force it "shocked" Ankrum.<sup>244</sup> Prior to this, Ankrum had testified specifically that he hadn't seen Jeff swing on anyone, and that Jeff was actually trying to break up the fight.<sup>245</sup> Ankrum testified that Williams snuck around between the cars and stabbed Jeff.<sup>246</sup> Clearly Williams was not in any danger at the time.

Nearly as soon as Jeff exited the bar, Corey McCormick and his friends attacked him.<sup>247</sup> Jeff said he was being held by one of McCormick's friends bent over forward with his hands above his head, leaving his abdomen exposed.<sup>248</sup> This is when Williams sliced Jeff across the abdomen twice.<sup>249</sup> Williams admits to stabbing Jeff, but says he took the knife from Jeff in self-defense and used it to stab Jeff.<sup>250</sup> Both stab wounds were uninterrupted slices that did not go through the t-shirt Jeff was wearing because it had been pulled up somewhat due to the way Jeff was being held.<sup>251</sup> This would not have happened if Jeff had been able to block the knife in anyway. In his first interview, Williams denied having a knife that night, and denied he was even involved in the fight and didn't stab anyone.<sup>252</sup> In his second interview, however, Williams admitted bringing a "razor with a black handle" to Dockside, but still claims he never stabbed anyone, which he maintains in his third interview.<sup>253</sup> Seconds before he was stabbed, Jeff had walked through the exit after passing through the metal detector,<sup>254</sup> and couldn't possibly have had a knife. And the stabbing occurred within feet of Williams's car. So, Williams version of

events is not credible, and because he was responsible for starting the altercation and escalating it with a deadly weapon, he could not claim self-defense and was responsible for everything that transpired afterward.

Williams would likely have done much more damage to Jeff if one of the bouncer's, Paris Long, hadn't been breaking up the fights and "corralled" Williams against the wall.<sup>255</sup> By all accounts, Jeff was stabbed in the middle of the parking lot around where Cruiser R-26 is placed in the diagram.<sup>256</sup> (Cruiser R-26 was not there at the time of the stabbing.) According to Williams, he was headed back to his car when he was shot.<sup>257</sup> However, Williams stabbed Jeff around Cruiser R-26, which was only feet away from Williams's car, marked CSQ-6099. For some reason Williams could not explain, when paramedics arrived, he was on the ground where the 10 and 11 placard are, right at the north east corner of the building, well past his own car and between the exit door and where Jeff's car was parked in the back parking lot.<sup>258</sup>

All of this evidence supports James Conway's defense that Williams had not finished and went to the back corner of the building to have another swipe at Jeff before Jeff could get to his car. At some point, Jeff informed his brother, who was standing with Rob Meyers, that he had been stabbed. Prosecutors claim that Jeff was at the opposite end of the parking lot, but he was seen by a bouncer who testified for the prosecution identifying Williams as the person who shot him seconds before the shooting started.<sup>259</sup> Witnesses say Meyers retrieved a large semi-automatic pistol and pulled the slide back, ejecting a live round onto the ground. This round is marked by placard #1 in the diagram. Trent claims James Conway confessed to ejecting this round.<sup>260</sup> However, prosecution witnesses actually saw Meyers eject it.<sup>261</sup> James Conway, Jeff, and Meyers then began walking, from placard #1 back to get Jeff's car when Williams came

out from behind the building toward Jeff. Williams says he was facing the shooter when he was shot.<sup>262</sup> In addition, he was shot in the left shoulder,<sup>263</sup> which would not be possible if he was running north with the building to his left and the shooter to his right. When Jeff noticed Williams coming at him, he called out. James Conway took the pistol from Meyers and opened fire on Williams, shooting as fast as the gun could be fired.<sup>264</sup> Being responsible for the altercation in the first place, and the only person up to this point to use a deadly weapon, Williams then grabbed the nearest innocent bystander, Jason Gervais, and used him as a human shield.<sup>265</sup> Williams claims Gervais, whom he had never met before, dove on top of him to shield him from the gunfire.<sup>266</sup>

Despite all these undisputed facts, Williams, who should have been charged with Gervais's murder, never faced any charges, not even for stabbing Jeff. Thanks to Trent, the facts of the Dockside shooting were completely obscured by all his ridiculous allegations, which had absolutely nothing to do with what actually happened at Dockside, and were only made so he could to escape punishment.

### **III. DOTSON CASE**

Andrew Dotson's body was found on Galloway Road on the far west side of Columbus, Ohio on October 10, 2001. Detective Scott began working the case that night, and according to him, there were very few leads in the case and those quickly dried up. The initial examination of Dotson's body revealed two wounds to the torso, one to the chest and one to the abdomen. The medical examiner thought that these wounds were gunshot wounds at first. Further inspection revealed them to be sharp instrument wounds, however. Because the toxicology

report and other examination of the Dotson's body didn't reveal any other possible cause of death, the medical examiner listed these sharp instrument wounds as the cause of death.

Det. Scott says his investigation was at a standstill until he was introduced to Ronnie Trent, who told Scott that he was in the Franklin County jail with James Conway, and Conway confessed to killing Dotson. Trent also related to Scott that three of Conway's friends, Calvin (Jamie) Horton, Shawn Nightingale, and Mike Arthurs, were aware of, and possibly involved in Dotson's death. That is when Scott decided to put Trent undercover to work, recording conversations with Conway, Horton, and Nightingale.

***(a) More Lies from Trent***

The version of Andrew Dotson's death that Trent says he got from Conway was no more credible than anything else he told police. It had a few details, but the vast majority of what he told detectives was contradicted by his own words, and, more importantly, the physical evidence and the autopsy. To start with, Trent said Shawn Nightingale and Mike Arthurs were supposed to take Dotson to West Virginia, "OD" (over dose) him and leave him down there.<sup>267</sup> Both Arthurs<sup>268</sup> and Nightingale<sup>269</sup> say there was never any plan to give Dotson pills. They said Dotson loved taking pills and asked them to get him some when they got to West Virginia, and Dotson voluntarily took them while they were still in West Virginia.<sup>270</sup> Then Trent says Dotson was brought back to Columbus, Ohio where he says, Conway confessed that he stood on Dotson's neck until he was dead.<sup>271</sup> From the very first conversations between Trent and Horton, it was obvious that Trent had lied to detectives about Conway confessing to killing Dotson. In Trent's second meeting with Horton, Trent clearly says that the only information he

received while in the jail with Conway was that Arthurs killed Dotson by standing on Dotson's neck.<sup>272</sup>

By this time Det. Scott was convinced that Conway had killed Dotson, and refused to entertain any other possible suspects, including Arthurs. Once Trent lied to Scott about Conway confessing to killing Dotson, that was it. Scott contacted Arthurs's family to interview him regarding Dotson's death, and Arthurs hired attorneys and began working out a deal. In exchange for his testimony, Arthurs was allowed to plead guilty to abduction and received four years in prison, time which was to run concurrent with four years he was already scheduled to serve for a robbery conviction.<sup>273</sup> That means, whatever Arthurs involvement, he would not serve a single additional day in prison for Dotson's death.

Predictably, Trent left out a crucial detail in this first interview with Det. Scott. He failed to tell Scott that he was close friends with Arthurs's uncle.<sup>274</sup> Shortly after killing Dotson, Arthurs confessed to his entire family.<sup>275</sup> So, Trent likely knew Arthurs killed Dotson before he even met Conway, and if he didn't, he had easy access to the information as well as a motive to pin it on Conway once they did meet. Since Arthurs killed Dotson and everyone knew it including Trent, there is absolutely no reason for Conway to want Arthurs dead. This completely eliminates the idea that Conway told Trent to kill Arthurs. Keep in mind, Scott is listening in on all these conversations, and yet, never says a single word to Trent about the discrepancy between what Trent told him and what he is hearing everyone say. Apparently, so long as the lie supports Scott's theory of the case, it will go uncontested.

And lie to pin it on Conway is exactly what Trent did. Nearly everything Trent told detectives about Dotson's death was contradicted by Arthurs. Although Arthurs initially lied

about standing on Dotson's neck to detectives in his May 13, 2002 interview,<sup>276</sup> he and his attorneys were allowed to review the evidence, including the autopsy.<sup>277</sup> Because the initial autopsy report did not list any neck injuries, Arthurs felt confident enough in his May 23, 2002 interview to admit to standing on Dotson's neck,<sup>278</sup> the act Trent attributed to Conway.<sup>279</sup> Arthurs says he came up with the idea to stand on Dotson's neck and actually did it, but, he says, he wasn't putting any pressure on Dotson's neck, he was just "faking it".<sup>280</sup> Even after admitting he initially lied to detectives, Arthurs was still given the deal he was promised, not a single day in prison for Dotson's death. According to Scott, what was critical to giving Arthurs a deal was the fact that Arthurs was able to identify the instrument that caused the wounds to Dotson's abdomen as a pick ax<sup>281</sup> which the initial autopsy determined was the cause of death. Never mind that Arthurs could have been the one to use the pick ax.

It was common knowledge among anyone who knew Arthurs that he had killed Dotson. Besides telling his entire family that he had killed Dotson, Arthurs told numerous other people. From the time of Dotson's death up until Arthurs himself died of an overdose in 2016 he bragged to any and everyone who would listen about how he got away with murder.<sup>282</sup> So, it is impossible to say how many people had various details about Dotson's death, including associates of Trent's. While he was serving time for robbery, Arthurs bragging in fact caught up to him. It seems an "adopted cousin"<sup>283</sup> of Dotson's named Arthur Wood was housed at the same facility and heard rumors of Arthurs bragging. Wood confronted Arthurs, who admitted to killing Dotson. Then Arthurs asked corrections officers to put him in protective custody. Wood testified to these statements at Conway's trial.<sup>284</sup> Arthurs, however, claimed he never made any such statements.<sup>285</sup> Prosecutors couldn't deny the obvious. Wood was clearly credible and

certainly wouldn't have testified on Conway's behalf had Arthurs not admitted to killing Dotson. Prosecutors dismissed Arthurs' confession as prison braggadocio. Apparently, Trent is the only person with any credibility in the eyes of detectives and prosecutors.

***(i) Det. Scott uses Trent to coerce witnesses and then tries to cover it up***

This entire spectacle of Det. Scott directing Trent to pretend to be a hitman<sup>286</sup> is difficult to understand. If Conway out of the blue offered Trent, evidently just another inmate in the jail, money to kill witnesses, why would Trent have to pretend to be a hitman? The simple answer that explains his performance is intimidation. In the dozen times Trent and Conway spoke over the two weeks Trent was making his recordings for Scott, almost nothing they talk about is in anyway related to what actually happened at Dockside or to Dotson. Nearly the entirety of the recordings Trent made at Scott's directive is merely Trent coming up with various schemes that Trent attributes to Conway and then intimidates Horton into carrying out. These bad acts are then used to prove that Conway and Horton were involved in Dotson's death. The intimidation is real, it comes across even when simply reading the transcripts of these conversations.

In particular, when Horton says he does not think Nightingale should be killed, Trent says okay, but if Nightingale turns out to be a snitch, Trent is going to "come see" Horton.<sup>287</sup> Meaning he is going to kill Horton if Nightingale turns against him. The purpose of this is letting Horton know his life is in danger if he doesn't agree with Trent to kill Nightingale. Trent says much the same to Conway. "Don't get me caught up...cause you let you emotions get involved...you need to cut your losses or take a gamble I'm taking a gamble enough."<sup>288</sup> All of this is at the direction of Det. Scott and is clearly coercive and improper. An undercover police

agent cannot threaten someone with death if they don't commit a crime, and then turn around and charge them with the crime. That is exactly what happened here.

Furthermore, every time Horton or Conway<sup>289</sup> are reluctant to follow Trent's instructions or give Trent information, Trent gets extremely angry<sup>290</sup> and says they are accusing Trent of being a cop.<sup>291</sup> These accusations affect Trent's "easy anger".<sup>292</sup> At one point Horton says they won't be talking to Trent about Dotson and Trent essentially doesn't give him a choice, because in Trent's mind, this means he is being accused of being a cop.<sup>293</sup> Then Trent goes into a rant about how mad he gets when someone accuses him of being a cop. Horton did not say a word about Trent being a cop. As a hitman, Trent is able to use this anger to make Horton believe he will be killed if he doesn't do as Trent wants and tell Trent what he wants to know. All the while, Scott is listening in.<sup>294</sup> There are multiple times Trent refers to Horton believing Trent is going to kill him, and how Horton is "about to piss himself" every time Trent comes around.<sup>295</sup> In one conversation after Horton leaves a meeting with Trent, Trent says into the microphone to Scott listening in, "dude, he is so fuckin scared, it is unbelievable. It's on tape."<sup>296</sup>

When anyone attempted to avoid Trent or convince him that what he was doing was unnecessary, he reacts with his typical anger.<sup>297</sup> When Conway wasn't cooperating with what Trent wanted, Trent actually told him, "no more change of plan and no more change of orders, no more change of instructions."<sup>298</sup> Scott says Trent gets angry because Conway is giving Trent the "runaround".<sup>299</sup> You would think that would be evidence enough to Scott that Conway did not want to participate in Trent's schemes and Scott would tell Trent to back off. Anyone who knows Scott and his tactics would know that was never going to happen. It is clear that Trent is

in charge and instigating everything that is going on. Trent pursued Conway, Horton, and Nightingale relentlessly threatening and intimidated them to get them to cooperate with him.<sup>300</sup>

The tactics used by Scott and Trent to gather evidence against Conway and Horton should be disturbing to anyone who cares about justice. Trent was posing as a hitman, and multiple times he threatened to kill Horton if Horton didn't cooperate. Trent told Horton he has killed people in the past and is prepared to do so again.<sup>301</sup> Trent also said his dad was a hit man and his dad's friends were also hit men.<sup>302</sup> In addition, Trent was representing himself as a sort of dirty police agent that would find out if anyone tried to go to the police about what he was doing.<sup>303</sup> Trent had pictures of people he had allegedly killed.<sup>304</sup> Trent kept pressing and said he was going to kill Nightingale regardless of what Conway or Horton thought, because Nightingale could identify Trent and knew Trent as a hitman.<sup>305</sup> Trent also threatened to kill Horton if Horton didn't give him the details of Dotson's death.<sup>306</sup>

Because of the threats to Horton's life, his attorneys believed that his statements were made under duress and thus involuntary. They filed a motion to suppress these statements and a hearing was held. One event that Horton's attorneys focused on was a trip Trent wanted to take to Chillicothe with Horton so Horton could show him around and tell him where witnesses lived. Horton initially refused to accompany Trent on this trip because he was afraid Trent would kill him while they were in Chillicothe.<sup>307</sup> Nearly two days of transcripts are dedicated to Trent trying to convince Horton that he won't be killed on this trip. On May 19, 2002, in reference to this trip Trent says, "Right, what, he's afraid I wouldn't let him come back?"<sup>308</sup> Then later this same day Trent tells Horton, again in reference to this trip, "I feel you. If a

mother fucker just showed me a video of a Dead Motherfucker I wouldn't wanta ride with him either."<sup>309</sup> Once Trent finally convinces Horton to go on this trip, they both repeatedly refer to Horton being afraid to go because he thought he would be killed.<sup>310</sup>

Despite the substantial amount of time Trent spent trying to convince Horton to go on this trip while Scott was listening in, both Trent and Scott deny that Horton *ever* said he didn't want to go. Under oath Scott is asked, "Do you recall him not wanting to go on the trip that you testified about to Chillicothe?" and Scott responds, "I don't recall him not wanting to go. He even rented the van to go take him."<sup>311</sup> Trent was asked a similar question, "Isn't it true that Mr. Horton expressed that he did not want to go with you on the trip [to Chillicothe]?" Trent's response was nearly identical, "No, because he rented the van to go down there."<sup>312</sup> Horton's counsel continued, "Prior to the renting of the van, isn't it true he expressed not wanting to go with you on that trip?" Trent responded, "No. As a matter of fact, he said, no, it ain't shit. It's cool. I will go down there with you. I will get the van."<sup>313</sup> Not only is this testimony clearly false, it is identically false. This trip to Chillicothe was used at Horton's trial as evidence that he was involved in Dotson's death.

In addition to perjuring themselves regarding this trip, both Trent and Scott deny that Horton *ever* acted like he was afraid of Trent. Trent made numerous threats to Horton's life, the most direct of which was the following statement by Trent:

...if something happens with Shawn [Nightingale], I'm going to come see you...  
And you already know I'm not playing...<sup>314</sup>

At Horton's pre-trial hearing, Trent was asked about these conversations and the following interchange took place:

Q: Did you ever threaten [Horton]?

Trent: No.

Q: Did you ever in any transcripts tell him you were going to kill him?

Trent: No.

Q: Did you ever tell him you were going to hurt him?

Trent: No.<sup>315</sup>

Scott was questioned similarly, "Did you hear [Trent] make any threats to Mr. Horton during these meetings?" and "During any of the conversations that took place, did you hear Mr. Trent threaten Mr. Horton in any way?" Scott responded unequivocally "No" to both of these questions.<sup>316</sup>

One particularly telling instance of perjury by Scott and Trent involves the statement referred to above Trent made seconds after he left from meeting Horton, "Dude he is so fucking scared its unbelievable. It's on tape."<sup>317</sup> Both Trent and Scott are questioned about this statement during Horton's pre-trial hearing. Trent's testimony is as follows:

Q: Do you remember saying on or about May 22, after the tape got turned off, after you had been talking to [Horton], "dude, he is so fuckin scared, it is unbelievable. It's on tape."

Trent: I think that was in reference to [Nightingale], but if he was scared of me, why would he give me a loaded gun? ... Actually we was talking about Shawn Nightingale.

Q: Sir, what you are telling the court is that even though you just got done talking to [Horton] literally a second before the tape gets shut off, that

you are talking about [Nightingale] when you say, "Dude, he is so fuckin scared it's unbelievable. It's on tape."

Trent: Yeah, this is when he was scared I was a cop, so Yeah, you are right, I did say that.

Q: So your testimony is that what you meant there a he is so fuckin scared you were a cop, it is unbelievable.

Trent: All of them was, yeah.

Q: That's what you meant right there?

Trent: I am pretty sure, yes.

Q: Can you point to anything now that you reviewed in this transcript that says anything about or that indicated that [Horton] thinks you are a cop in this transcript right here?

Trent: No.<sup>318</sup>

Scott was asked about this same statement. He testified:

Q: Are you testifying that you had no inclination whatsoever that Mr. Horton was afraid of Mr. Trent?

Scott: I don't recall him ever being afraid.

Q: When this says investigator Chris Floyd, doesn't this indicate you would have heard this tape at some point?

Scott: Yes.

...

Scott: That's what [Trent] said, but I think the question was did I hear [Horton] say it, and I never heard him actually say he was scared, is that correct?<sup>319</sup>

Clearly, Scott and Trent are attempting to cover up the fact that Horton was afraid of Trent so that Horton's statements would be admitted by the court. There are numerous other

statements by both Trent and Horton that describe Horton's fear.<sup>320</sup> There is also other testimony by Trent<sup>321</sup> and Scott<sup>322</sup> that demonstrate this conspired perjury.

Horton actually changed his phone number to avoid Trent, but Trent relentlessly pursued him by calling other people and lying to get his new number.<sup>323</sup> Both Scott<sup>324</sup> and Trent<sup>325</sup> testified under oath that Horton never changed his phone number. Trent knew where Horton lived, so the only way Horton could avoid Trent indefinitely was if Trent accepted that Horton did not want to speak with him. And that was never going to happen. The goal of this intimidation was to collect evidence against Conway; Scott and Trent did not care whether or not the evidence could be used against Horton because Scott was so thoroughly convinced that Conway was guilty. When it turned out Conway was not, and that Arthurs deal was going to be maintained, Scott had to guarantee, by any means he could, that Horton and Conway would be convicted. Imagine the fallout for him if they weren't. All the time and resources Scott used only to give a deal to a child molester and the person who actually kill Dotson, allowing both to escape any punishment whatsoever. Scott would have been the laughing stock of the Sheriff's Office and he could not have that if he was going to be Franklin County Sheriff, and possibly Mayor of Columbus. He had to have convictions against Conway and Horton.

After nearly two weeks of trying to avoid Trent and worrying that Trent might kill him or Nightingale, Horton finally got up the nerve to tell Trent to stop contacting him. Trent and Scott both testified that this was because Horton figured out that Trent was working with law enforcement, but Horton says he told Trent he and Conway never wanted Trent doing anything on their behalf in the first place. Thus, what was said during this conversation is important, and even Scott concedes that the conversation took place.<sup>326</sup> Like so much other evidence that

could have benefitted Conway and Horton, law enforcement has never produced the recording of this conversation despite repeated requests, and there is no known transcript of it.

***(h) The Dotson family gets involved in the lies***

The boldness with which people lied for prosecutors against Conway and Horton is astounding. Testimony was elicited from Dotson's girlfriend, Roberta Hannah, about an incident where she says Conway was very threatening to Dotson. According to Hannah, Dotson was following Conway too close in his car one time and Conway got out and came up to Dotson's window threatening him while Hannah was in Dotson's car.<sup>327</sup> This incident is completely fabricated. During Hannah's initial interview after Dotson's death, she said she never met Conway and didn't even know how tall he was or what he looked like because she had never seen him anywhere other than driving by in his car.<sup>328</sup> Nowhere in any other statement does Hannah say anything like this ever happened. Somehow prosecutors knew to ask her "Did you ever see James Conway treat Andrew in an inappropriate way or be upset with him?"<sup>329</sup> This fabricated incident had no place in Conway's trial even if it had occurred, but prosecutors elicited it and then referred to it in closing arguments.<sup>330</sup>

Dotson's mother, Lora Eberhard, also testified during trial that Horton was with Dotson the last time she saw him.<sup>331</sup> However, she initially said there were two individuals with Dotson, Nightingale, who never got out of the car, and someone she described as being short, stocky, and having blonde hair.<sup>332</sup> This description matches Arthurs, not Horton. Horton is six feet four inches tall with dark brown hair.<sup>333</sup> At trial Horton's attorneys were prevented from using Eberhard's statement because prosecutors did not provide it until just moments before she was

to be cross-examined. Still, Eberhard lied about making the statement, and prosecutors never corrected her testimony to the jury.

The last time Eberhard saw her son is significant because it was at this time that she gave Dotson a detective's business card and let him know he was wanted for questioning. She initially said the blonde guy became very threatening when he learned police were looking to question Dotson.<sup>334</sup> At Horton's trial she said Horton, who obviously wasn't even present, became threatening at this time.<sup>335</sup> Eberhard even falsely testified that she identified Horton in a lineup.<sup>336</sup> No such lineup was ever given to defense counsel, nor could it have been because she had never laid eyes on Horton in her life until she got to the court room, where she again identified him.<sup>337</sup> On some level, Dotson's family had to know something was wrong because someone was convincing them that they had to tell lies to ensure Conway and Horton were convicted. To have someone's mother unwittingly protect the person who killed her son, however, is a new low even for Scott.

***(j) Jesse James Shooting as Motive***

Before Detective Scott got any real information on Dotson's death, he had already decided why it happened and who he was going to get convicted. When Scott first began investigating Dotson's death in October of 2001, he learned that just prior to the last time Dotson's mother and girlfriend had spoken to him, Dotson had been involved in a shooting. On Friday, September 14, 2001, in West Columbus a man named Jesse James was shot, either in the thigh, groin, or butt, near the intersection of Evergreen and Palmetto.<sup>338</sup> Dotson's girlfriend told Scott that Dotson had confessed to her to shooting Jesse James and even told her that he had sold the gun he used to "Jason Besmen".<sup>339</sup> Dotson also told her that because of the

shooting he couldn't go home.<sup>340</sup> Dotson's mother, Lora Eberhard, didn't give Scott any information about the shooting, but told him that her and Dotson's brother Cecil went to Evergreen and Palmetto to pick up Dotson's car for him just after the shooting occurred.<sup>341</sup> Obviously, Dotson didn't want to go back to the scene.

Once Scott learned of this shooting, he picked up the police report and attempted to interview Jesse James, who would not speak with him.<sup>342</sup> The report listed Dotson not as a witness, but as the perpetrator, and didn't contain any information on anyone else who may have been involved.<sup>343</sup> Yet, when Scott was asked about his inquiries into this shooting, he said, "Yeah, it was background information that [Conway] had been involved in a felonious assault, that he was probably the individual that shot Jesse James."<sup>344</sup> So, at a time when every single piece of evidence that Scott was aware of pointed to Dotson as shooting James, Scott believed it was Conway.

At the time Jesse James was shot, Dotson and his girlfriend were separated and she had been seeing Jared Dilley, who was with James when he was shot. Hannah's relationship with Dilley is what caused the conflict in the first place according to her.<sup>345</sup> It is clear that Dotson shot James, whether in self-defense or simply in the heat of the moment. James never identified anyone other than Dotson as his shooter, and didn't even say Conway was present when he was shot.<sup>346</sup> Besides the fact that he admitted it to his girlfriend moments after he had done it, Dotson also told her he couldn't go home and actually fled Columbus to stay in Chillicothe, an hour drive south, for the next few days with Nightingale and Arthurs.<sup>347</sup> Trent directly asks Horton why Dotson was killed, and Horton says he doesn't know.<sup>348</sup> That didn't matter to prosecutors. They allowed Trent to testify that Horton told him Dotson was killed

because of the James shooting.<sup>349</sup> When Scott asked Nightingale during his interrogation why Dotson was killed, Nightingale said it was because Arthurs wanted to do it so he would be known as a killer,<sup>350</sup> and he wanted to know what it was like to kill someone. Nothing is mentioned about any shooting.

It apparently either never crossed Scott's mind, or he didn't want to hear, that Arthurs and Nightingale had their own reasons for wanting Dotson dead. Besides what Nightingale tells Scott about Arthurs just in general being a psychopath,<sup>351</sup> Nightingale says that he and Arthurs were involved in stealing and fencing ATVs with Dotson,<sup>352</sup> which was how Dotson earned a living at the time. Dotson lived in Columbus and mostly stole from there and neighboring Pickaway County where he had friends. These were more than just a few thefts, Dotson went out nearly every night looking for ATVs to steal, and it didn't matter what he had to break into. Nightingale and Arthurs helped him extend this activity to Chillicothe. Once Arthurs found out police were looking to question Dotson, he became angry, as Dotson's mother said, and was worried about Dotson telling on him and Nightingale for the multiple burglaries and thefts they were all involved in. Nightingale confirms this.<sup>353</sup> When seen in this context, Dotson's mother lying about Horton being present the last time she saw her son makes much more sense and is much more malicious.

***(k) Hampton Inn***

When Dotson fled to Chillicothe after shooting Jesse James, he stayed with Mike Arthurs and Shawn Nightingale at the Chillicothe Hampton Inn on Bridge Street. Chillicothe is just under an hour south of Columbus. Because of the deal Arthurs got in exchange for his testimony, he could not admit that he had wanted to kill Dotson to prevent Dotson from telling police about

the crimes they committed together. So, Arthurs told police that Conway wanted Dotson killed, and he agreed to do it. Arthurs didn't say he was offered money or any other benefit, or that Conway intimidated or coerced him in any way. It was just, Conway asked him to kill Dotson, and he just said he said, "Yeah".<sup>354</sup> That in and of itself should have been a red flag. There was another problem. Arthurs didn't even know about the Jesse James shooting. So, all he could tell police was that Nightingale had told him something happened, he didn't know what, and Conway wanted Dotson dead.<sup>355</sup> Arthurs learned about the Jesse James shooting later from police.

When Arthurs was first questioned in the presence of his attorneys, he didn't give any details about when and where he says Conway told him to kill Dotson. During his second meeting, however, he told Scott that while he was at a party at the Chillicothe Hampton Inn with Nightingale, Conway, and Horton, they all went into the bathroom at Conway's invitation, and that is when Conway asked him to kill Dotson.<sup>356</sup> Horton says this was a lie, and Nightingale said Arthurs is the one that wanted Dotson killed. Nightingale told detectives, "That's just what Mike [Arthurs] wanted to be my fucking, trying to be fucking part of us is what he said... He wanted me to fucking give him a spot to do it and that's what I was doing."<sup>357</sup> Then he gave some detail as to what was going on in Arthurs's mind when he decided to kill Dotson. "Mike [Arthurs] just wanted to fuck him, he would always say, 'fuck him [Dotson]', you know 'I don't really care cause I don't have anything to... I don't have any money,' he was arguing with his girlfriend and shit, he just didn't really, he didn't really care, he wanted to do it so bad, he wanted to use a fucking gun is what he wanted to do"<sup>358</sup>

The Hampton Inn is mentioned in Arthurs's first statement, but he never mentions being told by Conway in the bathroom to kill Dotson.<sup>359</sup> Nightingale admitted that it was his idea to take Dotson to West Virginia.<sup>360</sup> He says, however, the plan was initiated at a meeting at attorney Chris Cicero's office, where Cicero told him Dotson needed to "disappear".<sup>361</sup> Prior to that, Nightingale says Conway never said anything about killing Dotson or even wanting Dotson dead.<sup>362</sup> More importantly, Arthurs says he didn't know Nightingale planned on killing Dotson in West Virginia until they actually got to West Virginia.<sup>363</sup> Arthurs never even mentions Cicero.

Both Arthurs and Nightingale say the morning after staying at the Hampton Inn, they went to West Virginia early in the day, and Dotson died when they drove back to Columbus later that night. Because of serious credibility issues with Arthurs, prosecutors needed to corroborate his testimony. To this end they submitted a receipt in discovery which showed Arthurs rented a hotel room at the Hampton Inn in Chillicothe, Ohio on September 11, 2001 and checked out at 10 am on September 15, 2001. In Horton's trial, this receipt was submitted into evidence and Arthurs testified that he rented this hotel room.<sup>364</sup> According to this version of events, then, Dotson died on the night of September 15, 2001. Dotson's girlfriend, Roberta Hannah, testified in Horton's trial that the last time she spoke with Dotson was on Saturday September 15,<sup>365</sup> the day after James was shot.<sup>366</sup>

When Hannah testified in Conway's trial, however, she remembered speaking with Dotson on the 16<sup>th</sup>.<sup>367</sup> She had spoken with him on the 15<sup>th</sup> as well, and said Dotson was riding his motorcycle around in Chillicothe that evening.<sup>368</sup> During her direct examination, prosecutors tried three separate times to get her to revert back to the date of the 15<sup>th</sup> to no avail.<sup>369</sup>

Dotson could not have died on the night of the 15<sup>th</sup> because he didn't even pick his motorcycle up in Columbus from his mother's house until 6 pm evening.<sup>370</sup>

In his first statement, Arthurs says that the night of the Hampton Inn party, Dotson left on his motorcycle with Rick Hurt and didn't come back until the following day.<sup>371</sup> Nightingale also says that Dotson went back to Columbus the night before he was killed with Rick "Hart" and didn't come back until 10 or 11 the next morning.<sup>372</sup> Nightingale says he didn't even stay in the hotel room that night. He says he stayed with a girlfriend.<sup>373</sup> Since Dotson's mother testified he didn't pick up the motorcycle until the evening of the 15<sup>th</sup> and Arthurs's hotel receipt shows him checking out that morning, if Arthurs went with this version of events, the hotel receipt couldn't be used as corroboration. So, that version was abandoned and Arthurs said both Dotson and Nightingale were in the hotel room with him when he woke up on the 15<sup>th</sup>.<sup>374</sup>

Hannah's testimony should have been catastrophic for the prosecution in Conway's case because the time line Arthurs had maintained regarding Dotson's death completely collapsed. If Dotson was alive the 16<sup>th</sup>, and the supposed meeting in the bathroom took place in Arthurs hotel room, it could only have happened the night of the 14<sup>th</sup>. And the following day when Dotson was supposed to be getting killed in West Virginia, he was at his mom's house picking up his motorcycle with Arthurs. Lucky for the prosecution, the hotel receipt had yet to be introduced against Conway and Arthurs had not testified when Hannah remembered speaking with Dotson on the 16<sup>th</sup>. They needed Arthurs to change his testimony, but he was in a holding cell in the Franklin County jail where access to him was limited to law enforcement. This was a job perfectly suited for Scott. There was a problem, though. At the beginning of Conway's trial, the judge ordered that there be no contact between the witnesses to prevent just such witness

tampering. By court order, then, Scott and Arthurs both being witnesses in Conway's trial, could not have any contact. Scott would never let a minor obstacle such as a court order stand in the way of a conviction against Conway, though. So, Scott waited until the court was in recess and slipped through the door that leads from the courtroom to the jail. This door is only for bringing defendants and witnesses that are in the jail into the courtroom. Consequently, there is no one at the door checking identification or noting who is coming and going. Scott knew if he took this route to meet with Arthurs there would be no record of their meeting. And that is exactly what he did.

Except Scott was not quite as slick as he thought. By chance, Conway's attorney saw Scott walking through the door as she was leaving the courtroom for lunch. She didn't just take note of the fact, she enquired as to what he was doing and found out he was meeting with Arthurs. Then, when court was back in session, she notified the judge. Scott and Arthurs spoke for nearly an hour in the jail, but there is no record of what was actually said.<sup>375</sup> However, when Arthurs took the stand to testify right after this recess, prosecutors immediately raised the subject of this hotel receipt. Now Arthurs says he used a fake name to rent the hotel room.<sup>376</sup> A claim never before made by Arthurs in the Horton trial or in any of his statements to detectives. Later, while still on the stand, Arthurs is specifically asked by prosecutor about the receipt the state submitted in discovery. He says he doesn't think it's the right receipt because he remembers waking up in West Virginia on September 11 and driving back to Chillicothe that day.<sup>377</sup> That in no way prevents him from renting a hotel room in Chillicothe on September 11, 2001. Apparently, Arthurs's story now is that he drove to the Hampton Inn in Chillicothe on September 11, 2001 and rented a hotel room using a fake name. At the exact same time, an

unknown individual was at this same Hampton Inn and rented a hotel room using Arthurs' name. Of course, no one has ever produced a receipt with the fake name Arthurs supposedly used on this day, which would have been easy to prove if it were the truth. In fact, Linda Goodman, the General Manager of the Hampton Inn in Chillicothe, said identification is required.<sup>378</sup> She also said someone checked in under Arthurs name at 10:31 pm on September 11, 2001 using Arthurs address on Yellowbud in Chillicothe.<sup>379</sup>

Make no mistake, Arthurs changing his testimony during Conway's trial is a criminal offense, and most of the surrounding facts are not in dispute. As is clear from the discussion with the judge, Scott entered the jail through the court room during a recess, a route that would allow him to converse with Arthurs, but not require him to log in as an official visitor. At the time this occurred Hannah had recently completed her testimony,<sup>380</sup> and Arthurs was next to testify.<sup>381</sup> There is no direct evidence of what Scott and Arthurs talked about for at least an hour. Trial counsel failed to request a hearing on the issue. So, Scott has never even been asked. Arthurs denies they were talking about his testimony, but gives no explanation as to what they were talking about.<sup>382</sup> It is revealing, however, that the prosecutor attempted to give two different explanations as to why Scott would be meeting with Arthurs during trial. When Conway's attorney first brings up the issue, prosecutors tell the court that the "chief" of the jail put Scott in charge of keeping witnesses separate.<sup>383</sup> Prosecutors, of course, never produced any evidence that anyone gave any such instructions to Scott. That's because no such instructions were ever given nor could they have because they would have been in direct contradiction to the court's separation order. It was a complete fabrication to try and cover up the criminal offense that had just occurred. And even if the "chief" had given such an order, as

impossible as that seems, this still doesn't explain why Scott didn't enter the jail using the proper procedure and log his visit with Arthurs, and what they talked about for an hour.

Prosecutors attempt a second explanation through Arthurs' testimony. They explain that Arthurs was working with Scott on "other matters."<sup>384</sup> There is no indication as to what these matters were, and also no indication as to why they didn't use that excuse when originally confronted about the violation. Furthermore, this doesn't explain why this meeting was so urgent that it couldn't wait until after Arthurs testified and why it required Scott to violate the separation of witnesses order the court put in place. Simply put, there is a mountain of circumstantial evidence that Scott coached Arthurs into changing his testimony regarding the hotel receipt because it no longer fit the prosecutor's time line. There would be no other reason for that meeting to occur at that time and under those circumstances. And the prosecutors' phony explanations show they were aware of the criminal nature of Scott's actions. Death sentences have been obtained with less evidence.

Coaching Arthurs into changing his testimony foreclosed the best opportunity Conway had to prove he didn't instruct Arthurs to kill Dotson. It is nearly impossible to absolutely prove such a statement was not made unless you can prove the meeting where it was supposed to happen never occurred.

### ***(I) Arthurs goes "berserk" on Dotson***

It is clear then, that Mike Arthurs wanted to kill Andrew Dotson. Nightingale had family in Kermit, West Virginia about an hour south of Ohio near the Kentucky border, and this is where he and Arthurs decided to take Dotson.<sup>385</sup> Arthurs claims, however, that he and Nightingale got down there and decided they couldn't do it. So, they brought Dotson back to

Columbus where Arthurs claims Conway killed Dotson.<sup>386</sup> Trent says it was Conway's idea to take Dotson to West Virginia, revealing another of his lies.<sup>387</sup> However, Trent did ask Nightingale why Dotson wasn't left in West Virginia to which Nightingale responded, "Didn't happen, didn't happen at all like that, I wish it would've"<sup>388</sup> Then Trent directly asked Nightingale if Arthurs had changed his mind about killing Dotson and Nightingale responded, "I don't think so".<sup>389</sup> Nightingale said he and Arthurs drove around in West Virginia for three or four hours and couldn't find a really good spot.<sup>390</sup> That's the only reason they came back to Columbus, not that Arthurs changed his mind. Although, Nightingale actually did say that they decided they weren't going to do it until they got a couple beers in them.<sup>391</sup>

Later, to get a deal to avoid the death penalty, Nightingale describes the trip to West Virginia with Dotson and he says they pulled over a couple times on the way down because they were crying and they knew they couldn't do it.<sup>392</sup> Arthurs testified that he didn't even know they planned on doing anything to Dotson until they actually got to West Virginia.<sup>393</sup> Someone isn't telling the truth. What makes even less sense is that Nightingale says they didn't plan on using a gun and he didn't know Arthurs had a gun until they got down in West Virginia.<sup>394</sup> Arthurs says Nightingale is the one that brought the gun and he's the one that didn't know about it until they got to West Virginia.<sup>395</sup> During his initial interrogation Nightingale, was adamant that Conway never told him or Arthurs to kill Dotson at any time. He said, "[Arthurs and I] never talked to [Conway]... we just never fucking talked... [Conway] never fucking said nothing to me at that time."<sup>396</sup> It was at this time that Scott told Nightingale that Conway is the one that killed Dotson and that if Nightingale didn't get on board with that story, he would be

blamed for Dotson's death.<sup>397</sup> While under this extreme pressure from Scott, Nightingale still maintained, "I know Mike [Arthurs] did it. It was Mike nobody helped Mike."<sup>398</sup>

Arthurs says he followed Conway to Galloway Road where Dotson's body was eventually found,<sup>399</sup> and prosecutor's argued that, "...Conway picked an isolated cornfield as the place in which he wanted [Dotson] killed."<sup>400</sup> Prosecutors knew full well that Nightingale had said several times that he chose to take Dotson to that area because it was near where Nightingale's brother lived.<sup>401</sup> Nightingale told Scott, "[Arthurs] wanted me to fucking give him a spot to do it and that's what I was doing."<sup>402</sup> Arthurs claims he was unaware that Nightingale's brother lived a couple blocks away from where Dotson's body was found on Galloway Road.<sup>403</sup> Everything Arthurs said is self-serving and designed to make him look like a victim, which he certainly was not.

Nightingale completely contradicts Arthurs claim that Conway instructed him to do anything to Dotson or that Conway was intimidating anyone. Arthurs never claimed to be coerced by Conway or that Conway threatened him in any way, he just said he was "afraid".<sup>404</sup> According to Nightingale, any time there was a problem, Arthurs would take care of it, whatever needed to be done.<sup>405</sup> Arthurs was sort of bodyguard/enforcer for Nightingale, and actually won the Tough Man Contest in Chillicothe.<sup>406</sup> Shortly after being released from prison for his involvement in Dotson's death, Arthurs was convicted of assaulting a police officer.<sup>407</sup> He can get into a ring and fight someone and he is not intimidated by an armed police officer, but a mere look from Conway had him so afraid he was willing to kill Dotson? On top of that, whether it was Arthurs or Nightingale who brought the gun to West Virginia, by the time they got to Columbus Arthurs was in possession of it. He was clearly not intimidated by anyone.

As far as Arthurs "pretending" to choke Dotson, Nightingale says this is an absolute lie. Arthurs admitted he came up with the idea on his own,<sup>408</sup> so why he would pretend to do it is unclear. Nightingale says Arthurs had his foot on Dotson's neck and his other hand on Nightingale's Jeep. Arthurs was pushing down so hard that the Jeep was raising off the ground, and kept that pressure on for a very long time, until Dotson's neck was "flat" and the "imprint of a shoe" was on his neck.<sup>409</sup> Maybe 5 or 10 minutes.<sup>410</sup> If Arthurs had been just pretending, he would not have lied about it in his first meeting and waited for his attorneys to review the autopsy report before telling detectives about standing on Dotson's neck.<sup>411</sup> Det. Scott actually confronted Arthurs about lying in that first interview<sup>412</sup> and asked him why he stepped on Dotson's neck. Arthurs responded, "I got tired, I couldn't, I was just wore out, my mind was, it's just, I don't know."<sup>413</sup> "...and then you know I was tired, stepped on his throat then we drug him back in the field..."<sup>414</sup> He didn't say anything about being intimidated by Conway.

After all this, Nightingale says Arthurs tried to snap Dotson's neck, and you could hear the "bones breaking".<sup>415</sup> Nightingale maintained at all times, even in the deal he cut with prosecutors, that Arthurs killed Dotson.<sup>416</sup> In a follow up interview, Nightingale says he later asked Arthurs how he was able to kill Dotson in such a horrific manner, and Arthurs responded that he just "flipped out you know kind of blacked out."<sup>417</sup> According to Nightingale, Arthurs went berserk and turned into the "incredible Halt (Hulk)" and killed Dotson "without nobody saying anything to him..."<sup>418</sup> Nightingale says he tried to help Arthurs drag Dotson's body back into the cornfield after this episode and Arthurs said "get the fuck out of the way."<sup>419</sup>

*(i) The autopsy<sup>420</sup> and the expert opinion*

When Mike Arthurs and Shawn Nightingale arrived at the cornfield on Galloway Road in Columbus, Ohio, they both say that Andrew Dotson was passed out in the back seat of Nightingale's Jeep Cherokee. Dotson asked for some pills in West Virginia, and Nightingale says they got them while they were at his aunt's house in Kermit and Dotson began taking them "while they were still in the driveway".<sup>421</sup> They hung around there for about an hour and before they left Nightingale said he could see the pills had kicked in and Dotson was getting "woozy".<sup>422</sup> After leaving his aunt's house, Nightingale says they stopped off at "Rick's" house to pick up some money and headed back to Columbus.<sup>423</sup> Arthurs says they only stopped once on the way back, at Wendy's in Ashland Kentucky,<sup>424</sup> and Dotson got a hamburger which he ate at that point still at least three hours away from Columbus. Somewhere around Ashland Kentucky is where Arthurs says Dotson passed out.<sup>425</sup>

Once in Columbus at the cornfield on Galloway Road, Arthurs said he pulled Dotson out of Nightingale's Jeep by grabbing him under the arms.<sup>426</sup> (Originally, Arthurs said he pulled Dotson out by the neck.)<sup>427</sup> In any case, Arthurs says Dotson didn't move and that his body was "limp" and flaccid when he pulled him out of the Jeep.<sup>428</sup> Arthurs also describes Dotson's body as just "flopping" around.<sup>429</sup> Furthermore, according to Arthurs and Nightingale, Dotson never put up any resistance whatsoever to Arthurs putting him in the headlock or standing on his neck. This all might make sense if, as Trent said, Dotson had taken large amounts of pills and been drinking a lot of alcohol. After all, Arthurs has a history of drugging and raping women at parties. The problem is Dotson didn't have those amounts of drugs in his system. In fact, according to the state's medical examiner who performed Dotson's autopsy, Dr. Patrick Fardal,

Dotson only had “therapeutic” levels of Valium in his system, and there were no other agents found.<sup>430</sup> When the liver processes diazepam (Valium) it turns it into its metabolite called “nordiazepam”.<sup>431</sup> Since none was found in Dotson’s system by Dr. Fardal, he determined that Dotson had ingested a small amount of Valium within 45 minutes of his death.<sup>432</sup> The trip from where Nightingale says they were in Kermit, West Virginia to Columbus, Ohio takes about four hours.<sup>433</sup> If someone ingested Valium within four hours of death, Dr. Fardal testified, you would expect to find nordiazepam in their system.<sup>434</sup>

After Conway and Horton were convicted, and due to the questions that arose in regard to Dotson’s death, Conway’s appellate counsel hired an expert to review Dr. Fardal’s findings and testimony. When Scott went to Dr. Fardal to confirm the pick ax Arthurs gave him could have caused the wounds to Dotson’s torso, Scott deliberately withheld all the other information revealed during his investigation.<sup>435</sup> The most critical piece of evidence Det. Scott withheld was the amount of time that passed between Dotson’s death and the performance of the autopsy. Dr. Fardal was operating under the presumption that Dotson had died within in a week of the autopsy. In fact, it had been over a month.<sup>436</sup> This led Dr. Fardal to erroneously conclude that the amount of material removed from Dotson’s chest meant that he had been alive when the wound to his heart was inflicted. The expert hired by Conway’s attorneys, Dr. Werner Spitz, is a specialist in the field with decades of experience. He looked over the autopsy report and concluded that both stab wounds to Dotson’s torso happened after Dotson had died.<sup>437</sup>

Dr. Fardal himself had already concluded that the stab wound to the liver was likely post mortem,<sup>438</sup> but had concluded the one to the heart was the cause of death.<sup>439</sup> There was no blood in the abdominal cavity around the wound to the liver, which would have bled profusely

if Dotson had still been alive. There was some “bloody material” in the chest cavity, which Dr. Fardal himself said did not mean Dotson was alive when this stab wound was inflicted.<sup>440</sup> In addition, there wasn’t one single drop of blood on the outside of either wound, both of which would have bled profusely.<sup>441</sup> Dr. Fardal testified that neither wound would have been immediately fatal. If alive when these wounds were inflicted, Dotson would have lived for several minutes and even been able to call for help and struggle with someone attempting to choke him.<sup>442</sup> There was no evidence of any struggle, no bruising, wounds, or anything at the scene.<sup>443</sup> A struggle is also completely inconsistent with the statements of Arthurs and Nightingale. Arthurs says there was nothing more than a few seconds between these wounds,<sup>444</sup> And the wound to the liver came first. Arthurs testified that Dotson was stabbed in the stomach first, then in the chest,<sup>445</sup> which he maintains despite the prosecutors best efforts to get him to change his story.<sup>446</sup>

In 2013, long after trial, Dr. Fardal was asked to review Dr. Spitz assessment of the original autopsy, and confirmed his reasoning. He agrees that the amount of material in the chest cavity is inconclusive<sup>447</sup> and that the wound to the liver was postmortem.<sup>448</sup> Dr. Fardal ultimately said, “I cannot say, and did not ever intend to say, that the wound to the heart was certainly the cause of death.”<sup>449</sup> He also said there was some evidence that would support Dotson being strangled to death.<sup>450</sup>

Even with all these inconsistencies between the medical evidence and what Arthurs says happened to Dotson, both Conway and Horton were still convicted. The level of decomposition on Dotson’s neck did not allow Dr. Fardal to be able to determine if there had been any damage.<sup>451</sup> Furthermore, Det. Scott concealed any evidence of any other possible cause of

death from Dr. Fardal,<sup>452</sup> so he had no reason to reexamine his original findings. Scott did not want Conway or Horton to have any scientific support for what Arthurs had done to Dotson, so he focused on coercing Nightingale into saying Conway stabbed Dotson and getting Trent to fabricate similar evidence. It turns out, in fact, that it is unclear how Dotson died, but it wasn't from being stabbed.

It is just not medically possible that Dotson was still alive when he got back to Columbus. Every bit of the scientific evidence points to Dotson dying within 45 minutes of leaving Kermit, West Virginia, around the time they would have arrived in Ashland, Kentucky. The toxicology report submitted with the autopsy listed a small amount of alcohol in Dotson's system in addition to the Valium. Dr. Fardal testified that the combination of alcohol and Valium would not have caused Dotson to be unconscious or even have slurred speech.<sup>453</sup> What is more, Dr. Fardal described the initial state of postmortem decomposition. When a person is alive and unconscious, their heart is still beating and they still have muscle tone.<sup>454</sup> When someone dies their body loses all muscle tone and becomes limp and flaccid. They flop around with no resistance whatsoever, exactly as Arthurs describes Dotson's when he pulled him from the Jeep and began manipulating his body. There is just no way someone could go through what Arthurs did to Dotson and not show a single sign of life if he were still alive, not a moan or a flinch or any kind of involuntary muscle response whatsoever. Dr. Fardal also says the position in which Dotson's body was eventually found was consistent with being "dragged after he died."<sup>455</sup>

There is another independent strand of evidence that supports the fact that Dotson never made it back to Columbus alive. Arthurs says Dotson ate Wendy's in Ashland, Kentucky

and passed out shortly thereafter. Dr. Fardal did find food in Dotson's stomach. He testified, however, that it was only a small "300cc" meal and had been ingested less than two hours prior to Dotson's death.<sup>456</sup> It is at least three hours from Ashland, Kentucky to Columbus, Ohio.

No one other than Mike Arthurs and Shawn Nightingale will ever truly know what exactly happened to Andrew Dotson. Two things are certain, however. One is that James Conway did not kill Andrew Dotson. The other is that Andrew Dotson was dead well before Nightingale and Arthurs took him to the cornfield on Galloway Road. There is a real possibility that Dotson had some kind of reaction to something he ingested and actually died when Arthurs thought he passed out. Nightingale says Dotson ingested some "red heart pills"<sup>457</sup> while they were in the driveway at his aunt's house in Kermit, West Virginia. This possibility is the only thing that can reconcile what Nightingale and Arthurs say with the objective scientific evidence introduced by both medical professionals, Dr. Fardal and Dr. Spitz.

The problem now is that prosecutors do not want to admit they made a huge mistake by essentially giving Arthurs and Trent immunity. Nightingale was also released from prison last year. The only people left in prison are Conway and Horton, and the only incriminating evidence ever presented against either of them was the word of Trent and Arthurs. Not a single shred of other evidence supports what they say. To leave two innocent people in prison for the rest of their lives, and possibly give one the death penalty, because prosecutors don't want to admit their mistake is a complete miscarriage of justice.

## I. CONCLUSION

It is clear that Trent, as he admitted, would say "anything to try and get out of" his charges.<sup>458</sup> It is impossible, then, to underestimate the effect of the things Det. Scott did on

shoring up Trent's credibility. Besides giving Trent information from Andrew Dotson's autopsy and telling Trent that Dotson's mother visited Conway in the jail, Scott also had to be involved in Trent making up the lies about Conway wanting to have prosecutors killed. It is hard to believe Trent came up with this on his own, but even if he had, he could not have doctored the transcripts without Scott's help. Scott was also listening to this conversation, and knew the statement Trent wrote about it wasn't true.

Det. Scott's fingerprints are also all over Trent lying about Conway and Horton wanting Arthurs killed over Dotson. This was never discussed with Conway, but Scott needed Horton to go along. This was complicated by the fact that everyone, including Trent, understood that Arthurs alone killed Dotson and Conway and Horton didn't have anything to do with it. Scott's solution was to have Trent tell Horton that since Arthurs was the actual killer and knew all the details surrounding Dotson's death, Arthurs could lie and say Conway and Horton were involved.<sup>459</sup> Horton responded, "that's scary... that makes me scared..." When a detective has this level of commitment to getting someone convicted of a crime, it is impossible for them to prevent it.

The bottom line in both the Dockside Dolls shooting and the death of Andrew Dotson is that all the lies Trent told did nothing other than obscure the truth and make it more difficult for anyone to ever know what actually happened in both of these cases. Many believe that jailhouse informants should never be used under any circumstances because nothing they say is worthy of belief. However, once a jailhouse informant has repeatedly lied in every possible circumstances in numerous unrelated cases, it is a fundamental miscarriage of justice to use their testimony as the basis for a conviction of any kind, much less in death penalty cases.

Every case Trent and Scott were involved in needs to be investigated thoroughly. It is hard to believe this will ever happen because prosecutors refuse to release anything regarding either of these individuals to the public, and because Scott is still actively interjecting himself into investigations. The judicial system needs to put safeguards in place to prevent this type of misconduct in the future.

Both James Conway and Calvin Horton have been in prison for nearly a quarter of a century due almost entirely to the uncorroborated testimony of Ronnie Trent. To make matters worse, prosecutors have a Constitutional obligation to correct false testimony. Yet, at no time did they attempt to correct the lies Trent and Scott were telling to the judge or the jury in either Conway or Horton's trials. The appellate process takes decades, far too long for anyone to sit in prison when there is such an obvious miscarriage of justice. Furthermore, the appellate process doesn't work when prosecutors refuse to provide evidence years after conviction. What is worse for Horton, he hired a licensed attorney for his appeals, but that attorney filed the appeal one day past the deadline. This procedurally defaulted his appeals, bringing them to an end forever. Both Conway and Horton need assistance to bring this injustice to an end.

---

<sup>1</sup> The ABC documentary originally aired August 1, 2012 and is entitled "Final Witness: A mother's revenge" It can be found on YouTube under the URL: [https://m.youtube.com/watch?v=9zqphzGeluM&list=PLt\\_a9ZHUXYqQWilp-Pdhcns-FQWlfuusi&index=1&pp=iAQB](https://m.youtube.com/watch?v=9zqphzGeluM&list=PLt_a9ZHUXYqQWilp-Pdhcns-FQWlfuusi&index=1&pp=iAQB). There is also an id channel documentary as well as others.

<sup>2</sup> *State v. Trent*, Franklin County, Ohio Common Pleas case no 90 CR 004879, 2 AGG ROB, 2 THEFT; *State v. Trent*, Franklin County, Ohio Common Pleas case no 90 CR 005479, 2 AGG ROB 2 THEFT; *State v. Trent*, Franklin County, Ohio Common Pleas case no 90 CR 004326, 2 AGG BURGLARY; *State v. Trent*, Franklin County, Ohio Common Pleas case no 90 CR 004172-3 AGG BURGLARY.

<sup>3</sup> 1153 TT p. 1893.

<sup>4</sup> 1153 TT p. 1891.

<sup>5</sup> Put Van Sickle reports here.

<sup>6</sup> 3117 TT p. 773.

<sup>7</sup> Trent's affidavit.

<sup>8</sup> *State v. Mayle*, Franklin County, Ohio case number 90 CR 1922; Appeal filed October 23, 2001 in the Court of Appeals for Franklin County Ohio, Tenth Appellate District, Case no. 01APA-08-978.

<sup>9</sup> 1153 TT p. 104; and Braun's affidavit.

<sup>10</sup> *State v. Trent*, Franklin County, Ohio Common Pleas case no 99-CR-2548.

<sup>11</sup> *State v. Trent*, Franklin County, Ohio Common Pleas case no 01-CR-5244.

<sup>12</sup> Exhibit 39, Trent's 3117 PTT p.104; 1153 TT p.1905; 3117 TT p.748 and 762; and Exhibit 37 3118 TT Vol. I, p.196.

13 *State v. Trent*, Franklin County, Ohio Common Pleas case no 03 CR 003741.

14 3117 TT p.756.

15 *State v. Trent*, Franklin County, Ohio Common Pleas case no 04 CR 005159.

16 *State v. Trent*, Franklin County, Ohio Common Pleas case no 16 CR 005856; *State v. Trent*, Franklin County, Ohio Common Pleas case no 17 CR 000477; *State v. Trent*, Franklin County, Ohio Common Pleas case no 17 CR 001908

17 Put slate here

092601 MOVED FROM 5EL1 to 4WL1 B/W RATIO...DHA 396.  
12152001 CHARGED WITH JAIL VIOL 7.11 AND MOVED FROM 4WL1 TO 7WR2 K/S:  
ROMINE, PAUL #01-37463... TANNER, JASON #01-21031 ERBY, ABDUL #01-  
25361...WALTON, RONALD #01-36561... STEVENS, KEITH #01-40461... AUTH S.  
MASSIE.....AJ803  
12182001 DISCIPLINARY HEARING HELD, SUBJ PLEAD NOT GUILTY FOUND NOT GUILTY. NO  
SANCTIONS.....GUNNC52  
010220002 MOVED FROM 7WR2 TO 8ER2 FOR SPACE....GUNNC52  
010802 MOVED FROM 8ER2 TO 8NR1 SPACE....DMA 396  
01242002 I/M CHARGED WITH JAIL VIOLATIONS 7.11. I/M IS NOW A K/S FROM DONNELL,  
NATHANIEL 1-38617. I/M MOVED FROM 8NR TO 5N1.....ORIG-DEP SHOTSKY.  
AUTH-C-37. TAT809.  
01242002 I/M TO BE MADE K/S FROM I/M ELKINS, DONALD #1-22951 AND MOVED FROM  
CELL 5N1 TO 5N3 TO AVOID PROBLEMS IN TANK. ORIG-DEP MATTOX. AUTH-C-  
37. TAT809.  
01302002 DISP BOARD HEARING HESL 01/30/02... INMATE PLED NOT GUILTY. FOUND  
GUILTY. SANTIIONS IMPOSED 7 DAYS DISP LOCKDOWN WITH LOSS OF ALL  
PRIVLEGES. TIME TO BEHIN WHEN SPACEA VAILABLE.  
02142002 MOVED FROM 5N3 TO 3WC9 TO SERVE 7 DAYS DISP TIME...START @ 02142002  
1000a END @ 02212002 1000a AUTH BY SGT.MASSIE#S56....TE779.  
02142002 MOVED FROM 3WC9 TO 8NR1, DIE TO SUBJ DISCIPLINARY APPEAL GRANTED BY  
ORDER OF SHERIFF KARNES... GUNNC52.  
03122002 #01CR5244 PER DISPO, CONT TRIAL TO 03222002 900, BAILIFF PETERMANN....TA  
594.  
03222002 PER CP DISPO, #01CR5244 CONT TRIAL, PER BAILIFF PETERMANN....JP 615.  
04222002 PER DISPO, #01CR5244 CONT TRIAL 05052002 BAILIFF PETERMANN....JP 615.  
04262002 0958... ADVISE DET. SCOTT (FCSO) AT 205-4112 WHEN THIS INMATE IS GIVEN  
WORK RELEASE OR ISALLOWED OUTSIDE THE FACILITY... D MASON 656.

18 *State v. Hall*, Columbus case no 2002 CRA 011885; Hall affidavit

- 
- <sup>19</sup> Exhibit 55, Scott's 3117 PTT p.73.
- <sup>20</sup> See *Hambel v. Franklin County Prosecutors Office, et. al.*, Ohio Supreme Court docket 2024-1689.
- <sup>21</sup> "Incoming Franklin County Sheriff was Karnes 'protégé'" Columbus Dispatch, June 16, 2011.
- <sup>22</sup> *State v. McCoy*, case Columbus case no 2004 CRA 006001.
- <sup>23</sup> *State v. Jackson*, Franklin County, Ohio Common Pleas case no 97-CR-04-1902.
- <sup>24</sup> Initial case was *State v. Jackson*, Franklin County, Ohio Common Pleas case no 97-CR-04-1902; Evidentiary hearing held in federal court in 2023 or 2024, *Jackson v. Shoop*, United States District Court for the Southern District of Ohio, Western Division *habeas corpus* Case No. 2:18-cv-215. Documents available through the federal court Pacer system.
- <sup>25</sup> "Incoming Franklin County Sheriff was Karnes 'protégé'" Columbus Dispatch article from June 16, 2011.
- <sup>26</sup> "Incoming Franklin County Sheriff was Karnes 'protégé'" Columbus Dispatch, June 16, 2011.
- <sup>27</sup> See *State v. Nightingale*, Franklin County, Ohio Common Pleas case no 02 CR 3119.
- <sup>28</sup> Exhibit 58, Nightingale's August 12, 2002 proffer.
- <sup>29</sup> "Zach Scott Appointed New Franklin County Sheriff" 10TV news broadcast, June 15, 2011.
- <sup>30</sup> "Sheriff Zach Scott says he's running for mayor" Columbus Dispatch, November, 26, 2014.
- <sup>31</sup> "Ginther defeats Scott in Columbus mayoral race" 10TV broadcast, November 3, 2015.
- <sup>32</sup> *State ex rel. Nat'l Broad. Co. v. City of Cleveland*, 38 Ohio St. 3d 79, 83 (1988).
- <sup>33</sup> *Hambel v. Franklin County Prosecutors Office, et. al.*, Ohio Supreme Court docket 2024-1689.

---

34 **1153 TT** at 1816-1817.

35 **Exhibit 46**, Trent's April 4, 2002 letter. Attachment to Detective Zach Scott's federal deposition, federal case no 3:07-cv-00345-TBS-MRM Doc#: 131-1 Filed 06/09/11 at 2 PAGEID #:3343.

36 **Exhibit 39**, Trent's 3117 PTT pp.88-89, 91, and 95.

37 **1153 TT** pp.1822, 1824, 1828, 1903, and 1904.

38 **1153 TT** pp.1815 and 1824; **Exhibit 39**, Trent's 3117 PTT pp.95 and 101-102; **3117 TT** pp.723 and 748; and **3118 TT Vol. III**, p.48.

39 **Accessible** through federal court's Pacer system. Ronnie Trent's federal deposition, federal case no 3:07-cv-00345-TBS-MRM Doc#: 61 Filed 04/13/10 at 42 PAGEID #:1297.

40 **Exhibit 48**, Trent's April 10, 2002 letter. Attachment to Detective Zach Scott's federal deposition, federal case no 3:07-cv-00345-TBS-MRM Doc#: 131-1 Filed 06/09/11 at 4-5 PAGEID #:3345-3346.

41 **Exhibit 56**, Deviller's 3117 PTT p. 116.

42 **Exhibit 35**, Trent's April 25, 2002 interview.

43 **Exhibit 35**, Trent's April 25, 2002 interview, p 1.

44 **Exhibit 39**, Trent's 3117 PTT p.103; and **3117 TT** p.728.

45 **3117 TT** pp.102 and 106-107.

46 Trent said the April 4, 2002 letter was his first contact, **Exhibit 39**, Trent's 3117 PTT pp. 95 and 96; Scott said this was the first contact, **Exhibit 55**, Scott's 3117 PTT p. 66; Devillers said the April 4, 2002 letter was the first contact with Trent, **Exhibit 56**, Deviller's 3117 PTT pp. 115 and 122.

---

**47 Exhibits 43 and 44**, Cone messages. Attachment to Detective Zach Scott's federal deposition, federal case no 3:07-cv-00345-TBS-MRM Doc#: 131-1 Filed 06/09/11 at 6-7 PAGEID #:3347-3348.

**48 Exhibit 45**, note from Gravett to Cone re: Devillers wanting them to speak with Trent. Attachment to Detective Zach Scott's federal deposition, federal case no 3:07-cv-00345-TBS-MRM Doc#: 131-1 Filed 06/09/11 at 8 PAGEID #:3349. Also accessible through federal court Pacer system.

**49 Exhibit 42**, letter to O'Brien from Trent. Attachment to Detective Zach Scott's federal deposition, federal case no 3:07-cv-00345-TBS-MRM Doc#: 131-1 Filed 06/09/11 at 1 PAGEID #:3342. Also accessible through federal court Pacer system.

**50 Exhibit 47**. Envelope cover addressed to Pritchard. Attachment to Detective Zach Scott's federal deposition, federal case no 3:07-cv-00345-TBS-MRM Doc#: 131-1 Filed 06/09/11 at 3 PAGEID #:3344. Also accessible through federal court Pacer system.

**51 Accessible** through federal court's Pacer system. Sarah Beauchamp's federal deposition, federal case no 3:07-cv-00345-TBS-MRM Doc#: 56 Filed 04/13/10 at 6, 9, and 39 PAGEID #:776, 779, 809.

**52 Accessible** through federal court's Pacer system. Sarah Beauchamp's federal deposition, federal case no 3:07-cv-00345-TBS-MRM Doc#: 56 Filed 04/13/10 at 32 and 35 PAGEID #:802 and 805.

**53 Exhibit 62**, Chillicothe police report pp. 11 and 12.

**54 Exhibit 55**, Scott's 3117 PTT p. 76.

**55 Exhibit 39**, Trent's 3117 PTT p. 93.

**56 Exhibit 35**, Trent's April 25, 2002 interview p.9.

**57 Exhibit 64**, Attachment to Ron O'Brien's federal deposition, federal case no 3:07-cv-00345-TBS-MRM Doc#: 59 Filed 04/13/10 at 73 PAGEID #:1198. Also accessible through federal court Pacer system.

---

<sup>58</sup> **Exhibit 64**, Attachment to Ron O'Brien's federal deposition, federal case no 3:07-cv-00345-TBS-MRM Doc#: 59 Filed 04/13/10 at 73 PAGEID #:1198. Also accessible through federal court Pacer system.

<sup>59</sup> **3117 TT** pp.783 and 811.

<sup>60</sup> Trent talks about his brother's girlfriend stealing his stuff from his safe. That's why he wanted Conway to have Horton bring the money down.

**Exhibit 20, p. 8 (000373). 5/21/02; CD# 000003; Tape# 02149; Transcript pages 000364-000392; at 14:40.**

CI [Trent] I had a fat ass white girl with man my brothers fucking bitch sold it while I was in jail, my bother's bitch sold all my shit I

..

CI will I mean we had it in the safe, they just left the safe open cause I mean it's his dick know what I'm saying

...

CI he left and come back and she was gone \_\_\_\_\_

---

[Trent is telling his brother's girlfriend stole his white gold necklace out of his safe.]

---

<sup>61</sup> **Exhibit 53**, Scott's 3118 TT **Vol. III**, pp.73-74.

<sup>62</sup> **Conway 3117 PTT** pp.136-138; **Jeff 1153 TT** pp.2167-2172.

<sup>63</sup> **Exhibit 39**, Trent's 3117 PTT p.87.

<sup>64</sup> **Exhibit 64**, Attachment to Ron O'Brien's federal deposition, federal case no 3:07-cv-00345-TBS-MRM Doc#: 59 Filed 04/13/10 at 73 PAGEID #:1198. Also accessible through federal court Pacer system.

<sup>65</sup> **3118 TT** **Vol. III**, p.319.

<sup>66</sup> **3117 TT** p.806; **3118 TT** **Vol. III**, pp.124-125.

---

**67** Exhibit 35, Trent's April 25, 2002 interview p.9.

**68** Exhibit 20, p. 20 (000385). 5/21/02; CD# 000003; Tape# 02149; Transcript pages 000364-000392; at 37:50.

HORTON *I put mad loot* somebody's books man put two grand on somebody's books

CI [Trent] Yeah a lot of them Dudes that's what me and Jimmy [Conway] use to do every week like I'd have somebody put money on somebody's books and he'd have somebody put money on peoples books that's just how we went well \_\_\_\_\_

[Horton is telling Trent that he put two thousand dollars on someone's books, and Trent doesn't say anything about this money being for killing anyone or for any other purpose. Horton doesn't even know he put the money on Trent's books.]

---

**69** Exhibit 36, Trent's May 26, 2002 interview p.4.

**70** Exhibit 23, p. 13 (000442). 5/22/02; CD# 00010\*, 000028\*\*; Tape# 02152, 02153; Transcript pages 000429-000451; Recording length 45:40, 30:23 37:12; at 36:40\*, 25:15\*\*.

C.I. [Trent] \_\_\_\_\_ I handled that and I still ain't got paid for that, know what I'm saying

[Trent is telling Nightingale that he already made the video of someone confessing to the Dockside Dolls shooting, but still hasn't been paid for doing it.]

---

**71** Exhibit 37, Trent's 3118 TT Vol. I, p.177.

**72** Exhibit 25, p. 16 (0004839. 5/23/02; CD# 000007\*, 000032\*\*; Tape# 02157; Transcript pages 000473-000494, 000637-000641; at 30:22\*\*.

CI [Trent] I had it all them fucking \_\_\_\_\_ nothing when I got out nothing

Male 1 [Horton] Hugh

CI When I got out I had nothing y Cadillac is fucked up man it looks like a fucking getto Cadillac

[Trent explains to Horton that when he got out of jail he was broke and didn't have any money.]

---

---

**73** Exhibit 35, Trent's April 25, 2002 interview p.5; 1153 TT p.1822.

**74** Exhibit 26, p. 5 (000470). 5/23/02, 9:30pm; CD# 050-369, 000030; Tape# 02155, 02159; Transcript pages 000466-000472; Recording length 05:30, 05:54; 45:00, 47:09; at 30:40.

C.I. [Trent] As much as you can get, in the end it's going to cost about 20

J. Horton 20,000

[Trent is telling Horton that between the two of them everything he is doing is going to cost \$20,000.]

---

**75** Exhibit 11, p. 1 (000221). 5/16/02 CD# 000025; Tape # 02129; Transcript pages 000219-000228; Recording length 11:46, 74:42.

CI [Trent] Well that's what I wanted because that's how I'm going to make some money to take care of these Dudes see they told me that first of all I Jay's cousin I don't know if he told that but

Horton No I haven't I just got I don't even really I don't know shit.

[Trent is telling Horton that he is going to make some money so that he can pay to execute his plan.]

---

**Exhibit 11, p. 4 (000224). 5/16/02 CD# 000025; Tape # 02129; Transcript pages 000219-000228; Recording length 11:46, 74:42.**

CI [Trent] That's probably what I'm going to need I mean cause see like you know I just got out and I'm starting from nothing and I put a lot of money in this myself you know what I'm saying...

[Trent is saying he doesn't have any money and he needs some credit to get started. Trent says he put a lot of money in this.]

---

**Exhibit 12, p. 8 (000248). 5/17/02; CD# 000022; Tape# 02130; Transcript pages 000239-000268; Recording length 54:09, 59:47.**

CI [Trent] no I'm not, I, when I call him I don't say, \_\_\_ we got our little system; and, that's all he knows and I said look man, need some Heat I don't have no, cause I had a couple guys that's supposed to take care of this and we done put it between me

---

and Jim [Conway], like fifty gran, know what I'm saying; and, I said look man, my god, I don't even know where that \_\_\_\_\_ but I'll deal with that myself

[Trent is telling Horton that he already paid someone \$50,000 to take care of everything he is supposed to be doing, but he can't find them.]

---

**Exhibit 12, p. 17 (000257). 5/17/02; CD# 000022; Tape# 02130; Transcript pages 000239-000268; Recording length 54:09, 59:47; at 30:18.**

CI [Trent] No I lost everything a house all my jewelry everything you know what I'm saying I can't even tell what fucking time it is if I don't look at my phone you know what I mean It's cool I'm just I'm taking it with a grain of salt

JH [Horton] *It's all good*

CI And after *I told Jay* look man I'm putting everything I got into this

[Trent is explaining to Horton that he lost a bunch of money and stuff when he got locked up, but he is putting everything he has into carrying out his plan. Contradicts Trent's statements and testimony that he was being paid by Conway.]

---

**Exhibit 19, p. 7 (000351). 5/20/02; CD# 000005; Transcript pages 000328, 000345-000355; Recording length 18:30.**

CI [Trent] See this the thing, this is the only thing I'm saying dog, I got, I meant I took care of dude at the animal plan, know what I'm saying, that cost me 5, I gave dude that helped me with the video 2500, know what I'm saying, that's 7500, then a thousand for dudes body, that's 8500 I had to fork out, know what I'm saying, so I mean, I'm paying out a lot of money

[Trent is fabricating a list of money he personally paid out in order to execute his plan. He doesn't seem to be expecting repayment. So, it is hard to understand what the point of this is. It does contradict Trent's assertions that he was getting paid by Conway or Horton for what he was doing.]

---

**Exhibit 19, p. 8 (000352). 5/20/02; CD# 000005; Transcript pages 000328, 000345-000355; Recording length 18:30; at 13:47.**

CI [Trent] Man. I dragged...I had to pay for a car, I done spent a lot of money on this shit dog.

[Trent is again talking about money he has paid for the things he is doing, contradicting his assertions that he was to be paid by Conway or Horton.]

---

---

Exhibit 30, p. 31 (000650). 5/25/02, 5:10pm; CD# 000038, 000008; Transcript pages 000500-000522, 000643-000655; Recording length 42:09, 42:49; 23:19, 51:46.

CI [Trent] I'm like I don't know why but... so my dad was just like he's looking out for me you know what I'm saying and he's got a lot of money in this dog

[Now Trent is saying his dad has a lot of money in this. This doesn't make any sense, but it contradicts Trent's assertions that he was being paid by Conway or Horton.]

---

**76** Exhibit 19, p. 7 (000351). 5/20/02; CD# 000005; Transcript pages 000328, 000345-000355; Recording length 18:30; at 12:53.

CI [Trent] See this the thing, this is the only thing I'm saying dog, I got, I meant I took care of dude at the animal plan, know what I'm saying, that cost me 5, I gave dude that helped me with the video 2500, know what I'm saying, that's 7500, then a thousand for dudes body, that's 8500 I had to fork out, know what I'm saying, so I mean, I'm paying out a lot of money

[Trent is fabricating a list of money he personally paid out in order to execute his plan. He doesn't seem to be expecting repayment. So, it is hard to understand what the point of this is. It does contradict Trent's assertions that he was getting paid by Conway or Horton for what he was doing.]

---

**77** Exhibit 12, p. 8 (000248). 5/17/02; CD# 000022; Tape# 02130; Transcript pages 000239-000268; Recording length 54:09, 59:47; at 12:20.

CI [Trent] no I'm not, I, when I call him I don't say, \_\_\_ we got our little system; and, that's all he knows and I said look man, need some *Heat* I don't have no, cause I had a couple guys that's supposed to take care of this and we done put it between me and Jim [Conway], like fifty gran, know what I'm saying; and, I said look man, my god, I don't even know where that \_\_\_\_\_ but I'll deal with that myself

[Trent is telling Horton that he already paid someone \$50,000 to take care of everything he is supposed to be doing, but he can't find them.]

---

**78** Exhibit 16, p. 3 (000311). 5/19/02; CD# 000015; Tape# 02144; Transcript pages 000307-000324; Recording length 19:30, 30:23.

C.I. [Trent] Right cause I don't see, all that, I mean, you know what I'm saying, me and Jimmy [Conway] done gave my dudes like 40 grand and I don't know where

---

they're at, so I got to take care of them when I catch them, but, I mean, from what the shit last night, I got dude 2500, what the hell is that?

[Now Trent is saying that he and Conway paid \$40,000 to his dad's friends to take care of all the stuff he is doing.]

---

**79** Exhibit 20, p. 6 (000371). 5/21/02; CD# 000003; Tape# 02149; Transcript pages 000364-000392; at 12:06.

CI [Trent] He has his way, see originally it was supposed to be his dudes that was taking care of this shit down here but nobody seems to know where they are at, so my dad, my dad loaned me 20 gran on Jimmy's [Conway] word to take care of his shit and a we don't know where they are at

[Trent is telling Horton that his dad originally paid \$20,000 to his friends to do what Trent is now planning, but the absconded with Trent's dad's money.]

---

**80** Exhibit 12, p. 14 (000254). 5/17/02; CD# 000022; Tape# 02130; Transcript pages 000239-000268; Recording length 54:09, 59:47; at 22:58.

CI [Trent] So I mean I take losses and I got to cut people in so it's a little expensive but in the end it all comes back you know what I'm saying I mean it might get expensive but but you know if you got to spend thirty or forty grand now to make thirty or forty thousand thirty or forty million...

[Trent is saying he doesn't mind spending his own money on everything he is doing because he'll be able to make it back plus a lot more. This contradicts what he said about being paid \$30,000 by Conway.]

---

**81** 3117 TTp.745.

**82** 3117 TTp.785.

**83** Exhibit 10, p. 2 (000214). 5/16/02 CD# 000036; Tape # 02128; Transcript pages 000212-000218; Recording length 79:58, 06:00; at 02:38.

C.I. [Trent] Jimmy [Conway] told me to holler at you on the 9 dude

JAMIE HORTON When

---

C.I. Told me to holler you on the 9 pack, I just got in town so I'm going to need it quick, I got shit to do.

JAMIE HORTON Uh, alright, I'll call you right back

[Trent asked for a 9 pack and says Conway told him Horton would give it to him. Horton obviously didn't have any previous knowledge that he was supposed to do that.]

---

**Exhibit 10, p. 3 (000215). 5/16/02 CD# 000036; Tape # 02128; Transcript pages 000212-000218; Recording length 79:58, 06:00; at 03:36.**

JAMIE HORTON Hey I got that shit right beside me for you so as soon as we can hook up, I'll just go ahead and give it to you, alright

[Horton is telling Trent that he will just give him what he asked for on Trent's word.]

---

<sup>84</sup> **Exhibit 11, p. 1 (000221). 5/16/02 CD# 000025; Tape # 02129; Transcript pages 000219-000228; Recording length 11:46, 74:42; at 00:50.**

CI [Trent] Well that's what I wanted because that's how I'm going to make some money to take care of these Dudes see the told me that first of all I Jay's [Conway] cousin I don't know if he told you that but

Horton No I haven't I just got I don't even really know I don't know shit.

[Trent asks Horton if Conway told him that Trent and Conway are cousins and Horton responds no.]

---

**Exhibit 11, p. 3 (000223). 5/16/02 CD# 000025; Tape # 02129; Transcript pages 000219-000228; Recording length 11:46, 74:42; 03:22.**

CI [Trent] Well that's why he's got me I mean I know what I'm doing okay and I'm not I'm far from stupid he just to the point now where he don't know who he can trust you know what I'm saying I mean I mean I'm risking a lot myself but Jimmy's [Conway] my cousin I love him and he told me you solid -and I'm going for that so

Horton Yeah there ain't no way I could ever do anything to anybody cause I don't know what the fucks going on but I kind of got in mind of it but I'll never I'm never

[Trent tells Horton that he is the only one he can trust. Horton says it doesn't matter if he trusts him because Horton doesn't know what is going on.]

---

---

85 Exhibit 11, p. 1 (000221). 5/16/02 CD# 000025; Tape # 02129; Transcript pages 000219-000228; Recording length 11:46, 74:42; at 01:00

Horton was you with him

CI [Trent] Yeah the only person I talked to is Jimmy [Conway] you see what I'm saying  
[Horton asks Trent if he was in jail with Conway and Trent says yes.]

---

86 Exhibit 53, 3118 TT Vol. I, at 59-60.

87 Exhibit 11, p. 8 (000228). 5/16/02 CD# 000025; Tape # 02129; Transcript pages 000219-000228; Recording length 11:46, 74:42; at 09:40.

CI [Trent] \_\_\_\_\_ if you holler at Jay man just tell him I ain't ever talking to him on the phone no more so it's over with, I ain't talking to him no more

[Trent is telling Horton that he doesn't want to talk to Conway over the phone. Trent is trying to collect evidence to incriminate Conway. So, this doesn't make sense unless Trent is deliberately trying to prevent Conway from finding out what he's doing.]

---

Exhibit 25, p. 3 (000476). 5/23/02; CD# 000007\*, 000032\*\*; Tape# 02157; Transcript pages 000473-000494, 000637-000641; at 16:40\*\*

CI [Trent] Yeah why do you see what I'm saying you keep insulting my intelligence we been through this

MALE 2 [Conway] \_\_\_\_\_

CI It's cool don't ask so many questions

[Trent is deliberately trying to keep Conway from finding out what is going on by telling him he is asking too many questions. If Conway was aware of what Trent was doing and was going along with it, then Trent would explain to him what is happening in order to incriminate Conway.,]

---

Exhibit 29, p. 5 (000551). 5/25/02; CD# 000035; Tape# 02171; Transcript pages 000547-000561; Recording length 14:36, 38:13; at 04:40-06:40.

CI [Trent] Well, yeah, and they told you what we're doing right (Recording: \_\_\_\_\_ Correctional Institution and is subject to monitoring and recording.) They told you what we're doing right?

Conway What now?

---

CI I said, they told you what we're doing?

Conway No, they never told me.

CI Oh, okay, well

[Trent tries to find out what Conway has been told about what he is doing with Horton and Nightingale. Conway says they haven't told him anything. This conversation makes no sense if Conway came up with the plan and told Trent what to do while they were in jail together.]

---

**Exhibit 30, p. 6 (000505). 5/25/02, 5:10pm; CD# 000038, 000008; Transcript pages 000500-000522, 000643-000655; Recording length 42:09, 42:49; 23:19, 51:46.**

CI [Trent] Yeah Jimmy [Conway] shouldn't be saying nothing man over that mother fucking phone

NIGHTINGALE No, the acted like it was over a radio

CI They already had him on phone restriction so

[Trent is mad and wants to make sure Conway doesn't find out what is going on.]

---

**88 Exhibit 16, p. 7 (000315). 5/19/02; CD# 000015; Tape# 02144; Transcript pages 000307-000324; Recording length 19:30, 30:23.**

C.I. [Trent] I mean, you got some shit you got to take care of then bro, I mean, you know what I'm saying, I'm supposed to be in charge of this shit, I feel like I'm being played like a fucking flunky and I'm not liking it at all

[Trent is telling Conway that he is supposed to be in charge and everyone is supposed to be doing what he says.]

---

**Exhibit 24, p. 3 (000455). 5/23/02, 4:30pm; CD# 000024; Tape# 02158; Transcript pages 000452-000465; Recording length 14:49 38:55; at 02:40.**

CI [Trent] Hey listen, get a hold of Jamie [Horton] for me alright because he is suppose to go and see Jimmy [Conway] tonight.

Brittany Um I am about to go and meet up with Jamie and go see him.

CI No don't go yet I need to see him.

Brittany I am not going right now I've got to go and take a shower and stuff.

---

CI           What I am saying is this Brittany I need to see Jimmy. I've got something

Brittany      If you need to go down there then go.

CI           Well I am saying I am just going to meet Jamie down there like about 8:30  
because I need to talk to Jamie.

Brittany      No he's planning on going at 6. You want to go.

CI           Tell him I said to go at 8:30 fuck what he's saying.

[Conversation with Britnee Stollings, Conway's girlfriend. Trent is demanding to go visit  
Conway.]

---

**Exhibit 32, p. 9 (000579). 5/25/02; CD# 000033; Tape# 02168; Transcript pages 000571-  
000589; Recording length 34:03, 36:05.**

CI [Trent]    I mean I told Jimmy [Conway], when this originally started the understanding I  
had was, I'm in control of everything, know what I'm saying, all I need to get with  
you guys for is the guns and money, know what I'm saying and who it is I need to  
take care of and now it's like I don't even know who the fuck it is I really need to  
take care of

Nightingale   I, I don't know man, I just thought maybe two of them would you make your  
own choice

[Trent says he is supposed to be in control of everything.]

---

**Exhibit 32, pp. 14-15 (000584-000585). 5/25/02; CD# 000033; Tape# 02168; Transcript pages  
000571-000589; Recording length 34:03, 36:05.**

CI [Trent]    Yeah, I like to stay free and I'm not taking no unnecessary chances man... (phone  
ringing) Jimmy [Conway], Hello. Yeah, what's up man? (Cannot hear the other  
half of the conversation.) Nothing. Dude, you're fucking me up here Jay, because  
dog, I got, got something I'm trying to do here man, you know what I'm saying  
and you know what I'm saying and you're giving other people instructions that's  
going against what the fuck I'm trying to do and you're making my job a hundred  
times harder than it has to be. Well I mean, that's not my understanding...  
Shawn's [Nightingale] in the car right now, so well, I mean listen you know that  
one thing right that was originally started, okay, I'm going to do that same thing  
again with the other thing, you understand what I'm saying? I'm ...just ...trust...  
listen Jimmy, do you trust me dog? Okay, then that's all you need, you need to  
let these guys know that, that I'm not no mother fucking cop and I'm not no  
mother fucking idiot, I know what the fuck I'm doing

---

...

CI I mean, it's not Shawn dog... Well listen, this is what I need you to do dog, all I need you to do is let Shawn and Jamie [Horton] know I know what the fuck I'm doing and to help me in whatever way they can, that's all I need you to do dog and no more change of plan and no more change of orders, no more change of instructions, that's all I need you to do, so can you do that?... Let's just say it's for insurance sakes, okay, I mean, I understand you feel there ain't no need for it right now, but what happens if there's a need for it later. I got it covered now... Okay, so, okay, listen, to alleviate all that shit, just do what I ask you to do bro, that's all and you know I'm going to take care of the rest, you already know that. It's not just insurance for me, it's insurance for every fucking body... I mean just the thought of a mother fucker even thinking I might be a mother fucking cop, you know what I'm saying, you know how it gets me dog, you know how I am... Dog listen. I gave you my word I would do what I could to get you out of there. You gave me your word I could do this the way I want to do it, so, so let's just stick to that alright.

[Trent is on a phone call with Conway tells Conway for the first time that Trent is going to make a video of someone confessing to killing Dotson. Conway clearly responds that he doesn't want him to do that, but Trent persists. Trent doesn't want Conway involved or even knowing what Trent is doing. Trent wants Conway to instruct Horton and Nightingale to do whatever Trent says and then for Conway just to stay out of the way and not even question what Trent is doing. If Conway, Horton, and Nightingale do not follow these instructions, Trent interprets that as accusing him of being a cop, and Trent gets very upset at such accusations.]

---

**89 Exhibit 16, p. 5 (000313). 5/19/02; CD# 000015; Tape# 02144; Transcript pages 000307-000324; Recording length 19:30, 30:23; at 05:00.**

CI [Trent] Alright tell him uh, tell him \_\_\_\_\_ just tell him to give me a call, cause I called Brittany and told her to tell Jimmy [Conway] that he's starting to piss me off, just tell Jimmy me and you talked or I'll tell him when he calls me

[Trent is telling Horton that Conway is pissing him off because things aren't going how Trent wants.]

---

**Exhibit 16, p. 6 (000314). 5/19/02; CD# 000015; Tape# 02144; Transcript pages 000307-000324; Recording length 19:30, 30:23; at 07:00.**

CI [Trent] I mean, I mean, yeah something's wrong dog know what I'm saying, I mean, god damn dog, it's like you're fucking, I feel like you're fucking playing like I'm stupid or something, I don't know if it's you or him or what

---

CONWAY Well see, I haven't even talked to him today, I didn't know anything was even going on.

[Trent is telling Conway that he is pissed because Horton asked him for money. Conway says he didn't even know anything was going on.]

---

**Exhibit 16, p. 7 (000315). 5/19/02; CD# 000015; Tape# 02144; Transcript pages 000307-000324; Recording length 19:30, 30:23; at 08:40, 09:00, and 09:40.**

C.I. [Trent] I mean, you got some shit you got to take care of then bro, I mean, you know what I'm saying, I'm supposed to be in charge of this shit, I feel like I'm being played like a fucking flunky and I'm not liking it at all

...

C.I. I told him look, I needed some money to take care of that shit in Chillicothe dog, you know what I'm saying and I wanted to meet with Cicero my mother fucking self, I'm not getting ready to let this shit, I don't know what them dudes are going to do with that shit when it leaves my hands man

...

C.I. Alright and tell, you know what I'm saying, let him know that the fucking money I need for them dudes in Chillicothe, I need it, I don't have time to fucking wait while you guys open negotiations man

[Trent is telling Conway that he is supposed to be in charge and everyone is supposed to be doing what he says. Trent wants to give the video confession he made to Chris Cicero, Conway's attorney, personally, and Trent is demanding money from Horton, which is inconsistent with his previous conversations with Horton and Conway.]

---

**Exhibit 16, p. 8 (000316). 5/19/02; CD# 000015; Tape# 02144; Transcript pages 000307-000324; Recording length 19:30, 30:23; at 10:30 and 10:50.**

C.I. [Trent] Then we ain't got to worry about nothing, cause I mean I need to talk to you dog, I don't, I don't like the way this shit's going down, and I'm not getting ready to get played like no fucking idiot

...

C.I. Alright, well when Jamie [Horton] comes to visit you tonight man, call me and let me know what the fuck you told him that I'm in charge or whatever

[Trent is telling Conway that he wants him to tell Horton that Trent is in charge.]

---

---

**Exhibit 18, p. 11 (000339). 5/20/02, 4:35pm; (No recording); Transcript pages 000329-000344.**

CI [Trent] tell him, tell him quit being a fucking pussy man, god damn

...

CI \_\_\_\_\_ man, I mean it's fucking, \_\_\_\_\_ fucking scared he's, it's like he's ready to piss himself when I talk to him \_\_\_\_\_ dog.

...

CI no, he's fucking spooked, so a, look man, just tell him we'll go down there and we will be coming back

...

CI telling him quit being a bitch man, god damn, I thought he was a gangster

[Trent is mad because Horton doesn't want to go to Chillicothe.]

---

**Exhibit 22, p. 3 (000402). 5/22/02; CD# 000026; Tape# 02150; Transcript pages 00040-000411; Recording length; 21:30, 34:02; at 03:40.**

Tony [Trent]: These guys are fucking idiots. Look, tell Jamie [Horton] to get a hold of me, tell him to go to a pay phone, something and call me and let me know if you get a hold of him or don't get a hold of him, either way I'm sitting right here waiting with my thumb up my ass.

...

Brittany Their phones must be like turned off like he didn't pay his bill or something because I don't know that's what it said, I mean it won't even let me try to get him. I called Rob and his girl and left a message for both of them to try to get a hold of him, so I'll get a hold of him somehow. I'll go to his house if I have to.

Tony: Yeah, yeah, its like extremely important

Brittany: I'll find him for you.

Tony: Make sure when Jimmy [Conway] calls you you call me on his three way.

[Horton has changed his phone number and isn't calling Trent. So, Trent has Britnee Stollings (Conway's girlfriend), who also doesn't have Horton's number, to track him down.]

---

---

**Exhibit 22, pp. 4-5 (000403-000404). 5/22/02; CD# 000026; Tape# 02150; Transcript pages 000400-000411; Recording length; 21:30, 34:02; at 05:10.**

[Horton]: Hey we got that phone shut off

Tony [Trent]: Okay, what is this a new number?

[Horton:] No this is a pay phone

[Horton finally returns Trent's call, but doesn't give Trent his new number.]

---

**Exhibit 22, p. 5 (000404). 5/22/02; CD# 000026; Tape# 02150; Transcript pages 000400-000411; Recording length; 21:30, 34:02; 13:16.**

Tony [Trent]: Hi is Shawn [Nightingale] there?

Female: No he ain't here. Him and Emily went somewhere.

[Trent trying to track down Nightingale.]

---

**Exhibit 22, p. 6 (000405). 5/22/02; CD# 000026; Tape# 02150; Transcript pages 000400-000411; Recording length; 21:30, 34:02; at 13:45.**

Tony [Trent]: What's up. Hey Jamie [Horton] was supposed to give me his new number but he didn't give it to me.

Female [Stollings]: I don't have it yet either.

Tony: Well can you get hold of him?

[Trent lies and tells Britnee Stollings that Horton was supposed to give him Horton's new number. Horton is trying to avoid Trent, but Trent is relentless.]

---

**Exhibit 22, p. 7 (000406). 5/22/02; CD# 000026; Tape# 02150; Transcript pages 000400-000411; Recording length; 21:30, 34:02; at 14:45.**

Female [Stollings]: Can't get a hold of him, I don't know. Nobody answers the phone. I don't know, I'll probably be able to get a hold of him in ½ hour or something like that.

Tony [Trent]: A half hour?

Female: Yeah because his girl's gonna be with him

Tony: His girl? Okay well just tell him to call me when he gets rid of his girl, just tell him to go...

---

Female: Its like that's the only way I can get a hold of him, because of her phone right now, but I'll tell him to get to a pay phone and call you.

Tony: Okay, tell him to try to make it before a half hour.

Female: I mean I can't get a hold of him until then because I called her phone and that's what her family said that they'd probably be together.

---

[Trent is relentless in trying to get in touch with Horton.]

---

**Exhibit 22, pp. 7-8 (000406-000407). 5/22/02; CD# 000026; Tape# 02150; Transcript pages 000400-000411; Recording length; 21:30, 34:02; at 15:35.**

Brittany [Stollings]: Nobody's got a hold of him

Tony [Trent]: Don't Shawn [Nightingale] have his new number, I think he does, I think Jamie [Horton] gave it to him. I have to get a hold of him Brittany. I'm sitting out her in the country in the fucking parking lot.

...

Brittany I'll have to see where he's at and call you in about ½ hour.

Tony: You told me that ½ hour ago.

Brittany: No but I'm going to where he's at. I can't get a hold of him any other way. I'm just saying I'm about to go to where he's at

...

Tony: Tell them to get their fucking head out of their ass man, what the fuck.

...

Tony: Well, I hope somebody knows, I'm not enjoying this shit at all.

...

Tony: Well, when you get there, if he's not there, call me and I'll just get with him tomorrow. Either way, fucking call me because I need to talk to him like right now. I'm tired of sitting out here for nothing.

---

[Horton is training to avoid Trent, but Trent is sending Stollings to look for him.]

---

---

**Exhibit 22, pp. 8-9 (000407-000408). 5/22/02; CD# 000026; Tape# 02150; Transcript pages 000400-000411; Recording length; 21:30, 34:02; at 17:30.**

Tony [Trent]: Man, what the fuck, what's up? Dude I'm getting pissed man.

Jamie [Horton]: At me?

Tony: At every fucking body, Jamie [Horton], this shit's crazy dog.

Jamie: What the fuck am I doing?

[Trent finally tracks Horton down and expresses how mad he is about Horton not answering his calls.]

---

**Exhibit 22, p. 10 (000409). 5/22/02; CD# 000026; Tape# 02150; Transcript pages 000400-000411; Recording length; 21:30, 34:02; at 19:50.**

Tony [Trent]: 893-3099. All right, go see Jimmy [Conway] at 1:00 tomorrow Jamie.

Jamie [Horton]: Dude he always has somebody \_\_\_\_ at 7:30.

Tony: Fuck that, you tell him your mom wants you there at 1:00 to get this bullshit straight man. I'm sleeping in tomorrow, I probably get up around about 2-2:30, 3:00.

[After several hours of relentless pursuit, Trent tacks Horton down and gets his number. Then he orders Horton to visit Conway at 1 pm the following day.]

---

**Exhibit 24, p. 3 (000455). 5/23/02, 4:30pm; CD# 000024; Tape# 02158; Transcript pages 000452-000465; Recording length 14:49 38:55; at 02:40.**

Cl [Trent] Hey listen, get a hold of Jamie [Horton] for me alright because he is suppose to go and see Jimmy [Conway] tonight.

Brittany Um I am about to go and meet up with Jamie and go see him.

Cl No don't go yet I need to see him.

Brittany I am not going right now I've got to go and take a shower and stuff.

Cl What I am saying is this Brittany I need to see Jimmy. I've got something

Brittany If you need to go down there then go.

Cl Well I am saying I am just going to meet Jamie down there like about 8:30 because I need to talk to Jamie.

---

Brittany No he's planning on going at 6. You want to go.

CI Tell him I said to go at 8:30 fuck what he's saying.

[Conversation with Britnee Stollings, Conway's girlfriend. Trent is demanding to go visit Conway.]

---

**Exhibit 24, p. 10 (000462). 5/23/02, 4:30pm; CD# 000024; Tape# 02158; Transcript pages 000452-000465; Recording length 14:49 38:55: at 11:20.**

Unknown caller [Conway] are you coming down here

[CI—Trent] [Yeah.]

[Unknown caller] [Why?]

CI Because I need to holler at you and I can't holler at you. I got something else done.

[Trent is essentially forcing himself on Conway. It is necessary to hear the tone of voice in this conversation to completely understand it. It is obvious from listening to this conversation that Conway does not want Trent to come visit him.]

---

**Exhibit 30, pp. 15-16 (000514-000515). 5/25/02, 5:10pm; CD# 000038, 000008; Transcript pages 000500-000522, 000643-000655; Recording length 42:09, 42:49; 23:19, 51:46; at 35:20.**

CI [Trent] Dude I'm just like I told you I want to get everything \_\_\_\_\_ first you guys are fucking stepping on your digs to hold me up Bro

[Trent tells Nightingale he is causing him problems by not doing what he says.]

---

**Exhibit 31, p. 3 (000564). 5/25/02; CD# 000034; Tape# 02171; Transcript pages 000562-000570, 000495-000498; Recording length 15:06, 79:58; at 02:35.**

CI [Trent] Well I mean, it's not, it's not even that bro, I mean, okay as far as that shit goes, fuck that, you know what I'm saying, I'm just talking about in general man, I mean, I mean fuck man, I'm supposed to get them mother fucking, that heat from Shawn [Nightingale], know what I'm saying, I'm supposed to get some hard from you and it's like, I don't know, I don't know, I feel like I'm getting fucking ran around man, I just

[Trent complains to Horton that Nightingale isn't giving him guns and Horton isn't giving him drugs like he wants.]

---

---

**Exhibit 31, p. 5 (000565). 5/25/02; CD# 000034; Tape# 02171; Transcript pages 000562-000570, 000495-000498; Recording length 15:06, 79:58; 05:30.**

CI [Trent] Know what I'm saying, so, uh, what's what I'm saying, I'm going to get this shit from him [Nightingale] tonight dog and I'm done fucking with him, cause he's, he's, like he's getting on my mother fucking nerves, it's like he's playing two-face shit and I'm not on that

[Trent tells Horton he is angry that Nightingale isn't following his instructions and giving him what he wants.]

---

<sup>90</sup> **Exhibit 25, p. 7 (000480). 5/23/02; CD# 000007, 000032; Tape# 02157; Transcript pages 000473-000494, 000637-000641.**

-This transcript reads:

CI [Trent] He says you guys are stupid that's what I'm saying dog you, you got me running around here like a chicken with my head cut off

MALE 2 [Conway] I don't fucking do that, I'm still \_\_\_\_\_

CI Has anybody been *punching* on you lately

-The actual recording on CD # 32; tape #2157 at approximately 22:30 is as follows:

Trent: He [Nightingale] says you guys are stupid. That's what I'm saying dog, you got me running around here like a chicken with my head cut off.

Conway: I don't got you doing nothing. I don't know what you're doing.

Trent: Has anybody been punching on you lately?

[Trent is trying to blame Conway for Nightingale not going along with Trent's plan, but Conway protests that he doesn't even know what is going on.]

---

**Exhibit 30, pp. 27 (000646). 5/25/02, 5:10pm; CD# 000038, 000008; Transcript pages 000500-000522, 000643-000655; Recording length 42:09, 42:49; 23:19, 51:46; at 09:50.**

CI [Trent] ... I'm trying to get this shit done you know and out of the way Jimmy [Conway] don't know what we're doing so I don't understand why he's saying don't talk about it you know what I'm saying I'm not stupid dog \_\_\_\_\_ cost twenty dollars to wash this fucking van

---

[Trent is telling Horton that Conway doesn't know what they are doing and shouldn't be interfering.]

---

<sup>91</sup> Exhibit 26, p. 3 (000468). 5/23/02, 9:30pm; CD# 050-369, 000030; Tape# 02155, 02159; Transcript pages 000466-000472; Recording length 05:30, 05:54; 45:00, 47:09; at 02:20.

CI [Trent] I feel ya. Hello, what's going on big baby? Yes I am Jay [Conway] you know I am dog, you know when I'm going to quit it dog, when we have... so don't have nobody come and see you Sunday...why? \_\_\_\_ you want me to, huh? You only get one visit Jay, this is a little bit more important than that dog, alright, okay... Well you know when I'm going to quit sweating it... alright dog, later.

[This is one side of a phone call from Conway to Trent in which Conway tells Trent to stop what he is doing and Trent refuses. Then Conway tells Trent he doesn't want him to visit because he only gets one visit a day and he wants to see his family. Trent says what he is doing is more important and Conway tells him again to stop what he's doing and Trent again refuses.]

---

<sup>92</sup> Exhibit 35. Trent's April 24, 2002 interview, p. 6.

<sup>93</sup> Exhibit 12, p. 19 (000259). 5/17/02; CD# 000022; Tape# 02130; Transcript pages 000239-000268; Recording length 54:09, 59:47.

-This transcript reads:

JH [Horton] Well let's wait Till we get a rent-a- car

CI [Trent] I'll take care of it um man just try to get me some orders as soon as you can though then I'll take care of it then you know what I'm saying the we ain't got to worry about it and now you know what I'm saying I mean Jay [Conway] told me that it was \_\_\_\_\_ you know what I'm saying...

-The actual recording on CD # 22; tape #2130 at approximately 33:20 is as follows:

Horton: Well let's wait till we get a rent-a-car.

Trent: I'll take care of it um man just try to get me some orders as soon as you can then I'll take care of it then you know what I'm saying then we ain't got to worry about it and now you know what I'm saying I mean Jay told me that his finances was light weight strapped you know what I'm saying I mean...

---

---

[Trent tells Horton that he knows Conway doesn't have any money.]

---

Exhibit 14, p. 6 (000292). 5/18/02, 06:01pm; CD# 000029; Tape# 02142; Transcript pages 000285-000301; Recording length 15:40 39:05; at 05:40.

C.I. [Trent] Jamie [Horton] yeah, cause I mean I know you're strapped, but I might need just a little edge to take care of the rest of it

---

[Trent is telling Conway that he knows Conway doesn't have any money.]

---

<sup>94</sup> Exhibit 25, p. 22 (000637). 5/23/02; CD# 000007\*, 000032\*\*; Tape# 02157; Transcript pages 000473-000494, 000637-000641; at 43:20\*\*.

CI [Trent] Dude I can't work with these guys man running in circles J um man listen the only reason I got to fuck with you man you know what I'm saying anytime I need money you can get it from him dog

Male 2 [Conway] *He don't have any*

[Trent is telling Conway Trent wants Conway to have Horton give him money, but Conway tells Trent Horton doesn't have any.]

---

<sup>95</sup> Exhibit 30, p. 5 (000504). 5/25/02, 5:10pm; CD# 000038, 000008; Transcript pages 000500-000522, 000643-000655; Recording length 42:09, 42:49; 23:19, 51:46.

-This transcript reads:

CI [Trent] Oh fucking Jamie [Horton] get enough

NIGHTINGALE I don't know \_\_\_\_\_ -I just can't do anything with all of it if I get it I use to get all kinds \_\_\_\_\_ trade it for weed

---

-The actual recording on CD # 38; at approximately 07:40 is as follows:

---

CI [Trent] How much did Jamie give you now?

NIGHTINGALE I don't know I don't have any money at all now, I just can't do anything with all of it. If I get it I use to get all kinds trade it for weed.

---

[Nightingale is telling Trent he doesn't have any money.]

---

---

<sup>96</sup> Exhibit 30, p. 10 (000509). 5/25/02, 5:10pm; CD# 000038, 000008; Transcript pages 000500-000522, 000643-000655; Recording length 42:09, 42:49; 23:19, 51:46; at 18:20.

-This transcript reads:

CI [Trent] I was going to ask about that bike now what's up with that bike

NIGHTINGALE I'll sell it to you for twenty-five man \_\_\_ fuck that bike

-The actual recording on CD # 38; at approximately 07:40 is as follows:

CI [Trent] I was going to ask about that bike. Now, what's up with that bike?

Nightingale I'll sell it to you for twenty-five man. That's cheap as fuck with that bike.

CI Yeah, it is.

Nightingale I just don't have any money right now.

[Nightingale is telling Trent he will sell him a motorcycle cheap because he needs the money right now.]

---

<sup>97</sup> Exhibit 25, p. 8-9 (000481-000482). 5/23/02; CD# 000007\*, 000032\*\*; Tape# 02157; Transcript pages 000473-000494, 000637-000641; at 23:40\*\*.

CI [Trent] That's what he said he's like cause we went down there he wanted me to he wanted if one more person out of this crew ask me for money dog

Male 2 [Horton] \_\_\_\_\_

CI He *listen* he wanted Shawn [Nightingale] wanted me to pay for a room for 3 days are you fucking kidding me man

[Trent is mad because everyone keeps asking him for money. Nightingale asked Trent for money to rent a hotel room for three days.]

---

---

<sup>98</sup> Exhibit 37, Trent's 3118 TT Vol. I, at 193.

Exhibit 12, p. 25 (000265). 5/17/02; CD# 000022; Tape# 02130; Transcript pages 000239-000268; Recording length 54:09, 59:47.

CI [Trent] But you know I mean I'm not it's not like I'm not making nothing you know I make a little bit of shit off the nine last night I made a little bit you know what I'm saying but I gave my Dude a little

[Trent is saying that he is not making any money from what he is doing. Contradicting what he told detectives and testified to.]

---

<sup>99</sup> Exhibit 12, p. 20 (000260). 5/17/02; CD# 000022; Tape# 02130; Transcript pages 000239-000268; Recording length 54:09, 59:47.

CI [Trent] OK well look if you get some Hard by Sunday though by Monday I'll have the \_\_\_\_\_ you know what I'm saying and then um just give Chris [Cicero] some of the money that was way he's got everybody happy you know what I'm saying I need to get with Cicero like tomorrow...

[Trent wants some drugs from Horton so he can sell them and use some of the money to pay Conway's lawyer, Chris Cicero.]

---

Exhibit 13, p. 13 (000282). 5/18/02, 02:35pm; CD# 000019; Tape# 02141; Transcript pages 000269-000284; Recording length 18:20.

CI [Trent] Right well did Jamie [Horton] get him some money Cicero

Conway I don't know if he did or not

CI all right well if not we're suppose to get him some Monday so try to get him off your back because

[Trent tells Conway directly that he going to pay Conway's lawyer Chris Cicero.]

---

<sup>100</sup> Exhibit 12, p. 12 (000252). 5/17/02; CD# 000022; Tape# 02130; Transcript pages 000239-000268; Recording length 54:09, 59:47.

CI [Trent] Well see that's why that's why Originally the [9 pack] because I'm going to get ta crack head you know what I'm saying and a crack head will tell you whatever the fuck you want him to say if you hold it's like holding a chair in front

---

of a horses face they'll say what they want to say to get what they want he don't he's not going to know what's coming until afterwards and then by then it's too late you know what I'm saying but that's why I needed that yesterday I mean it kind of fucked me up cause I had some other things I got to take care of and I got a partner I got to take care of...

JH [Horton] How much um I'll do my damist but man I'm going \_\_\_\_\_

CI I mean I could shoot you some shit back that ain't no problem see what I'm saying that that's not ever a problem you know if you want to split I'll split the cost with you on a 9 you know what I'm saying half of it will be going on what Jimmy's [Conway] going on and I get you half of it back whatever you want more you know what I'm saying

[Trent is telling Horton that he used the drugs from the previous day to get someone to confess to the Dockside shooting and to pay someone to help him get rid of the body. Trent makes a point of telling Horton that none of the money is for him personally and that Trent will pay Horton some of the money back. This contradicts Trent's claim that there was an agreement to just give him whatever he wants.]

---

**Exhibit 19, p. 8 (000352). 5/20/02; CD# 000005; Transcript pages 000328, 000345-000355; Recording length 18:30.**

CI [Trent] Damn, well I'm going to call my dude, cause when we talked earlier I thought you was bringing some dope to get something back off of, so I'm just going to call my dude and tell him that I didn't get that.

Jamie Horton I'll get some whenever you guys are ready.

CI See that's what I'm saying, right now I don't have a lot of money to like give you up front

Jamie Horton That's cool, I'll give you whatever you want man, just like Jim [Conway] said, give you whatever you want

CI Exactly, I mean I can shoot you some back that ain't shit, but I just need something to start with \_\_\_\_\_

[Horton agrees to give Trent anything he wants *up front*. Meaning he fully expects to be repaid.]

---

101 Exhibit 53, Scott's 3118 TT Vol. I, at 75.

---

**102 Exhibit 28, p. 3 (000624). 5/24/02; CD# 000016\*, 000017\*\*, 000027\*\*\*; Tape# 02161, 02166; Transcript pages 000622-000629, 0000642, 000630-000636; Recoding length TR1 31:33, TR2 46:30, Total 79:56; \*\*:\*\*, 76:27; 33:52, 35:45.**

CI [Trent] Yeah I'm gonna take care of my pals... all the shit that you gave me is to take care of them dudes down there you know what I'm saying. So I need more money to take care of these dudes and I can't do it by myself you know what I'm saying.

Horton \_\_\_\_\_ -I'll at least give you like 4 or 5 of them, but I have to get that money first.

[Horton tells Trent he can get him 4 or 5, but he has to get the money up front.]

---

**103 Exhibit 37, Trent's 3118 TT Vol. I, pp. 211-212.**

**104 3118 TT Vol. III, pp.113-114.**

**105 Exhibit 12, p. 12 (000252). 5/17/02; CD# 000022; Tape# 02130; Transcript pages 000239-000268; Recording length 54:09, 59:47.**

CI I mean I could shoot you some shit back that ain't no problem see what I'm saying that that's not ever a problem you know if you want to split I'll split the cost with you on a 9 you know what I'm saying half of it will be going on what Jimmy's [Conway] going on and I get you half of it back whatever you want more you know what I'm saying

[Trent will pay Horton back for any drugs he gets or they can split it.]

---

**Exhibit 19, p. 8 (000352). 5/20/02; CD# 000005; Transcript pages 000328, 000345-000355; Recording length 18:30.**

CI [Trent] See that's what I'm saying, right now I don't have a lot of money to like give you up front

Jamie Horton That's cool, I'll give you whatever you want man, just like Jim [Conway] said, give you whatever you want

CI Exactly, I mean I can shoot you some back that ain't shit, but I just need something to start with \_\_\_\_\_

[Trent tells Horton he doesn't have a lot of money to pay for drugs up front, but he will pay him later.]

---

---

**106** Exhibit 25, p. 5 (000478). 5/23/02; CD# 000007\*, 000032\*\*; Tape# 02157; Transcript pages 000473-000494, 000637-000641; at 19:00\*\*.

CI [Trent] And see you know since Thursday I've had like 6 hours sleep I'm getting tired and I'm broke I don't

MALE 2 [Conway] Where do you run

[Trent telling Conway that he is broke, which he could hardly claim if he was given all the drugs and money he claims.]

---

**107** Exhibit 12, p. 25 (000265). 5/17/02; CD# 000022; Tape# 02130; Transcript pages 000239-000268; Recording length 54:09, 59:47.

CI [Trent] We can do that you know what I'm saying that way this is what I'm saying nobody will meet you that doesn't need to nobody meets me that doesn't need to you know what I'm saying so I mean you know I'm fucked up right now the money side so I might need your help then but other than that I'm cool dog

[Trent is telling Horton that he doesn't have any money and may need to borrow some.]

---

**108** Exhibit 25, p. 12 (000483). 5/23/02; CD# 000007, 000032; Tape# 02157; Transcript pages 000473-000494, 000637-000641.

-This transcript reads:

CI [Trent] I'm fucking broke dog I had to borrow a grand from him, from my dad he was fucking spasing we went all the way down there and my dad you know I picked a bag up for my dad right you know what was in that bag money

-The actual recording on CD # 32; tape #2157 at approximately 26:30 is as follows:

Trent: I'm fucking broke dog. I had to borrow a grand from him [indicating Horton] for my dad. He was fucking spasing. We went all the way down there and my dad, you know I picked a bag up for my dad, right? You know what was in that bag? Money.

[On a visit with Conway, Trent confirms that he borrowed \$1,000 from Horton. If Conway and Horton agreed to pay Trent \$30,000, he would not have to borrow money.]

---

---

**109 Exhibit 16, p. 3 (000311). 5/19/02; CD# 000015; Tape# 02144; Transcript pages 000307-000324; Recording length 19:30, 30:23; at 03:30.**

C.I. [Trent] ...I'm going to tell Jimmy [Conway] he's got to give us something dog, because we're fucking doing everything, you know what I'm saying ... I just, I mean, you know, I don't give a fuck dog, but at the same time, I'm, I'm dog dick broke man

[Trent tells Horton he broke.]

---

**Exhibit 31, p. 4 (000565). 5/25/02; CD# 000034; Tape# 02171; Transcript pages 000562-000570, 000495-000498; Recording length 15:06, 79:58.**

Jamie [Horton] I mean if you need to borrow some money \_\_\_\_\_

CI [Trent] Yeah that's cool, know what I'm saying, I just don't, it's just, I don't know, I'm starting to get feeling that I don't know

[Trent agrees to borrow money from Horton.]

---

**110 Exhibit 28, p. 3 (000624). 5/24/02; CD# 000016\*, 000017\*\*, 000027\*\*\*; Tape# 02161, 02166; Transcript pages 000622-000629, 0000642, 000630-000636; Recording length TR1 31:33, TR2 46:30, Total 79:56; \*\*:\*\*, 76:27; 33:52, 35:45; at 12:45\*, 26:00\*\*, 11:06\*\*\*.**

-This transcript reads:

CI [Trent] Man you can't call dude \_\_\_\_\_ Go to a payphone, I'm trying to get this done I gotta keep coming to you guys to get money.

-The actual recording on CD # 16\*, 17\*\*, or 27\*\*\*; tape #2130 at approximately 12:45\*, 26:00\*\*, 11:06\*\*\*. is as follows:

Trent Man you can't call dude and just tell him to get you a fucking address. Go to a payphone, I'm trying to get this done tonight... I gotta keep coming to you guys to get money to make ends meet.

[Trent says he wants Horton to get the address of a house he plans on robbing so he won't have to keep coming to Horton to borrow money.]

---

---

**111 Exhibit 28, p. 8 (000629). 5/24/02; CD# 000016\*, 000017\*\*, 000027\*\*\*; Tape# 02161, 02166; Transcript pages 000622-000629, 0000642, 000630-000636; Recoding length TR1 31:33, TR2 46:30, Total 79:56; \*\*:\*\*, 76:27; 33:52, 35:45; at 33:00\*\*\*.**

CI [Trent] Really you guys ain't taking no risks, I'm taking all the risks. I don't care Because of I value family and its family, you just gotta \_\_\_\_ I try to get My gear back in order, get my jewelry. I'm trying to take care of a whole bunch of shit at once.

[Trent says he is taking all these risks because he values family.]

---

**112 Exhibit 11, p. 3 (000223). 5/16/02 CD# 000025; Tape # 02129; Transcript pages 000219-000228; Recording length 11:46, 74:42; 03:00.**

CI [Trent] Well that's why he's got me I mean I know what I'm doing okay and I'm not I'm far from stupid he just to the point now where he don't know who he can trust you know what I'm saying I mean I mean I'm risking a lot myself but Jimmy's [Conway] my cousin I love him and he told me you solid -and I'm going for that so

[Trent saying he is risking all this because Conway is his cousin and he has "love" for him.]

---

**Exhibit 32, p. 13 (000583). 5/25/02; CD# 000033; Tape# 02168; Transcript pages 000571-000589; Recording length 34:03, 36:05; 18:00.**

CI [Trent] (Chuckles) Cause I mean, know what I'm saying, just told me, he's the one that told me at first, that's how I found out at first that that Jimmy [Conway] was bullshitting me and Jimmy's my cousin and I love him dog, know what I'm saying. I'm doing this shit because I got love for him really...

[Trent tells Nightingale that he is trying to help Conway because he has "love" for him.]

---

**113 Exhibit 31, p. 3 (000564). 5/25/02; CD# 000034; Tape# 02171; Transcript pages 000562-000570, 000495-000498; Recording length 15:06, 79:58; 02:00.**

CI [Trent] I'm just saying man, mother fuckers thinking I'm all fucking cop, fuck it dog, I'll just let you guys deal with this shit, know what I'm saying, I'm going out of my way for you guys

---

---

114 Exhibit 53, Scott's 3118 TT Vol. I, at 86-87, and 91-92.

115 Exhibit 25, p. 18 (000491). 5/23/02; CD# 000007, 000032; Tape# 02157; Transcript pages 000473-000494, 000637-000641; at 33:20.

CI [Trent] Cause I we definitely do not want him pissed definite he's like a take care of the take care

Male 2 [Horton] He don't know when the dude gonna get out

CI Fuck them dudes I can handle this I'm just telling you I'm going to need a little money though you know what I'm saying to take care of them dudes in Chillicothe I can't do it by myself so I got to have a little money to get me some help

[Trent is telling Horton that he has to give his dad back a gun he borrowed because no one wants his dad pissed off because his dad kills other hitmen ("take care of the take care") Then Trent goes on to say that his dad's friends were originally supposed to carry out what he is planning, but since they absconded with the money his dad supposedly paid them, he needs money to pay someone to help him carry it out. Notice he is not demanding payment for his services, he is saying he needs money to pay others to help him.]

---

116 Exhibit 30, p. 31 (000650). 5/25/02, 5:10pm; CD# 000038, 000008; Transcript pages 000500-000522, 000643-000655; Recording length 42:09, 42:49; 23:19, 51:46; at 16:34.

CI [Trent] I'm like I don't know why but... so my dad was just like he's looking out for me you know what I'm saying and he's got a lot of money in this dog

[Now Trent is saying his dad has a lot of money in this. This doesn't make any sense, but it contradicts Trent's assertions that he was being paid by Conway or Horton.]

---

117 Exhibit 20, p. 6 (000371). 5/21/02; CD# 000003; Tape# 02149; Transcript pages 000364-000392; at 12:00.

CI [Trent] He has his way, see originally it was supposed to be his dudes that was taking care of this shit down here but nobody seems to know where they are at, so my dad, my dad loaned me 20 gran on Jimmy's [Conway] word to take care of his shit and a we don't know where they are at

---

[Trent is telling Horton that his dad originally paid \$20,000 to his friends to do what Trent is now planning, but the absconded with Trent's dad's money.]

---

118 3118 TT Vol. I, at 174 and 177.

119 3118 TT Vol. III, at 284.

120 Exhibit 36, Trent's May 26, 2002 interview at 13.

121 3118 TT Vol. III, at 319.

122 Available through federal court Pacer filing system. Detective Zach Scott's federal deposition, federal case no 3:07-cv-000345-TSB-MRM Doc#: 131 Filed: 06/09/11 Page 55-56 PAGEID #: 3337-3338.

123 3117 TT at 790; 3118 TT Vol. III, at 118.

124 Exhibit 48, Trent's April 10, 2002 letter.

125 Exhibit 46, Trent's April 4, 2002 letter.

126 Exhibit 48, Trent's April 10, 2002 letter.

127 Exhibit 35, Trent's April 25, 2002 interview, p. 5.

128 Exhibit 36, Trent's May 26, 2002 interview, p. 4.

129 Exhibit 35, Trent's April 25, 2002 interview, p. 12.

130 Exhibit 35, Trent's April 25, 2002 interview, pp. 3-4, 7, and 12.

131 Exhibit 35, Trent's April 25, 2002 interview, at 5; Exhibit 36, Trent's May 26, 2002 interview at 6; 3118 TT Vol. III, at 63.

132 Exhibit 37, Trent's 3118 TT Vol. I, at 178; 3118 TT Vol. III, at 64.

---

133 Exhibit 35, Trent's April 25, 2002 interview at 6, 7, and 10.

134 Exhibit 35, Trent's April 25, 2002 interview pp. 6 and 10.

135 Exhibit 12, p. 4 (000244). 5/17/02; CD# 000022; Tape# 02130; Transcript pages 000239-000268; Recording length 54:09, 59:47.

-This transcript reads:

CI [Trent] ok so what, you know, there, is first minute you don't want to do Shawn [Nightingale]

CI so what, so what dude you want to do. I mean wat's up with Shawn and Mike [Arthurs] with Andrew's [Dotson] \_\_\_\_\_

-The actual recording on CD # 22; tape #2130 at approximately 04:30 is as follows:

Trent: Okay, so what, he don't, so what's Jimmy [Conway], he don't want to do Shawn [Nightingale]?

Horton: Nah.

Trent: so what, so what does he want to do, I mean what's up with Shawn and Mike [Arthurs], with the Andrew [Dotson] shit?

[Trent asks Horton if Conway wants to kill Nightingale and Horton responds no.]

---

Exhibit 12, p. 27 (000267). 5/17/02; CD# 000022; Tape# 02130; Transcript pages 000239-000268; Recording length 54:09, 59:47.

-This transcript reads:

CI [Trent] Alright \_\_\_\_\_

JH [Horton] He does but he's scared dog he is afraid...

-The actual recording on CD # 22; tape #2130 at approximately 49:30 is as follows:

Trent: Alright, so you vouch for Shawn [Nightingale]?

Horton: Jim [Conway] vouches for Shawn [Nightingale].

---

Trent: He does but he's scared dog he's afraid...

[Horton makes it clear that neither he nor Conway want Nightingale killed, and Trent responds that Conway already told him that.]

---

**Exhibit 13, p. 10 (000279). 5/18/02, 02:35pm; CD# 000019; Tape# 02141; Transcript pages 000269-000284; Recording length 18:20; at 12:30.**

CI [Trent] Right okay what am I doing with Shawn [Nightingale] Jay?

CONWAY I mean I just, just leave him alone you know what I'm saying

CI so just leave him alone.

[Trent asks Conway directly what he wants to do with Nightingale and Conway says to just leave him alone.]

---

**136 Exhibit 13, p. 10 (000279). 5/18/02, 02:35pm; CD# 000019; Tape# 02141; Transcript pages 000269-000284; Recording length 18:20; at 12:30.**

CI [Trent] Right okay what am I doing with Shawn [Nightingale] Jay?

CONWAY I mean I just, just leave him alone you know what I'm saying

CI so just leave him alone.

[Trent asks Conway directly what he wants to do with Nightingale and Conway says to just leave him alone.]

---

**137** **Need this actual recording.**

**6. Exhibit 14, p. 11 (000296-000297). 5/18/02, 06:01pm; CD# 000029; Tape# 02142; Transcript pages 000285-000301; Recording length 15:40 39:05 at 10:46.**

-This transcript reads:

CI [Trent] Man, don't, what the fuck is up with Sean, I don't know about, you know what I'm saying.

CONWAY Man, he says that he never done nothing for, for him to be in any serious trouble  
\_\_\_\_\_ I don't think he would never  
snitch no matter what really, I mean in my heart, but he's never, in order for

---

there to even be any doubt in my mind, he has to do a couple things that's real serious shit, you know what I'm saying?

-The actual recording on CD # 29; tape #2142 at approximately 10:25 is as follows:

Trent: Man, don't, what the fuck is up with Sean, I don't know about you, you know what I'm saying.

Conway: Man, he just, he ain't never done nothing for, for him to be in any serious trouble, or facing any serious time. That's the only reason why... I don't think he would never snitch no matter what really, I mean in my heart but, he's never, in order for there to even be any doubt in my mind, he has to do a couple things that's real serious shit, you know what I'm saying? ... I mean I trust him with everything you know...

Trent: Right.

[Conway explains to Trent that he doesn't want him to do anything to Nightingale because Nightingale has never done anything to get in any serious trouble.]

---

<sup>138</sup> See Exhibit 14 page 11 missing between (000296 and 000297).

<sup>139</sup> 3118 TT Vol. III, at 79.

<sup>140</sup> Exhibit 36, Trent's May 26, 2002 interview pp. 5-6, and 8; Arthurs was arrested on 3/28/02.

<sup>141</sup> Exhibit 35, Trent's April 25, 2002 interview p. 7.

<sup>142</sup> 3118 TT Vol. III, at 105-106; 3117 TT at 788.

<sup>143</sup> 1153 TT at 1843, 1844, and 1848.

<sup>144</sup> Exhibit 36, Trent's May 26, 2002 interview at 12; Closing 3117 TT at 978.

<sup>145</sup> Exhibit 24, p. 3 (000455). 5/23/02, 4:30pm; CD# 000024; Tape# 02158; Transcript pages 000452-000465; Recording length 14:49 38:55; at 02:40.

CI [Trent] Hey listen, get a hold of Jamie [Horton] for me alright because he is suppose to go and see Jimmy [Conway] tonight.

Brittany Um I am about to go and meet up with Jamie and go see him.

---

CI            No don't go yet I need to see him.

Brittany     I am not going right now I've got to go and take a shower and stuff.

CI            What I am saying is this Brittany I need to see Jimmy. I've got something

Brittany     If you need to go down there then go.

CI            Well I am saying I am just going to meet Jamie down there like about 8:30  
because I need to talk to Jamie.

Brittany     No he's planning on going at 6. You want to go.

CI            Tell him I said to go at 8:30 fuck what he's saying.

[Conversation with Britnee Stollings, Conway's girlfriend. Trent is demanding to go visit Conway. It is obvious from this conversation that until this point, Trent had no intention of visiting Conway.]

---

**146** Exhibit 24, p. 10 (000462). 5/23/02, 4:30pm; CD# 000024; Tape# 02158; Transcript pages 000452-000465; Recording length 14:49 38:55.

-This transcript reads:

Unknown Caller [Conway]    are you comin down here

CI [Trent]     Because I need to holler at you and I can't holler at you. I got something else done.

-The actual recording on CD # 24; tape #2158 at approximately 11:20 is as follows:

Conway:        Are you coming down here?

Trent:          Yeah.

Conway:        Why?

Trent:          Because I need to holler at you and I can't holler at you. I got something else done.

---

[Conway wants to know why Trent is coming to visit him.]

---

---

147 Exhibit 53, Scott's 3118 TT Vol. I, at 73 and 91. Trent corroborates this 3118 TT Vol. III, at 80.

148 Exhibit 35, Trent's April 25, 2002 interview, p.8.

149 Exhibit 35, Trent's April 25, 2002 interview, p. 11.

150 5/17/02, pp. 8-9 (000237-000238) 02:35pm; CD# 000011 Tape# 02140; Transcript pages (000229-000238); Recording length 18:30; at 17:00.

HORTON Hello

CI [Trent] *Hey big dog*

HORTON What's up man

CI Hey tell him get a message to Jimmy [Conway] that we called him through Sissicro [Cicero] he can't do it until after like until hi to call me like 2:30

HORTON 2:30

CI Yeah tell him to have Sissicro just call me like 2:30

HORTON You want that phone call tomorrow

CI Yeah tell Jimmy to call me through him tomorrow at like 2:30

HORTON Alright

[Trent tells Horton to have Conway call him through his attorney Chris Cicero the following day at 2:30. Horton then must've set up the call because Conway was in jail and could not call Cicero directly.]

---

151 Exhibit 13, p. 10 (000279). 5/18/02, 02:35pm; CD# 000019; Tape# 02141; Transcript pages 000269-000284; Recording length 18:20; at 12:30.

CI [Trent] Right okay what am I doing with Shawn [Nightingale] Jay?

CONWAY I mean I just, just leave him alone you know what I'm saying

CI so just leave him alone.

---

[Trent asks Conway directly what he wants to do with Nightingale and Conway says to just leave him alone.]

---

**152** 1153 TT at 1840 and 2352;

**Exhibit 14, p. 11-12 (000297). 5/18/02, 06:01pm; CD# 000029; Tape# 02142; Transcript pages 000285-000301; Recording length 15:40 39:05; at 11:25.**

Conway I don't... I ...I'm not really worried about it... Brian [McWhorter] can't do nothing

[Conway is explaining to Trent that he isn't worried about Brian McWhorter testifying. This page of the transcripts is missing, but you can see the end of this part of the conversation on page 12 (000297).]

---

**153** Exhibit 16, p. 1 (000309). 5/19/02; CD# 000015; Tape# 02144; Transcript pages 000307-000324; Recording length 19:30, 30:23; at 00:20.

Horton Hey, I just now left there and he [Cicero], he said that you, he really ain't in to meeting no one but if you want to mail it or just give it to me and let me take it to him it's all good

C.I. [Trent] Okay.

[Horton tells Trent that he just met with Chris Cicero and Cicero doesn't want to meet Trent.]

---

**Exhibit 16, p. 6 (000314). 5/19/02; CD# 000015; Tape# 02144; Transcript pages 000307-000324; Recording length 19:30, 30:23; at 00:20; at 08:10.**

C.I. [Trent] Um what the fuck is up with Chris [Cicero] dog, this mother fucker don't want to see me, don't trust me or what, what the fuck?

CONWAY I don't know, I mean, did you uh, I don't know, I don't know what's going on I haven't talked to him either

[Trent is mad because Chris Cicero refuses to meet him. Conway says he doesn't know anything about it because he hasn't talked to Cicero.]

---

**Exhibit 16, p. 7 (000315). 5/19/02; CD# 000015; Tape# 02144; Transcript pages 000307-000324; Recording length 19:30, 30:23; at 00:20; at 09:00.**

C.I. [Trent] I told him [Horton] look, I need some money to take care of that shit in Chillicothe dog, know what I'm saying and I wanted to meet with Cicero my

---

mother fucking self, I'm not getting ready to let this shit, I don't know what them dudes are going to do with that shit when it leaves my hands man

CONWAY Yeah I know

C.I. You feel me? I mean, if you trust them, I don't fucking know them dog

CONWAY \_\_\_\_\_ but I don't know, it shouldn't be that big of a deal should

C.I. That's my point exactly, they're acting like it's some big operative mission, I'm not, I'm not getting ready to let Jamie [Horton] walk away with that, I'm not going to, either I can give it to Chris [Cicero] or we gotta or you got to tell Chris to get his fucking panties out of a knot man, I'm not going through this bullshit man, I don't have time for this fucking aggravation

[Continuation. Trent is still expressing his anger because Chris Cicero refuses to meet him. Conway still hasn't talked to Cicero and doesn't know what is happening.]

---

**Exhibit 27, p. 19-20 (000542-000543). 5/24/02, 3:00pm; CD# 000037; Tape# 02160; Transcript pages 000523-000546; Recording length 30:28, 31:58; at 26:10.**

CI [Trent] hey, look man, I talked to fucking Cicero and he wanted to get with me in like a couple hours and then I guess Jamie [Horton] talked to him tonight, he Don't want to get with me I need to get with him dog, I don't know if Jamie and them is fucking scaring him off or I'm trying to get Jamie and them out of the picture so I can deal with this shit on my own, see what I'm saying

[Trent persists in trying to force Chris Cicero to meet with him, obviously at Det. Scott's urging. Trent complains to Conway that Cicero will not meet with him. He claims Cicero wanted to meet with him but Horton interfered, but all Cicero said before was to call him back in a couple hours, not that he wanted to meet with Trent.]

---

**Exhibit 27, p. 20 (000543). 5/24/02, 3:00pm; CD# 000037; Tape# 02160; Transcript pages 000523-000546; Recording length 30:28, 31:58; at 27:10.**

CI [Trent] I mean really it's not, that's why I need to holler at Cicero man cause I got some shit I'm gonna do but I need to holler at Cicero first, tell him to get his fucking head out of his ass dog \_\_\_\_\_ [he's the sleeziest one] out of the whole fuckng crew,

[Trent expressing his anger to Conway that Cicero refuses to meet with him.]

---

---

**Exhibit 27, p. 21 (000544). 5/24/02, 3:00pm; CD# 000037; Tape# 02160; Transcript pages 000523-000546; Recording length 30:28, 31:58; at 28:00.**

CI [Trent] that's what I'm saying, I don't like to keep going around and around, I'm trying to get this to where it's me, you and fucking Cicero, so tell him to get off his fucking dick and get on his \_\_\_\_\_ [job].

---

[More of Trent expressing his anger to Conway that Cicero won't meet with him.]

---

Also see 5/17/02, CD# 000022, page 11 (000251); at 18:00; 5/18/02, CD# 000019, page 14 (000283); at 18:00; 5/24/02, CD# 000016\*, 000017\*\*, 000027\*\*\*, page 1 (000622, 00642); at 00:58\*, 15:25\*\*, 00:45\*\*\*; 5/24/02, CD# 000016\*, 000017\*\*, 000027\*\*\*, page 2 (000623, 00630); at 06:30\*, 19:53\*\*, 05:32\*\*\*.

**154 Exhibit 27, p. 9-10 (000532-000533). 5/24/02, 3:00pm; CD# 000037; Tape# 02160; Transcript pages 000523-000546; Recording length 30:28, 31:58; at 14:40.**

CI [Trent] is Cicero there

CICERO This is he

CI ok, well a, I'm just, I'm a friend, I'm supposed to do something for Jimmy [Conway]

CICERO ok, \_\_\_\_\_ I have a client drop off box or you can mail it, one or the other

CI well was you gonna see Jimmy today

CICERO tomorrow

CI tomorrow

CICERO he waiting for a letter from me

CI well he's got the letter today I believe

CICERO alright, I just talked to his girlfriend \_\_\_ about an hour ago, she said he did which is ok, I mean he can call me, but gonna see him either tomorrow or Sunday, have to definitely this weekend, we have court on Tuesday

CI right, a, well it's, if you want to be honest about some shit, but I, I don't think \_\_\_\_\_ [Here at 15:30 the recording says, "He [Conway] wanted me to holler at you about some shit, but I'm not comfortable with the phone so."

CICERO alright, a, I'm getting ready to leave here, why don't you just give me a call back can you give me a call back her in a couple hours or so

---

CI            yeah, that's cool

CICERO        alright

CI            alright Chris, bye

---

[Trent calls Cicero directly and tells him Conway wanted Trent to contact Cicero.]

---

**155 Exhibit 27, p. 8 (000531). 5/24/02, 3:00pm; CD# 000037; Tape# 02160; Transcript pages 000523-000546; Recording length 30:28, 31:58; at 12:40.**

CI [Trent]     well, ok, well that's what I'm saying, I need to do stroke with Cicero, you know what I'm sayin

CONWAY       well a, I don't know, I, I been trying to get, as soon as I get ahold of him I'll tell him

CI            tell him that I need to talk to him dog, it's like major league important

CONWAY       ok

---

[Trent tells Conway he needs to talk to Cicero.]

---

**Exhibit 27, p. 10 (000533). 5/24/02, 3:00pm; CD# 000037; Tape# 02160; Transcript pages 000523-000546; Recording length 30:28, 31:58; at 12:40.**

CI [Trent]     I'm just talking to Cicero

Female [Britnee Stollings]    what he'd say

CI            a, I'm going to be meeting with him in a couple hours

Female        area you

CI            yeah

Female        That's good I just talked to J a minute ago

---

[Trent lies to Britnee Stollings, Conway's girlfriend, and says Cicero agreed to meet him in a couple hours. Cicero told Trent to call back in a couple hours, not that they would meet.]

---

---

**156** Exhibit 25, p. 6 (000479). 5/23/02; CD# 000007, 000032; Tape# 02157; Transcript pages 000473-000494, 000637-000641; 19:50.

CI [Trent] Dog he [Cicero] don't want um he's just like I don't know what's up with him I mean I don't know it's like he don't trust me or something I feel like I feel like I just getting *played* stupid dog and you know I don't like that

MALE 2 [Conway] Don't fuck with him I don't know you don't need his help

[Trent is mad because Chris Cicero will not meet with him. Conway way tells him to leave Cicero alone.]

---

**157** Exhibit 27, p. 13 (000536). 5/24/02, 3:00pm; CD# 000037; Tape# 02160; Transcript pages 000523-000546; Recording length 30:28, 31:58; at 19:50

Jamie [Horton] Hey uh I talked to the person [Cicero] you were gonna meet in a couple hours

CI [Trent] yeah

Jamie He don't want to, he's not gonna meet you

CI he doesn't have no choice, a, dog, I go myself, fuck him

[Horton tells Trent that Chris Cicero isn't going to meet with him and Trent says that Cicero doesn't have any choice.]

---

**158** Exhibit 29, p. 5-6 (000551-000552). 5/25/02; CD# 000035; Tape# 02171; Transcript pages 000547-000561; Recording length 14:36, 38:13; at 05:40.

CI [Trent] Right are you still on 8?

CONWAY Yeah

CI Okay

CONWAY And uh, if uh, if not I'll talk to Chris [Cicero]\_\_\_\_\_

CI Well I'm going to see him Tuesday anyway

CONWAY Alright

---

CI            So, he don't know it, but I am, I'm tired of playing his little fucking pussy boy games

---

**159 Exhibit 16, p. 4 (000312). 5/19/02; CD# 000015; Tape# 02144; Transcript pages 000307-000324; Recording length 19:30, 30:23; at 03:40.**

HORTON      So, so whenever we meet up or whatever you going to let me get that

C.I. [Trent]   I could probably give you a copy of it yeah

HORTON      And that way I could just shoot it down to Chris [Cicero]

C.I.            Right, well see, I was thinking if I just

HORTON      It's Jimmy [Conway] that's because he wants to get one to the Prosecutors

C.I.            Well see what I was going to do, I was going to mail him right, this is how I'm supposed to mail Cicero one, wait a day, then one to the Prosecutor, wait a day, and mail one to the Attorney General

HORTON      To where?

C.I.            To the Attorney Generals, that's like, she oversees all criminal shit, you know what I'm saying, if I, if I do it like that, if they get it by the mail it's probably better because he could show in the evidence that somebody just anonymously mailed the shit to him, you know what I'm saying, instead of them saying well...

HORTON      Well see, well I mean it don't matter

C.I.            Couse otherwise they're going to say, you know aske Cicero, like where did you get the tape at you know what I'm saying?

HORTON      Yeah, that's true

C.I.            I he just says they mailed it then

HORTON      Alright, that's cool, you already have the copies made

C.I.            Well I got two of them made, I'm about to go make the other one her in a second.

[Trent describing to Horton how he is going to mail the confession he made to the prosecutor and others.]

---

---

**160** Exhibit 16, p. 12 (000320). 5/19/02; CD# 000015; Tape# 02144; Transcript pages 000307-000324; Recording length 19:30, 30:23; at 16:00.

HORTON Well uh you know what he gave me another idea talking about dude or whatever with the tape

C.I. [Trent] Yeah video, the video shit

HORTON Yeah he's talking Chris [Cicero], the Prosecutor and the news

C.I. Send one to Chris, the Prosecutor and the news?

HORTON Yeah

C.I. Okay, that's slick

---

[Trent and Horton describing where to mail the video confession Trent made.]

---

**161** **Need actual recording here.** Exhibit 28, 5/24/02, CD# 000016\*, 000017\*\*, 000027\*\*\*, page 1 (000622, 000642); at 03:55\*, 17:48\*\*, 03:36\*\*\*

**162** Identical statement made in Exhibit 36, Trent's May 26, 2002 interview, p. 9.

Statement of Witness Ronald Trent dated 5/24/02

...during conversations about what steps Conway wanted taken to eliminate witness's I asked Horton why they "Conway & crew" wanted me to "do" Ron O'Brien? Horton stated "Just do it, trust me its all gonna be good." I said okay fine...

**163** Statement of Witness by Ronald Trent dated 5/15/02.

James Conway & myself were locked up at F.C.C. #1 [The Franklin County Jail] together in 8-N-R. Conway & I were discussing people he wanted me to kill because he said if all his witness's were gone he would walk out of jail. During our discussions Conway said he want his prosecutor "Sheryl Prichard" killed. He said someone was watching her & stated he already knew she drove a gray Jeep Cherokee liscense plate #AVN-1160.

**164** Exhibit 36, Trent's May 26, 2002 interview, pp. 8-9.

**165** Accessible through federal court Pacer system Ron O'Brien's deposition 3:07-cv-00345-TSB-MRM Doc #: 59 Filed 04/13/10 Page: 41-42 PAGEID #: 1166-1167.

---

**166** Accessible through federal court Pacer system. Ron O'Brien's deposition 3:07-cv-00345-TSB-MRM Doc #: 59 Filed 04/13/10 Page: 41-46 PAGEID #: 1166-1171.

**167** Exhibit 63 Newspaper article on O'Brien receiving protection, p. 1.

**168** Exhibit 36, Trent's May 26, 2002 interview, p. 13.

**169** Exhibit 36, Trent's May 26, 2002 interview, p. 13-14.

**170** Exhibit 35, Trent's April 25, 2002 interview, p. 6.

**171** Exhibit 35, Trent's April 25, 2002 interview, p. 12.

**172** 3117 TT at 366.

**173** 3117 TT at 369.

**174** 3117 TT at 369-370, and 376.

**175** 1153 TT at 1825; Exhibit 39, Trent's 3117 PTT at 98 and 103; 3117 TT at 728, 749, 773, and 775; 3118 TT Vol. III at 51.

**176** 1153 TT at 1825.

**177** 3117 TT at 749.

**178** Exhibit 20, p. 5 (000370). 5/21/02; CD# 000003; Tape# 02149; Transcript pages 000364-000392.

-This transcript reads:

Jamie [Horton] then why was you down in the county for

CI [Trent] just now, for my parole violation, that and letting a \_\_\_\_\_  
Laughing

Jamie funny

---

CI Oh, it's funny as a mother fucker

-The actual recording on CD # 3; tape #2149 at approximately 10:20 is as follows:

Horton: then why was you down in the county for

Trent: just now? For my parole violation. That and letting a bitch suck pit bull dicks for crack. (Laughing.)

Horton: That's funny?

CI: Oh, it's funny as a mother fucker

---

[Trent telling Horton why he was in the Franklin County jail this most recent.]

---

**179** 3117 TT at 778.

**180** Exhibit 43 and 44, Cone messages. Attachment to Detective Zach Scott's federal deposition, federal case no 3:07-cv-00345-TBS-MRM Doc#: 131-1 Filed 06/09/11 at 6-7 PAGEID #:3347-3348; Exhibit 42, letter to O'Brien from Trent. Attachment to Detective Zach Scott's federal deposition, federal case no 3:07-cv-00345-TBS-MRM Doc#: 131-1 Filed 06/09/11 at 1 PAGEID #:3342.

**181** Exhibit 45, Note from Gravett to Cone re: Devillers wanting them to speak with Trent. Attachment to Detective Zach Scott's federal deposition, federal case no 3:07-cv-00345-TBS-MRM Doc#: 131-1 Filed 06/09/11 at 8 PAGEID #:3349.

**182** 3117 TT at 777-778.

Statement of Witness Ronald Trent dated 5/18/02

James Conway & myself were locked up together in F.C.C. #1 in 8-N-R-1, we were in the gym and Conway was called to a visit. Upon returning to 8-N-R from his visit I asked Conway who came to see him? Conway started laughing & stated "That was Andrews mom, that stupid bitch actually thinks I'm gonna tell her I killed that piece of shit, I said who? And he said Andrew.

**183** 3117 TT at 776.

**184** Accessible through federal court Pacer system. Trent's federal deposition case #3:07-cv-00345-TBS-MRM Doc#: 61 Filed 04/13/10 at 38 PAGEID #:1293.

---

185 3117 TT at 979.

186 3117 TT at 979.

187 The ABC documentary originally aired August 1, 2012 and is entitled "Final Witness: A mother's revenge" It can be found on YouTube under the URL:  
[https://m.youtube.com/watch?v=9zqphzGeluM&list=PLt\\_a9ZHUXYqQWilp-Pdhcns-FQWlfuusi&index=1&pp=iAQB](https://m.youtube.com/watch?v=9zqphzGeluM&list=PLt_a9ZHUXYqQWilp-Pdhcns-FQWlfuusi&index=1&pp=iAQB).

188 Accessible through federal court Pacer system. Trent's federal deposition case #3:07-cv-00345-TBS-MRM Doc#: 61 Filed 04/13/10 at 38 PAGEID #:1293.

189 3117 TT at 895-896.

190 3117 TT at 897-898.

191 *State v. Trent*, Franklin County, Ohio Common Pleas case no 04 CR 005159.

192 Based primarily on Exhibit 41, prosecutors' closing arguments: 1153 TT at 2534 and 2628.

193 1153 TT at 1108-1110.

194 1153 TT at 1108

195 1153 TT at 2548.

196 1153 TT at 1422-1423.

197 1153 TT at 2611, 2625-2626.

198 1153 TT at 1446.

199 1153 TT at 1738.

200 1153 TT at 2544.

---

201 Put all the pictures we have here and use the surveillance footage to make the ones we don't the same way.

202 1153 TT at 1968-1969.

203 1153 TT at 2548.

204 1153 TT at 1422-1423.

205 Photo of gun case here.

206 This ballistic report was specifically requested and all agencies refused to provide it. It is currently subject of a request for a court order demanding its production. *Hambel v. Franklin County Prosecutors Office, et. al.*, Ohio Supreme Court docket 2024-1689.

207 1153 TT at 1327.

208 Diagram here.

209 Relevant crime scene photo.

210 Relevant crime scent photo.

211 Photo of parking lot where light pole is visible in front of cruiser 181.

212 1153 TT pp. 1337-1357.

213 Jim Lowe closing 1153 TT at 2626.

214 Reconstruction here.

215 Exhibit 46 and 48 Trent's April 4, 2002 and April 10, 2002 letters.

216 Exhibit 39, Trent's 3117 PTT at 80-81.

---

217 Exhibit 27, p. 7 (000530). 5/24/02, 3:00pm; CD# 000037; Tape# 02160; Transcript pages 000523-000546; Recording length 30:28, 31:58.

CI [Trent] cause I got a, I got a beautiful plan dog

[Trent is telling Conway that he has a "beautiful plan", but doesn't say what the plan is. This plan is to make a video of someone confessing to killing Andrew Dotson. Trent clearly comes up with this plan, but eventually he says it was Conway's idea.]

---

218 ~~Written Statement of Witness Ronald Trent dated 5/24/02~~

...I told Shawn that Jimmy wants me to whack him, I then told him I have a plan to keep him alive & keep Jimmy happy. I told him I could make a video of someone confessing to Andrews murder like I did with Dockside Dolls...

219 Exhibit 37, 3118 TT Vol. I, at 211.

220 Exhibit 48, Trent's April 10, 2002 letter.

221 Exhibit 35, Trent's April 25, 2002 interview, p. 5.

222 Exhibit 36, Trent's May 26, 2002 interview, p. 4.

223 Exhibit 12, p. 1 (000241). 5/17/02; CD# 000022; Tape# 02130; Transcript pages 000239-000268; Recording length 54:09, 59:47; 00:40.

JH [Horton] ~~find him~~ Brian find him, then we'll, \_\_\_ just told me \_\_\_\_\_ that's a fact, that's all, Brian done told 4 different stories \_\_\_\_\_ know what I'm saying, he told, he told \_\_\_ 3 stories that Shawn [Nightingale] beat him up, then he told the story that \_\_\_ didn't do it so *it aint gonna hold up*

[Horton is telling Trent that Brian McWhorter told so many different stories about what happened at Dockside that Conway isn't worried about him.]

---

224 1153 TT at 1840 and 2352;

---

Exhibit 14, p. 11-12 (000297). 5/18/02, 06:01pm; CD# 000029; Tape# 02142; Transcript pages 000285-000301; Recording length 15:40 39:05; at 11:25.

Conway I don't... I ...I'm not really worried about it... Brian [McWhorter] can't do nothing

[Conway is explaining to Trent that he isn't worried about Brian McWhorter testifying. This page of the transcripts is missing, but you can see the end of this part of the conversation on page 12 (000297).]

---

Exhibit 25, p. 7 (000480). 5/23/02; CD# 000007\*, 000032\*\*; Tape# 02157; Transcript pages 000473-000494, 000637-000641; at 19:40\*\*.

CI [Trent] Yeah, yeah that was just a little cover thing for you but it wasn't there so I'm like fuck it don't need this shit I mean he said he said um Brian [McWhorter] goes home but he's always with a big no neck mother fucker

Male 2 [Conway] Really

CI Yeah so

Male 2 chris [Cicero] said he ain't worried about him

[Conway tells Trent that his attorney Chris Cicero isn't worried about Brian McWhorter testifying.]

---

225 1153 TT at 2545.

226 1153 TT at 1820.

227 Exhibit 36, Trent's May 26, 2002 interview at 3.

228 Find surveillance footage of taillights of Britnee Stollings's 2000 Chevy Blazer.

229 1153 TT at 1186, 1227, and 1474.

230 Surveillance picture.

231 Surveillance picture.

- 
- 232 Surveillance picture.
- 233 David Baker Affidavit.
- 234 Police Report from David Baker's house.
- 235 Surveillance picture.
- 236 Williams says he arrived with Marvin Harris and Dave Hawkins, (1153 at 1497 and first page of William's second interview, marked p. 616); Says he arrived with a .45 in his car (1153 at 1532-1533); Says he arrived with a "razor with a black handle" (1153 TT at 1544 and third page of Williams's second interview, marked p. 619).
- 237 Surveillance picture.
- 238 Identifies car as having license plate #CSQ6099, third page of Williams's second interview, marked p. 619.
- 239 Dockside parking lot diagram here.
- 240 1153 TT pp. 1222-1223.
- 241 1153 TT at 1257.
- 242 1153 TT at 1260-1262.
- 243 1153 TT at 1262.
- 244 1153 TT at 1270-1272.
- 245 1153 TT at 1240.
- 246 1153 TT at 1237.
- 247 1153 TT at 2093-2095.

- 
- 248 1153 TT at 2096-2100.
- 249 1153 TT at 2096.
- 250 1153 TT at 1507.
- 251 1153 TT at 2100.
- 252 Summary of Williams interview.
- 253 1153 TT at 1544; "razor with a black handle" third page of Williams's second interview, marked p. 619.
- 254 1153 TT at 1186, 1227, and 1474.
- 255 1153 TT at 1463-1466.
- 256 1153 TT at 1148 and 1245
- 257 1153 TT at 1508, 1513, and 1518-1519.
- 258 1153 TT at 2092.
- 259 1153 TT at 2541.
- 260 Exhibit 36, Trent's May 26, 2002 interview at 3; 1153 TT at 1820 and 1876.
- 261 1153 TT at 1241.
- 262 Williams's interviews here.
- 263 Medical report that Williams was shot in the left shoulder.
- 264 1153 TT at 1152, 1162, 1195, and 1618.

---

265 1153 TT at 1446.

266 Williams's interview.

267 Exhibit 35, Trent's April 25, 2002 interview, at 3; 3117 TT at 732-733; 3118 TT at 77.

268 Exhibit 51, Arthurs's May 23, 2002 interview at 6; 3118 TT Vol. II, at 219-220, and 269; and 3117 TT at 503, 577, and 583.

269 Exhibit 66 Nightingale's post-conviction testimony, 3117 PCT at 19; Exhibit 32, p. 4 (000574). 5/25/02; CD# 000033; Tape# 02168; Transcript pages 000571-000589; Recording length 34:03, 36:05.

-This transcript reads:

CI [Trent] Alright, so you all picked dude up, feed him the mother fucking

NIGNTENGALE \_\_\_\_\_

CI Well whatever, Vicadins whatever

-The actual recording on CD # 33; tape #2168 approximately 04:40 is as follows:

CI Alright, so you all picked dude up, feed him the mother fucking...

NIGNTENGALE Nah, wasn't nothing fed to him at all.

CI Well he ate them, whatever. Vicadins whatever

[Trent tries to tell Nightingale that Dotson was fed pills, but Nightingale said that never happened.]

---

270 Exhibit 57, Nightingale's May 28, 2002 interrogation, p. 6; Exhibit 51, Arthurs's May 23, 2002 interview, p. 6.

271 Exhibit 35, Trent's April 25, 2002 interview, at 3; 3117 TT at 732-733; 3118 TT Vol. III, at 77.

---

**272** Exhibit 12, p. 25 (000265). 5/17/02; CD# 000022; Tape# 02130; Transcript pages 000239-000268; Recording length 54:09, 59:47.

CI [Trent]      What do you think about whoever did Andrew [Dotson] get him to confess as insurance you know what I'm saying can't hurt so

JH [Horton]      That's some gangster shit

CI                That's what I'm saying you know he told me that Mike [Arthurs] just stood on his neck until he died and I know that's bull shit you know what I'm saying but I didn't call Jay [Conway] on it I just told him I said look I mean I heard a few a few different things and what I'm telling

JH                That's what happened

CI                That's what happened but I mean you hear so much shit man so he really wasn't lying to me hugh cause I told him Jimmy [Conway] what the fuck you trying to find me stupid

[Trent originates the idea of getting "whoever did Andrew" to confess, showing that it was understood that Conway did not kill Dotson. Then Trent goes on to explain that Conway told him Arthurs killed Dotson by standing on Dotson's neck, directly contradicting what he told detectives that Conway confessed to killing Dotson. Horton agrees that Arthurs killed Dotson.]

---

**273** 3117 TT at 552.

**274** Exhibit 35, Trent's April 25, 2002 interview p. 2;  
Exhibit 30, p. 23 (000522). 5/25/02, 5:10pm; CD# 000038, 000008; Transcript pages 000500-000522, 000643-000655; Recording length 42:09, 42:49; 23:19, 51:46; at 40:45

HORTON [Nightingale]      There's people around here that Jamie [Horton] Ill fix you up  
\_\_\_\_\_ everybody in his [Arthurs] family all of his brothers his mom his  
dad his cousin

CI [Trent]      He [Arthurs] got a cousin in the south end

HORTON  
\_\_\_\_\_

CI                I already know where they live at

---

[This conversation is actually between Trent and Nightingale, not Horton. Nightingale refers to Horton in the first line. They are talking about Arthurs telling his brothers and mom and dad that he killed Dotson. Horton doesn't have any brother. Trent tells Nightingale that Arthurs has a cousin in the south end just as he told Scott in his interview referenced in this foot note. Trent also says he already knows where Arthurs's family lives.]

---

275 Exhibit 58, Nightingale's August 12, 2002 proffer at 43.

276 Exhibit 50, Arthur's May 13, 2002 summary of interview.

277 3118 TT Vol. II, at 246.

278 Exhibit 50, May 13, 2002 interview summary, Arthurs never mentioned standing on Dotson's neck in this interview (see 3118 TT Vol. IV, at 95), he later admitted it (Exhibit 51, May 23, 2002 interview, at 7; 3118 TT Vol. II, at 225, 227, and 278; 3118 TT Vol. IV, at 95, 97, and 103, 3117 TT at 511).

279 Exhibit 35, Trent's April 25, 2002 interview, at 3; 3117 TT at 794-795.

280 3117 TT at 511.

281 3118 TT Vol. III, at 238; Arthurs talks about this at 3117 TT at 537-538.

282 Exhibit 66 Nightingale's post-conviction testimony, 3117 PCT at 41, Arthurs confessed to Joey Spencer  
Exhibit 21, p. 5 (000397). 5/21/02; CD# 000031; Tape# 02148; Transcript pages 000393-000399; at 08:40.

Male 1 [Nightingale] \_\_\_\_\_-everybody in the world is telling me \_\_\_\_ he never said nothing \_\_\_\_\_ Jason Woodruff went to the cops, wrote a statement saying \_\_\_\_\_

C.I. Who the fuck is Jason Woodrow

Male 1 He's the fucking bitch, and I'd like to fucking kill him. I beat his ass.

Calvin Horton \_\_\_\_\_ Somebody that don't know shit, that hasn't seen shit, you know what I mean, *that dont* fucking *know* so

---

C.I. If Mike's running his... even Mike's just talking to him, that's something you shouldn't talk to no fucking body about. Certain things don't need to be talked about, when they're done, they're done, leave 'em at that.

[Nightingale tells Trent that Arthurs bragged to Jason Woodruff, at one time a friend of Nightingale's from Chillicothe, about killing Dotson and Woodruff told police.]

---

283 3117 TT at 901.

284 3117 TT at 900-912.

285 3118 TT Vol. IV, at 98.

286 Exhibit 54, Scott 3118 TT Vol. III, p. 284.

287 Exhibit 19, p. 9 (000353). 5/20/02; CD# 000005; Transcript pages 000328, 000345-000355; Recording length 18:30; at 14:40.

CI [Trent] But other than that, I'm cool, know what I'm saying and uh, I think it would be better man, once we go down there and you show me who them dudes are and shit, hook me up with Sean [Nightingale], tell him not going to whack him though, just, I give you my word, know what I'm saying, you vouch for Sean and if something happens with Sean, I'm going to come see you

Jamie Horton Alright

CI And you already know I'm not playing, so

...

Jamie Horton That's why I had a feeling that's why I don't want to go with you

[Trent tells Horton that because Horton doesn't want Trent to kill Nightingale, if Nightingale does something Trent doesn't like, Trent will kill Horton. Horton explains that is why he did not want to go with Trent on the trip to Chillicothe.]

---

---

288 Exhibit 25, p. 20 (000493). 5/23/02; CD# 000007, 000032; Tape# 02157; Transcript pages 000473-000494, 000637-000641; at 34:50.

CI [Trent] I mean dog tell me right now let's stop bull shitting what's up with Shawn [Nightingale].

Male 2 [Conway] He don't really know nothing

CI Hugh

Male 2 whats he know about all this

CI He knows what I'm here for

Male 2 Does he know I man does he know anything that's what I'm saying I don't know

CI Don't get me caught up though because he you know what I'm saying cause you let your emotions get involved this ain't personal it's business so you know what I'm saying you need to cut your losses or you take a gamble I'm taking gamble enough right now don't you

[Trent brings up Nightingale for the fifth time during this visit and persists that Nightingale be killed because Nightingale is aware of what Trent is doing, though Conway is not. Trent says he believes Nightingale should be killed because Trent only trusts Conway and Horton.]

---

289 Exhibit 16, p. 5 (000313). 5/19/02; CD# 000015; Tape# 02144; Transcript pages 000307-000324; Recording length 19:30, 30:23; at 03:40; at 05:00.

C.I. [Trent] Alright, tell him uh, tell him \_\_\_\_\_ just tell him to give me a call, cause I called Brittany and told her to tell Jimmy [Conway] that he's starting to piss me off, just tell Jimmy me and you talked or I'll tell him when he calls me.

[Trent is pissed off at Conway because Conway isn't doing what he wants.]

---

Exhibit 16, p. 8 (000316). 5/19/02; CD# 000015; Tape# 02144; Transcript pages 000307-000324; Recording length 19:30, 30:23.

C.I. [Trent] Then we ain't got to worry about nothing, cause I mean I need to talk to you dog, I don't, I don't like the way this shit's going down, and I'm not getting ready to get played like no fucking idiot

---

...

C.I.           Aright, well when Jamie [Horton] comes to visit you tonight man, call me and let me know what the fuck you told him that I'm in charge or whatever

[Trent is telling Conway that he wants him to tell Horton that Trent is in charge.]

---

**Exhibit 31, p. 2 (000563). 5/25/02; CD# 000034; Tape# 02171; Transcript pages 000562-000570, 000495-000498; Recording length 15:06, 79:58; at 01:00.**

JAMIE [Horton]       Jim [Conway] just told him not to talk about nothing until, until you

CI [Trent]       Till we go down and talk to him?

JAMIE       Yeah

CI       What the fuck, why is Jim fucking shit up? What's Chris talking about?

[Trent is mad because Conway is working against him.]

---

<sup>290</sup>**Exhibit 16, p. 7 (000315). 5/19/02; CD# 000015; Tape# 02144; Transcript pages 000307-000324; Recording length 19:30, 30:23.**

C.I. [Trent]       That's my point exactly, they're acting like it's some big fucking operative mission, I'm not, I'm not getting ready to let Jamie [Horton] walk away with that, I'm not going to, either I can give it to Chris or we gotta or you got to tell Chris to get his fucking panties out of a knot man, I'm not going through this bullshit man, I don't have time for this fucking aggravation

[Trent mad because Horton isn't doing what he is told.]

---

**Exhibit 33, p. 4 (000594). 5/25/02; CD# 000023; Tape# 02169; Transcript pages 000590-000598; Recording length 09:00, 09:53; at 04:40.**

CI [Trent]       Okay well then just get with Sean [Nightingale] dog and get me what I need you know what I'm saying I don't give a fuck if you got to type it write it whatever you do you know what I'm saying I mean seriously though get me what I need to know cause I'm ready to take care of this shit and between me and you dog I'm trying to get the fuck out of her man once I can get all this business taken care of for you guys and I fucking hit that lick over there split with you I'm gone you

---

know what I'm saying so the sooner you guys get me what the fuck I need the sooner I can be away from you and you can be away from me you know

...

CI They probably no they're not still there now it's raining too late alright well look man when can you guys get me what I need dog and I can stop fucking asking you about it and stop feeling like I'm getting run around the fucking board you don't have to say nothing though.

[Trent is trying to intimidate Horton into giving information about Dotson and he feels like Horton and others are giving him the run around.]

---

**291 Exhibit 31, p. 5 (000566). 5/25/02; CD# 000034; Tape# 02171; Transcript pages 000562-000570, 000495-000498; Recording length 15:06, 79:58; at 06:00.**

CI [Trent] Right, well I mean I already know, I mean that's what I'm saying dog, I mean, god damn man, if I was a mother fucking cop, from what, just from what he told me last night dog, he'd be in jail, you know what I'm saying

JAMIE [Horton] \_\_\_\_\_

CI I don't know, I mean, maybe it's just him thinking, I mean, cause I'm sure you probably thought that at first until we got to know each other

JAMIE \_\_\_\_\_

CI So I mean maybe that's just him thinking it, what I'm saying is I don't want mother fucker thinking I'm a cop and trying to whack me know what I'm saying

[Trent's lets Horton know that if he feels he is being accused of being a cop, then he thinks that means someone might try and kill him.]

---

**Exhibit 32, pp. 14-15 (000584-000585). 5/25/02; CD# 000033; Tape# 02168; Transcript pages 000571-000589; Recording length 34:03, 36:05.**

CI [Trent] I mean, it's not Shawn dog...Well listen, this is what I need you to do dog, all I need you to do is let Shawn and Jamie [Horton] know I know what the fuck I'm doing and to help me in whatever way they can, that's all I need you to do dog and no more change of plan and no more change of orders, no more change of instructions, that's all I need you to do, so can you do that?...Let's just say its' for insurance sakes, okay, I mean, I understand you feel there ain't no need for it right now, but what happens if there's a need for it later. I got it covered now...Okay, so, okay, listen, to alleviate all that shit, just do what I ask you to do

---

bro, that's all and you know I'm going to take care of the rest, you already know that. It's not just insurance for me, it's insurance for every fucking body... I mean just the thought of a mother fucker even thinking I might be a mother fucking cop, you know what I'm saying, you know how it gets me dog, you know how I am... Dog listen. I gave you my word I would do what I could to get you out of there. You gave me your word I could do this the way I want to do it, so, so let's just stick to that alright.

[If Conway, Horton, and Nightingale do not follow Trent's instructions, Trent interprets that as accusing him of being a cop, which makes Trent extremely angry.]

---

**292** Exhibit 31, p. 4 (000565). 5/25/02; CD# 000034; Tape# 02171; Transcript pages 000562-000570, 000495-000498; Recording length 15:06, 79:58; 05:30; at 04:50.

CI [Trent] Cause I'm not on that dog, that fucking for real man, for the mother fucker to even insinuate I'm a mother fucking cop dog, that \_\_\_\_\_ my easy anger

[Trent tells Horton it cause him to get angry if anyone thinks he is a cop.]

---

**293** Exhibit 31, p. 2-3 (000563-000564). 5/25/02; CD# 000034; Tape# 02171; Transcript pages 000562-000570, 000495-000498; Recording length 15:06, 79:58.

CI [Trent] He dude, I was just hollering at my dad man, fucking, I don't know, what's, what's up with Shawn [Nightingale]

JAMIE [Horton] He's cool man, he just, I mean \_\_\_\_\_ just told him to do something, that's what he's going to do

CI Do what now?

JAMIE Jim [Conway] told him not to talk about nothing until, until you \_\_\_\_\_

CI Till we go down and talk to him?

JAMIE Yeah

CI What the fuck, why is Jim fucking shit up? What's Chris talking about?

JAMIE He didn't say much \_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_ like he's her dad or something

---

---

CI For real

JAMIE Yeah

CI Hello

JAMIE What's up[

CI Uh, man fuck dog, I'm about to say fuck this whole thing man

JAMIE \_\_\_\_\_

CI Let me turn the radio down, do what now

JAMIE Is today Friday

CI Yeah, no today is Saturday

JAMIE I could talk to him tomorrow see what's up

CI Right

JAMIE \_\_\_\_\_

CI I'm just saying man, mother fuckers thinking I'm all fucking cop, fuck it dog, I'll just let you guys deal with this shit, know what I'm saying, I'm going out of my way for you guys

[Horton explains to Trent that Nightingale is not going to be talking about Dotson's death, which Trent takes as being accused of being a cop and gets mad.]

---

**Exhibit 32, p. 13 (000583). 5/25/02; CD# 000033; Tape# 02168; Transcript pages 000571-000589; Recording length 34:03, 36:05; 18:00.**

CI [Trent] Don't lie to me man, you can tell me, just tell me it's none of my business, if you don't want to tell me something, just say man, you know, that really ain't our business dog, I don't want to get into it and I'll leave it at that, I'll respect that, but don't lie to me, know what I'm saying

NIGHTENGALE I didn't lie, I just hate talking about it man / fucking feel like I'm in a bad luck for the rest of my life

CI I mean, I feel you dog but I got a job to do, know what I'm saying and I need what I need to know to do my job right

---

[Trent first tells Nightingale that Nightingale can just tell him it's none of his business, but then turns around and says Nightingale has to talk to him.]

---

294 Exhibit 53, 3118 TT Vol. I, at 59-60.

295 Exhibit 18, p. 11 (000339). 5/20/02, 4:35pm; (No recording); Transcript pages 000329-000344.

CI [Trent] tell him, tell him quit being a fucking pussy man, god damn

...

CI \_\_\_\_\_ man, I mean it's fucking, \_\_\_\_\_ fucking scared he's, it's like he's ready to piss hisself when I talk to him \_\_\_\_\_ dog.

...

CI no, he's fucking spooked, so a, look man, just tell him we'll go down there and we will be coming back

...

CI telling him quit being a bitch man, god damn, I thought he was a gangster

[Trent is mad because Horton doesn't want to go to Chillicothe with Trent.]

---

296 Exhibit 22, p. 11 (000410). 5/22/02; CD# 000026; Tape# 02150; Transcript pages 000400-000411; Recording length 21:30, 34:02.

Tony [Trent]: Yeah we'll just, we'll holler tomorrow man.

Jamie [Horton]: All right that's cool.

Tony: All right Jamie I'll holler at you.

Jamie: All right.

Tony: Later

Dude he is so fuckin scared its unbelievable. Its on tape.

[Trent is talking into the recording and could not be talking to Horton. This statement is meant for Scott.]

---

---

**297 Exhibit 22, p. 3 (000402). 5/22/02; CD# 000026; Tape# 02150; Transcript pages 00040-000411; Recording length; 21:30, 34:02.**

Brittany: Their phones must be like turned off like he didn't pay his bill or something because I don't know that's what it said, I mean it won't even let me try to get him. I called Rob and his girl and left a message for both of them to try to get a hold of him, so I'll get a hold of him somehow. I'll go to his house if I have to.

Tony [Trent] Yeah, yeah, its like extremely important

Brittany: I'll find him for you.

[Horton has changed his phone number and isn't calling Trent. So, Trent asks Britnee Stollings (Conway's girlfriend), who also doesn't have Horton's number, to track him down.]

---

**Exhibit 22, p. 4 (000403). 5/22/02; CD# 000026; Tape# 02150; Transcript pages 000400-000411; Recording length; 21:30, 34:02.**

Emily: Have him call you? Or do you want to call back here or what?

Tony [Trent]: Yeah, just tell him to call me, like the minute he walks in the door, tell him to call me.

[Trent is trying to get in touch with Nightingale through Nightingale's girlfriend, Emily Jackson.]

---

**Exhibit 22, pp. 4-5 (000403-000404). 5/22/02; CD# 000026; Tape# 02150; Transcript pages 000400-000411; Recording length; 21:30, 34:02.**

[Horton]: Hey we got that phone shut off

Tony [Trent]: Okay, what is this a new number?

[Horton:] No this is a pay phone

[Horton finally returns Trent's call, but doesn't give Trent his new number.]

---

**Exhibit 22, p. 6 (000405). 5/22/02; CD# 000026; Tape# 02150; Transcript pages 000400-000411; Recording length; 21:30, 34:02.**

Tony [Trent]: What's up. Hey Jamie [Horton] was supposed to give me his new number but he didn't give it to me.

Female [Stollings]: I don't have it yet either.

---

Tony: Well can you get hold of him?

[Trent lies and tells Britnee Stollings that Horton was supposed to give him Horton's new number. Horton is trying to avoid Trent, but Trent is relentless.]

---

**Exhibit 22, p. 7 (000406). 5/22/02; CD# 000026; Tape# 02150; Transcript pages 000400-000411; Recording length; 21:30, 34:02.**

Female [Stollings]: Can't get a hold of him, I don't know. Nobody answers the phone. I don't know, I'll probably be able to get a hold of him in ½ hour or something like that.

Tony [Trent]: A half hour?

Female: Yeah because his girl's gonna be with him

Tony: His girl? Okay well just tell him to call me when he gets rid of his girl, just tell him to go...

Female: Its like that's the only way I can get a hold of him, because of her phone right now, but I'll tell him to get to a pay phone and call you.

Tony: Okay, tell him to try to make it before a half hour.

Female: I mean I can't get a hold of him until then because I called her phone and that's what her family said that they'd probably be together.

[Trent is relentless in trying to get in touch with Horton, which is inconsistent with Horton and Conway being the motivation behind what Trent is doing.]

---

**Exhibit 22, pp. 7-8 (000406-000407). 5/22/02; CD# 000026; Tape# 02150; Transcript pages 000400-000411; Recording length; 21:30, 34:02.**

Brittany [Stollings]: Nobody's got a hold of him

Tony [Trent]: Don't Shawn [Nightingale] have his new number, I think he does, I think Jamie [Horton] gave it to him. I have to get a hold of him Brittany. I'm sitting out her in the country in the fucking parking lot.

...

Brittany I'll have to see where he's at and call you in about ½ hour.

Tony: You told me that ½ hour ago.

Brittany: No but I'm going to where he's at. I can't get a hold of him any other way. I'm just saying I'm about to go to where he's at

---

...

Tony: Tell them to get their fucking head out of their ass man, what the fuck.

...

Tony: Well, I hope somebody knows, I'm not enjoying this shit at all.

...

Tony: Well, when you get there, if he's not there, call me and I'll just get with him tomorrow. Either way, fucking call me because I need to talk to him like right now. I'm tired of sitting out here for nothing.

---

[Horton is trying to avoid Trent, but Trent is sending Stollings to look for him.]

---

**Exhibit 22, pp. 8-9 (000407-000408). 5/22/02; CD# 000026; Tape# 02150; Transcript pages 000400-000411; Recording length; 21:30, 34:02.**

Tony [Trent]: Man, what the fuck, what's up? Dude I'm getting pissed man.

Jamie [Horton]: At me?

Tony: At every fucking body, Jamie, this shit's crazy dog.

Jamie: What the fuck am I doing?

[Trent finally tracks Horton down and expresses how mad he is about Horton not answering his calls.]

---

**Exhibit 22, pp. 10 (000409). 5/22/02; CD# 000026; Tape# 02150; Transcript pages 000400-000411; Recording length; 21:30, 34:02.**

Tony [Trent]: Jimmy [Conway] knows I'm pissed dog.

Jamie [Horton]: All right (inaudible) [I'm not trying to make you mad dog.]

Tony: I know you are dog, I'm just, I gotta ease the anger problem and right now everybody's affecting it man.

Jamie: All right just don't take this out on me.

Tony: I ain't gonna take it out on you dog, just fucking, you know what I'm saying, I mean...

Jamie: I'll fucking keep her straight all right

---

Tony: I don't got the new number, that's what I'm saying.

Jamie: All right fucking write it you ain't never had a pen to write this shit.

Tony: No, what is it, I'll remember it, what is it?

Jamie: The easiest to remember is 893-3099.

[Trent finally tracks Horton down and expresses how mad he is about Horton not answering his calls and finally gets Horton's new number.]

---

**Exhibit 31, p. 2 (000563). 5/25/02; CD# 000034; Tape# 02171; Transcript pages 000562-000570, 000495-000498; Recording length 15:06, 79:58; at 01:00.**

JAMIE [Horton] Jim [Conway] just told him not to talk about nothing until, until you

CI [Trent] Till we go down and talk to him?

JAMIE Yeah

CI What the fuck, why is Jim fucking shit up? What's Chris talking about?

[Trent is mad because Conway is working against him.]

---

**Exhibit 32, pp. 14-15 (000584-000585). 5/25/02; CD# 000033; Tape# 02168; Transcript pages 000571-000589; Recording length 34:03, 36:05.**

CI [Trent] Yeah, I like to stay free and I'm not taking no unnecessary chances man... (phone ringing) Jimmy [Conway], Hello. Yeah, what's up man? (Cannot hear the other half of the conversation.) Nothing. Dude, you're fucking me up here Jay, because dog, I got, got something I'm trying to do here man, you know what I'm saying and you know what I'm saying and you're giving other people instructions that's going against what the fuck I'm trying to do and you're making my job a hundred times harder than it has to be. Well I mean, that's not my understanding... Shawn's [Nightingale] in the car right now, so well, I mean listen you know that one thing right that was originally started, okay, I'm going to do that same thing again with the other thing, you understand what I'm saying? I'm ...just ...trust... listen Jimmy, do you trust me dog? Okay, then that's all you need, you need to let these guys know that, that I'm not no mother fucking cop and I'm not no mother fucking idiot, I know what the fuck I'm doing

...

CI I mean, it's not Shawn dog... Well listen, this is what I need you to do dog, all I need you to do is let Shawn and Jamie [Horton] know I know what the fuck I'm

---

doing and to help me in whatever way they can, that's all I need you to do dog and no more change of plan an no more change of orders, no more change of instructions, that's all I need you to do, so can you do that?...Let's just say its' for insurance sakes, okay, I mean, I understand you feel there ain't no need for it right now, but what happens if there's a need for it later. I got it covered now...Okay, so, okay, listen, to alleviate all that shit, just do what I ask you to do bro, that's all and you know I'm going to take care of the rest, you already know that. It's not just insurance for me, it's insurance for every fucking body... I mean just the thought of a mother fucker even thinking I might be a mother fucking cop, you know what I'm saying, you know how it gets me dog, you know how I am... Dog listen. I gave you my word I would do what I could to get you out of there. You gave me your word I could do this the way I want to do it, so, so let's just stick to that alright.

[In the first part Trent tells Conway for the first time that Trent is going to make a video of someone confessing to killing Dotson. Conway clearly responds that he doesn't want him to do that, but Trent persists. Trent doesn't want Conway involved or even knowing what Trent is doing. Trent wants Conway to instruct Horton and Nightingale to do whatever Trent says and then for Conway just to stay out of the way and not even question what Trent is doing.]

---

**298 Exhibit 32, pp. 14-15 (000584-000585). 5/25/02; CD# 000033; Tape# 02168; Transcript pages 000571-000589; Recording length 34:03, 36:05.**

CI [Trent] Yeah, I like to stay free and I'm not taking no unnecessary chances man...(phone ringing) Jimmy [Conway], Hello. Yeah, what's up man? (Cannot hear the other half of the conversation.) Nothing. Dude, you're fucking me up here Jay, because dog, I got, got something I'm trying to do here man, you know what I'm saying and you know what I'm saying and you're giving other people instructions that's going against what the fuck I'm trying to do and you're making my job a hundred times harder than it has to be. Well I mean, that's not my understanding... Shawn's [Nightingale] in the car right now, so well, I mean listen you know that one thing right that was originally started, okay, I'm going to do that same thing again with the other thing, you understand what I'm saying? I'm ...just ...trust... listen Jimmy, do you trust me dog? Okay, then that's all you need, you need to let these guys know that, that I'm not no mother fucking cop and I'm not no mother fucking idiot, I know what the fuck I'm doing

...

CI I mean, it's not Shawn dog...Well listen, this is what I need you to do dog, all I need you to do is let Shawn and Jamie [Horton] know I know what the fuck I'm doing and to help me in whatever way they can, that's all I need you to do dog

---

*and no more change of plan and no more change of orders, no more change of instructions, that's all I need you to do, so can you do that?...Let's just say its' for insurance sakes, okay, I mean, I understand you feel there ain't no need for it right now, but what happens if there's a need for it later. I got it covered now...Okay, so, okay, listen, to alleviate all that shit, just do what I ask you to do bro, that's all and you know I'm going to take care of the rest, you already know that. It's not just insurance for me, it's insurance for every fucking body... I mean just the thought of a mother fucker even thinking I might be a mother fucking cop, you know what I'm saying, you know how it gets me dog, you know how I am... Dog listen. I gave you my word I would do what I could to get you out of there. You gave me your word I could do this the way I want to do it, so, so let's just stick to that alright.*

[Trent tells Conway for the first time that Trent is going to make a video of someone confessing to killing Dotson. Conway clearly responds that he doesn't want him to do that, but Trent persists. Trent doesn't want Conway involved or even knowing what Trent is doing. Trent wants Conway to instruct Horton and Nightingale to do whatever Trent says and then for Conway just to stay out of the way and not even question what Trent is doing. If Conway, Horton, and Nightingale do not follow these instructions, Trent interprets that as accusing him of being a cop, and Trent gets very upset at such accusations.]

---

<sup>299</sup> Exhibit 53, 3118 TT Vol. I, at 86;

Exhibit 16, p. 7 (000315). 5/19/02; CD# 000015; Tape# 02144; Transcript pages 000307-000324; Recording length 19:30, 30:23.

C.I. [Trent] I mean, you got some shit you got to take care of then bro, I mean, you know what I'm saying, I'm supposed to be in charge of this shit, I feel like I'm being played like a fucking flunky and I'm not liking it at all

[Trent is telling Conway that he is supposed to be in charge and everyone is supposed to be doing what he says. They are giving him the runaround.]

---

Exhibit 31, p. 3 (000564). 5/25/02; CD# 000034; Tape# 02171; Transcript pages 000562-000570, 000495-000498; Recording length 15:06, 79:58.

CI [Trent] Well I mean, it's not, it's not even that bro, I mean, okay as far as that shit goes, fuck that, you know what I'm saying, I'm just talking about in general man, I mean, I mean fuck man, I'm supposed to get them mother fucking, that heat from Shawn [Nightingale], know what I'm saying, I'm supposed to get some hard from you and it's like, I don't know, I don't know, I feel like I'm getting fucking ran around man, I just

---

[Trent expresses his anger that he is not being given what he asked for and is being given the run around.]

---

**Exhibit 31, p. 5 (000566). 5/25/02; CD# 000034; Tape# 02171; Transcript pages 000562-000570, 000495-000498; Recording length 15:06, 79:58; at 05:30.**

CI [Trent] Know what I'm saying, so, uh, that's what I'm saying, I'm going to get this shit from him [Nightingale] tonight dog and I'm done fucking with him ,cause he's, he's, like he's getting on my mother fucking nerves, it's like he's playing two-face shit and I'm not on that

---

[Trent expresses his anger that Nightingale isn't cooperating with him.]

---

**Exhibit 32, p. 11 (000581). 5/25/02; CD# 000033; Tape# 02168; Transcript pages 000571-000589; Recording length 34:03, 36:05; at 14:30.**

CI [Trent] I didn't, dude, I didn't even want to take the mother fuckers and show them to Jimmy [Conway], know what I'm saying, but Jimmy wanted proof so, there's your fucking proof, and now you play me like I'm a fucking half a fag or something, just running me around in fucking circles and I'm not cool with that.

---

[Trent tells Nightingale that Conway is giving him the runaround.]

---

**Exhibit 33, p. 4 (000594). 5/25/02; CD# 000023; Tape# 02169; Transcript pages 000590-000598; Recording length 09:00, 09:53.**

CI [Trent] They probably no they're not still there now it's raining too late alright well look man when can you guys get me what I need dog and I can stop fucking asking you about it and stop feeling like I'm getting run around the fucking board you don't have to say nothing though.

---

[Trent is trying to intimidate Horton into giving him the information he wants. Then he complains about getting the runaround.]

---

<sup>300</sup> **Exhibit 16, p. 8 (000316). 5/19/02; CD# 000015; Tape# 02144; Transcript pages 000307-000324; Recording length 19:30, 30:23.**

C.I. [Trent] Then we ain't got to worry about nothing, cause I mean I need to talk to you dog, I don't, I don't like the way this shit's going down, and I'm not getting ready to get played like no fucking idiot

...

---

C.I.           Aright, well when Jamie [Horton] comes to visit you tonight man, call me and let me know what the fuck you told him that I'm in charge or whatever

[Trent is telling Conway that he wants him to tell Horton that Trent is in charge.]

---

301 Exhibit 37, Trent's 3118 TT Vol. I, p. 182.

302 Exhibit 25, p. 18 (000491). 5/23/02; CD# 000007, 000032; Tape# 02157; Transcript pages 000473-000494, 000637-000641.

CI [Trent]       Chris okay I love you... I was pissed and then I had to use one of my dad's cause I didn't want to fuck with the 38 dog I had to use one of my dad's for that so I got to give him one of those back

Male 2 [Horton]     *That shits tight*

CI               Cause I we definitely do not want him pissed definite he's like a take care of the take care

[Trent is telling Horton that he has to give his dad back a gun he borrowed because no one wants his dad pissed off. Then Trent claims his dad kills other hitmen ("take care of the take care").]

---

303 Exhibit 37, 3118 TT Vol. I, at 185-186; Exhibit 40, p. 1824; Exhibit 19, p. 10 (000354). 5/20/02; CD# 000005; Transcript pages 000328, 000345-000355; Recording length 18:30; at 16:20.

CI [Trent]       Yeah cause I mean I heard he was fucked up, you know what I'm saying that's why I was like, cause I mean my dad, Jimmy [Conway] will tell you, my dad's old school dog and we got connections, I know you're going to be arrested before you get arrested let's put it like that...

[Trent is telling Horton that Trent has connections with the police and he would be notified prior to someone being arrested.]

---

304 3117 TT at 742.

---

305 Exhibit 25, p. 20 (000493). 5/23/02; CD# 000007, 000032; Tape# 02157; Transcript pages 000473-000494, 000637-000641.

CI [Trent] I mean dog tell me right now let's stop bull shitting what's up with Shawn [Nightingale].

Male 2 [Conway] He don't really know nothing

CI Hugh

Male 2 whats he know about all this

CI He knows what I'm here for

Male 2 Does he know I man does he know anything that's what I'm saying I don't know

CI Don't get me caught up though because he you know what I'm saying cause you let you emotions get involved this ain't personal it's business so you know what I'm saying you need to cut your losses or you take a gamble I'm taking gamble enough right now don't you

Male 2 Yeah

CI I mean you and him dog that's who I trust that's who I like and anything other than that is a causality

Male 2 Then He goes

[Conway tells Trent there is no reason to do anything to Nightingale because Nightingale cannot incriminate Conway. Thus, it was understood between Trent and Conway that Conway played no part in Dotson's death. Trent persists that Nightingale be killed because Nightingale is aware of what Trent says he is doing. Trent says he believes Nightingale should be killed because Trent only trusts Conway and Horton. Trent wrote in Conway's supposed response, "Then he goes."]

---

306 Exhibit 19, p. 9 (000353). 5/20/02; CD# 000005; Transcript pages 000328, 000345-000355; Recording length 18:30.

CI But other than that, I'm cool, know what I'm saying and uh, I think it would be better man, once we go down there and you show me who them dudes are and shit, hook me up with Sean [Nightingale], tell him not going to whack him

---

though, just, I give you my word, know what I'm saying, you vouch for Sean and if something happens with Sean, I'm going to come see you

Jamie Horton Alright

CI And you already know I'm not playing, so

...

Jamie Horton That's why I had a feeling that's why I don't want to go with you

...

CI Jimmy [Conway] said, Jimmy was talking about that fucking prosecutor bitch dog uh, Cheryl Pritchard, I'm like well I don't know, he said he has somebody watching her out there, and I'm like well, I don't give a fuck dog, it don't matter to me if you're a thug I'm going after, politician, cop, I don't give a fuck. If I'm paid for a job, I'm going to do what I do and I'm good at what I do, I just, like I said man, don't. My question, if my questions make you nervous dog, just tell me and I'll tell you why I'm asking them, it's not that I'm asking just because I'm a curious mother fucker, I don't care why you killed Andrew [Dotson] it ain't my business, and I don't care...what the fuck did you guys stab dude with man

Jamie Horton It was something like a big ass pick or something

[Trent tells Horton that because Horton doesn't want Trent to kill Nightingale, if Nightingale does something Trent doesn't like, Trent will kill Horton. Horton explains that is why he did not want to go with Trent on the trip to Chillicothe. This is the first instance of Horton acknowledging that anything happened to Dotson other than Arthurs choking him, after a direct threat to kill Horton.]

---

**Exhibit 30, p. 30 (000649). 5/25/02, 5:10pm; CD# 000038, 000008; Transcript pages 000500-000522, 000643-000655; Recording length 42:09, 42:49; 23:19, 51:46.**

-This transcript reads:

CI [Trent] Yeah when I went look when I went I said well let me see the trunk \_\_\_\_\_ he was probably like oh my god I just told Shawn [Nightingale] after, after Shawn gives me the mother fucking um after he gives me the nines tonight man for them dudes in Chilly and fuck him he tells me what he knows about that shit I really don't even want to fuck with him no more you know what I'm saying I don't fuck with nobody that's scary like that man cause he's the type of dude that \_\_\_\_\_ you know what I'm saying I gave my word I would so

---

HORTON      Okay...

-The actual recording on CD # 8; approximately 14:30 is as follows:

Trent:        Yeah, when I went, look when I went I said well let me see the trunk he was probably like, "Oh my god." I just told Shawn [Nightingale] after, after Shawn gives me the mother fucking, um, after he gives me the nines tonight man for them dudes in Chilly, fuck him. He tells me what he knows about that shit I really don't even want to fuck with him no more you know what I'm saying? I won't fuck with nobody that's scary like that man cause he's the type of dude that would make you have to whack him you know what I'm saying I gave my word I would so...

Horton:       Okay...

[Trent tells Horton that Nightingale not cooperating with him makes him want to kill Nightingale. An obvious attempt to intimidate Horton.]

---

**Exhibit 33, p. 2 (000592). 5/25/02; CD# 000023; Tape# 02169; Transcript pages 000590-000598; Recording length 09:00, 09:53; at 01:10.**

CI [Trent]    That's what I'm telling everybody I'm like look let's quit fucking and beating around the bush sit down with me tell me what the fuck I need to know so I can stop asking you guys and I can stoop hearing this shit myself cause it's just all it is all this from the time like when Sean [nightingale] was telling me tonight from the time that he fucking from the time he got taken out of the car after that I don't know what the fuck happened so I can't you know what I'm saying what he fuck am I suppose to say you fail me mean it's like where ever he was at is evidence you know what I'm saying I don't know if you know you guys said yeah okay it was on Galloway Road okay so fucking what on the side of the road you know what I'm saying an that's what I was telling him I was like just let these guys know to tell me what the fuck I need to know so we can be done with it.

HORTON       \_\_\_\_\_ man I just

CI            I mean I'll go see him tomorrow you know what I'm saying so that way we can just everybody can get everything out in the fucking open though cause I'm just tired I'm starting to feel like you guys are spinning me round and round and round man.

[Trent trying to intimidate Horton into telling him what happened to Dotson, but Horton doesn't respond. This conversation would not be possible if Horton had given Trent all the information the night before, as Trent claims.]

---

---

307 Exhibit 18, p. 5 (000333); 5/20/02, 4:35pm; (No recording); Transcript pages 000329-000344.

CI [Trent] alright well me and Jamie [Horton] is having a little problem

[Trent is telling Conway that Horton doesn't want to drive to Chillicothe with Trent, and Horton doesn't have the address to the places Trent wants to go either. Trent won't except it and just let the thing drop.]

---

Exhibit 18, p. 6 (000334); 5/20/02, 4:35pm; (No recording); Transcript pages 000329-000344.

CI [Trent] ok, well what time we going down there

Male [Horton] I \_\_\_\_\_ (laughing) I'll call you from a pay phone

...

Male \_\_\_\_\_ he [Nightingale] knows exactly all the places, I don't, I don't even really know, he's doing

[Trent asks Horton when they are going to Chillicothe so Horton can show Trent where everyone lives. Horton doesn't want to go, he wants Trent to meet up with Nightingale and get the information from him.]

---

Exhibit 18, p. 10 (000338). 5/20/02, 4:35pm; (No recording); Transcript pages 000329-000344.

CI [Trent] what's up \_\_\_\_\_ LOTS OF NOISE that fucking Jamie [Horton] acting like a bitch man

...

CI I just want him to go down there and show me who the fuck I need to take, you feel me

[Trent says Horton is being a bitch because he doesn't want to go to Chillicothe with Trent.]

---

Exhibit 18, p. 11 (000339). 5/20/02, 4:35pm; (No recording); Transcript pages 000329-000344.

CI [Trent] tell him, tell him quit being a fucking pussy man, god damn

...

CI \_\_\_\_\_ man, I mean it's fucking, \_\_\_\_\_ fucking scared he's, it's like he's ready to piss hisself when I talk to him \_\_\_\_\_ dog.

---

...

CI no, he's fucking spooked, so a, look man, just tell him we'll go down there and we will be coming back

...

CI telling him quit being a bitch man, god damn, I thought he was a gangster

[Trent is mad because Horton doesn't want to go to Chillicothe with Trent because Horton is afraid of Trent. Det. Scott is listening in on this conversation and also must know Horton is afraid Trent will hurt him, contrary to Scott's testimony.]

---

**308** Exhibit 16, p. 8 (000316). 5/19/02; CD# 000015; Tape# 02144; Transcript pages 000307-000324; Recording length 19:30, 30:23.

C.I. [Trent] Right, What, he's [Horton] afraid I wouldn't let him come back?

CONWAY Yeah, that's what he's afraid of

[Trent asks Conway if Horton was afraid Trent was going to kill him when they went to Chillicothe, and Conway confirms this.]

---

**309** Exhibit 17, p. 1 (000326). 5/19/02; CD# 000021; Tape# 02145; Transcript pages 000325-000327; Recording length \*\*:\*\*, 10:09; at 02:30.

C.I. [Trent] ?? Okay. I need that heat dog. I went to Jimmy's [Conway] and he- \_\_\_\_\_  
fucking nuts. I'm not a cop. So Shawn's [Nightingale] down there right, can you hook up with Shawn, just tell Shawn to meet me down there.

Horton I mean I don't say nothing bad about you dude, I just *got scared*

C.I. I feel you *If a motherfucker just showed me a cideo of a Dead Mothe  
fucker I wouldn't wanta ride with him either*

[Trent is telling Conway that he wants him to tell Horton that Trent is in charge.]

---

---

310 Exhibit 19, p. 1 (000345). 5/20/02; CD# 000005; Transcript pages 000328, 000345-000355;  
Recording length 18:30.

Jamie Horton Hey man I go with you man

[CI Trent] Yeah don't act so spooked Dog

...

CI Yeah, I mean, you ain't got nothing to worry about dog. I'm not, you know what I'm saying

...

CI Yeah, I mean I mean, the least of your worries is me doing something to though

[Horton finally agrees to go with Trent to Chillicothe, with Trent's assurances that Horton would not be killed.]

---

Exhibit 19, p. 2 (000346). 5/20/02; CD# 000005; Transcript pages 000328, 000345-000355;  
Recording length 18:30.

CI [Trent] No I'm cool on that, uh... I mean fuck dog, I told Him, I was like fucking Jamie's [Horton] spooked dog, I think he thinks I'm going to take him down there and he ain't coming back man

Jamie Horton he's going to whack me, I said man, I'm Not going to get whacked, I ain't cool with that

CI That's what I told you like well we'll just leave the heat here, I'm like, we won't take it down there, we'll get it when we get back

Jamie Horton That's what, I was just like, I mean, I ain't going to lie man, that shit, I mean whenever he showed me that shit I was like damn dog, I mean I freaked, for real, that's real

[Trent explicitly says he knew Horton didn't want to go to Chillicothe because Horton was afraid he would be killed. Horton agrees and explains that it was the picture Trent showed him of the dead body that made him not want to go.]

---

---

**Exhibit 19, p. 6 (000350). 5/20/02; CD# 000005; Transcript pages 000328, 000345-000355; Recording length 18:30.**

CI [Trent] (Chuckle) It's just, it's a figure of speech to me dog, it's just... I meant I told Jimmy, [Conway] I was like James, I think Jamie [Horton] thinks I'm going to fucking whack him

...

CI he was like man he does, I said man would you tell him dog not to worry about  
[Trent explicitly says he knew Horton didn't want to go to Chillicothe because Horton was afraid he would be killed.]

---

**Exhibit 19, p. 8 (000352). 5/20/02; CD# 000005; Transcript pages 000328, 000345-000355; Recording length 18:30.**

CI [Trent] Already dude, quit being so shaky man, I'm not

...

CI I ain't going to do nothing to you bro

[Even after Horton agrees to go with Trent, Horton is still afraid he is going to be killed, as acknowledged here by Trent.]

---

**Exhibit 21, p. 5 (000397). 5/21/02; CD# 000031; Tape# 02148; Transcript pages 000393-000399.**

Calvin Horton He was like, do you want to come down here with me \_\_\_\_\_

C.I. [Trent] I know, I was like, that's why I told you first, I was like dog, we ain't even got to bring the gun with us man.

[Trent acknowledges that Horton was afraid Trent was going to kill him, that's why Trent says he told Horton he wasn't even going to bring a gun with him.]

---

311 Exhibit 53, Scott's 3118 TT Vol. I, p 78.

312 Exhibit 37, Trent's 3118 TT Vol. I, p. 200.

313 Exhibit 37, Trent's 3118 TT Vol. I, p. 200.

---

**314** Exhibit 19, p. 9 (000353). 5/20/02; CD# 000005; Transcript pages 000328, 000345-000355; Recording length 18:30.

CI But other than that, I'm cool, know what I'm saying and uh, I think it would be better man, once we go down there and you show me who them dudes are and shit, hook me up with Sean [Nightingale], tell him not going to whack him though, just, I give you my word, know what I'm saying, you vouch for Sean and if something happens with Sean, I'm going to come see you

Jamie Horton Alright

CI And you already know I'm not playing, so

...

Jamie Horton That's why I had a feeling that's why I don't want to go with you

[Trent tells Horton that because Horton doesn't want Trent to kill Nightingale, if Nightingale does something Trent doesn't like, Trent will kill Horton. Horton explains that is why he did not want to go with Trent to Chillicothe.]

---

**315** Exhibit 37, Trent's 3118 TT Vol. I, p. 209.

**316** Exhibit 53, Scott's 3118 TT Vol. I, p. 62.

**317** Exhibit 22, p. 11 (000410). 5/22/02; CD# 000026; Tape# 02150; Transcript pages 000400-000411; Recording length 21:30, 34:02.

Tony [Trent]: Yeah we'll just, we'll holler tomorrow man.

Jamie [Horton]: All right that's cool.

Tony: All right Jamie I'll holler at you.

Jamie: All right.

Tony: Later

Dude he is so fuckin scared its unbelievable. Its on tape.

[Trent says Horton is so scared it's unbelievable. This statement is meant for Scott.]

---

---

318 Exhibit 36, Trent's 3118 TT Vol. I, pp. 204-205.

319 Exhibit 53, Scott's 3118 TT Vol. I, pp. 91-92.

320 Exhibit 25, p. 2 (000475). 5/23/02; CD# 000007, 000032; Tape# 02157; Transcript pages 000473-000494, 000637-000641.

CI [Trent] Why do you think I was pissed last night

CI Well look when you bounce out of here want to see Jimmy [Conway] for a few minutes go to um your crib when I call you we'll meet hook up and do that Chill out man dam, you need valiums or something bro

[Trent telling Horton that Horton needs Valiums to calm his nerves because he is visibly shaking.]

---

Exhibit 25, p. 21 (000494). 5/23/02; CD# 000007, 000032; Tape# 02157; Transcript pages 000473-000494, 000637-000641.

CI [Trent] Hold on before he goes dog will you let him I told him dog I'm not doing that to him am I mean you got to \_\_\_\_\_ alright so \_\_\_\_\_

[Trent telling Conway to assure Horton Trent is not going to kill him.]

---

Exhibit 26, p. 1 (000466). 5/23/02, 9:30pm; CD# 050-369, 000030; Tape# 02155, 02159; Transcript pages 000466-000472; Recording length 05:30, 05:54; 45:00, 47:09.

C.I. [Trent] Just hit me up, relax man, damn

[Trent telling Horton to relax. Horton is nervous around Trent at all times now.]

---

Exhibit 32, p. 8 (000578). 5/25/02; CD# 000033; Tape# 02168; Transcript pages 000571-000589; Recording length 34:03, 36:05.

CI [Trent] That's what I thought, I told Jamie [Horton], I was like man, I just, know what I'm saying he ain't spent no time with me, you guys, probably got him thinking I'm this fucking psycho killer, I mean, don't get me wrong dog, I'll whack a mother fucker if I need to, but it's not like I'm just out to gun, you know what I'm saying, I didn't know you dog, it was just business, and now that I know you

[Trent explains that Horton thinks he's a psycho killer and that Horton probably conveyed this to Nightingale. But Trent assures Nightingale that he only kills people

---

when he needs to. Horton was not afraid Trent was a cop, Horton thought he was a psychotic killer.]

---

**Exhibit 32, p. 10 (000580). 5/25/02; CD# 000033; Tape# 02168; Transcript pages 000571-000589; Recording length 34:03, 36:05.**

CI [Trent] I don't know what the fuck he's scared of dog

...

CI yeah there is but, I mean, know what I'm saying, if I was going to whack him dog, he'd have been gone

[Trent talks with Nightingale about Horton being afraid Trent was going to kill Horton.]

---

**Exhibit 33, p. 2 (000592). 5/25/02; CD# 000023; Tape# 02169; Transcript pages 000590-000598; Recording length 09:00, 09:53; at 02:30.**

CI [Trent] You know what I'm saying

HORTON I know I got you it's a serious feeling this is serious shit

CI That's what I want you guys to know this is not a game I mean I laugh and I joke and I kick it but I'm still the same person I was the first night I met you

[Trent is telling Horton that even though they have been hanging out, he will still kill him if he needs to.]

---

**321** Exhibit 37, Trent's 3118 TT Vol. I, pp. 185, 186, 198, 200, 206, 207, and 220-222; Exhibit 38, Trent's 3118 TT Vol. III, pp. 108, 109, and 134-135.

**322** Exhibit 53, Scott's 3118 TT Vol. I, pp. 64, 75, 76, 78, 86, and 87; and Exhibit 54, Scott's 3118 TT Vol. III, pp. 284, 285, 301, 302, 303, 331, and 332.

**323** Exhibit 22, p. 3 (000402). 5/22/02; CD# 000026; Tape# 02150; Transcript pages 00040-000411; Recording length; 21:30, 34:02.

Brittany: Their phones must be like turned off like he didn't pay his bill or something because I don't know that's what it said, I mean it won't even let me try to get him. I called Rob and his girl and left a message for both of them to try to get a hold of him, so I'll get a hold of him somehow. I'll go to his house if I have to.

Tony [Trent] Yeah, yeah, its like extremely important

---

Brittany: I'll find him for you.

[Horton has changed his phone number and isn't calling Trent. So, Trent has Britnee Stollings (Conway's girlfriend), who also doesn't have Horton's number, to track him down.]

---

**Exhibit 22, p. 4 (000403). 5/22/02; CD# 000026; Tape# 02150; Transcript pages 000400-000411; Recording length; 21:30, 34:02.**

Emily: Have him call you? Or do you want to call back here or what?

Tony [Trent]: Yeah, just tell him to call me, like the minute he walks in the door, tell him to call me.

[Trent is trying to get in touch with Nightingale through Nightingale's girlfriend, Emily Jackson.]

---

**Exhibit 22, pp. 4-5 (000403-000404). 5/22/02; CD# 000026; Tape# 02150; Transcript pages 000400-000411; Recording length; 21:30, 34:02.**

[Horton]: Hey we got that phone shut off

Tony [Trent]: Okay, what is this a new number?

[Horton:] No this is a pay phone

[Horton finally returns Trent's call, but doesn't give Trent his new number.]

---

**Exhibit 22, p. 6 (000405). 5/22/02; CD# 000026; Tape# 02150; Transcript pages 000400-000411; Recording length; 21:30, 34:02.**

Tony [Trent]: What's up. Hey Jamie [Horton] was supposed to give me his new number but he didn't give it to me.

Female [Stollings]: I don't have it yet either.

Tony: Well can you get hold of him?

[Trent lies and tells Britnee Stollings that Horton was supposed to give him Horton's new number. Horton is trying to avoid Trent, but Trent is relentless.]

---

**Exhibit 22, p. 7 (000406). 5/22/02; CD# 000026; Tape# 02150; Transcript pages 000400-000411; Recording length; 21:30, 34:02.**

Female [Stollings]: Can't get a hold of him, I don't know. Nobody answers the phone. I don't know, I'll probably be able to get a hold of him in ½ hour or something like that.

---

Tony [Trent]: A half hour?

Female: Yeah because his girl's gonna be with him

Tony: His girl? Okay well just tell him to call me when he gets rid of his girl, just tell him to go...

Female: Its like that's the only way I can get a hold of him, because of her phone right now, but I'll tell him to get to a pay phone and call you.

Tony: Okay, tell him to try to make it before a half hour.

Female: I mean I can't get a hold of him until then because I called her phone and that's what her family said that they'd probably be together.

[Trent is relentless in trying to get in touch with Horton, which is inconsistent with Horton and Conway being the motivation behind what Trent is doing.]

---

**Exhibit 22, pp. 7-8 (000406-000407). 5/22/02; CD# 000026; Tape# 02150; Transcript pages 000400-000411; Recording length; 21:30, 34:02.**

Brittany [Stollings]: Nobody's got a hold of him

Tony [Trent]: Don't Shawn [Nightingale] have his new number, I think he does, I think Jamie [Horton] gave it to him. I have to get a hold of him Brittany. I'm sitting out her in the country in the fucking parking lot.

...

Brittany: I'll have to see where he's at and call you in about ½ hour.

Tony: You told me that ½ hour ago.

Brittany: No but I'm going to where he's at. I can't get a hold of him any other way. I'm just saying I'm about to go to where he's at

...

Tony: Tell them to get their fucking head out of their ass man, what the fuck.

...

Tony: Well, I hope somebody knows, I'm not enjoying this shit at all.

...

---

Tony: Well, when you get there, if he's not there, call me and I'll just get with him tomorrow. Either way, fucking call me because I need to talk to him like right now. I'm tired of sitting out here for nothing.

[Horton is training to avoid Trent, but Trent is sending Stollings to look for him.]

---

**Exhibit 22, pp. 8-9 (000407-000408). 5/22/02; CD# 000026; Tape# 02150; Transcript pages 000400-000411; Recording length; 21:30, 34:02.**

Tony [Trent]: Man, what the fuck, what's up? Dude I'm getting pissed man.

Jamie [Horton]: At me?

Tony: At every fucking body, Jamie, this shit's crazy dog.

Jamie: What the fuck am I doing?

[Trent finally tracks Horton down and expresses how mad he is about Horton not answering his calls.]

---

**Exhibit 22, pp. 10 (000409). 5/22/02; CD# 000026; Tape# 02150; Transcript pages 000400-000411; Recording length; 21:30, 34:02.**

Tony [Trent]: Jimmy [Conway] knows I'm pissed dog.

Jamie [Horton]: All right (inaudible) [I'm not trying to make you mad dog.]

Tony: I know you are dog, I'm just, I gotta ease the anger problem and right now everybody's affecting it man.

Jamie: All right just don't take this out on me.

Tony: I ain't gonna take it out on you dog, just fucking, you know what I'm saying, I mean...

Jamie: I'll fucking keep her straight all right

Tony: I don't got the new number, that's what I'm saying.

Jamie: All right fucking write it you ain't never had a pen to write this shit.

Tony: No, what is it, I'll remember it, what is it?

Jamie: The easiest to remember is 893-3099.

[Trent finally tracks Horton down and expresses how mad he is about Horton not answering his calls and finally gets Horton's new number.]

---

- 
- 324 Exhibit 53, Scott's 3118 TT Vol. I, at 75.
- 325 Exhibit 37, Trent's 3118 TT Vol. I, at 191.
- 326 Exhibit 53, Scott's testimony in Horton pretrial hearing. 3118 TT Vol. I, at 78-79.
- 327 3117 TT at 413-414.
- 328 Exhibit 59, Roberta Hannah's October 17, 2002 interview, at 3-4.
- 329 3117 TT at 413-414.
- 330 3117 TT at 940-941.
- 331 3117 TT at 347.
- 332 3117 TT at 362-364, and 375; Evidence log of this tape.
- 333 Exhibit 4, p. 11.
- 334 Evidence log of this tape.
- 335 3118 TT Vol. II, at 40-42.
- 336 3118 TT Vol. II, at 55-58 and 62-64.
- 337 3118 TT Vol. II, at 39.
- 338 Exhibit 61, police report on James shooting, a and b.
- 339 Exhibit 59, Roberta Hannah's October 13, 2002 interview, at 7 and 9; 3118 TT Vol. II, at 146 and 154.
- 340 Exhibit 59, Roberta Hannah's October 13, 2002 interview, p. 11; 3117 TT at 261.

---

341 3117 TT at 342 and 374; 3117 TT at 393-394.

342 3118 TT Vol. III, at 310.

343 Exhibit 61, police report on James shooting, a and b.

344 3118 TT Vol. III, at 311.

345 3117 TT at 414-415, and 429.

346 3117 TT at 852, 853, 856, and 858.

347 Exhibit 59, Roberta Hannah's interview, p. 11; 3117 TT at 261.

348 Exhibit 20, p. 5 (000370). 5/21/02; CD# 000003; Tape# 02149; Transcript pages 000364-000392; at 09:00.

CI [Trent] dog, what the fuck was the point in even doing, I could see it if he had something on yall, I mean what Jim [Conway] was telling me he was like He might be able you know say some shit on a racketeer cases, sounds Like he might have been able to fuck with \_\_\_\_\_ killed a mother Fucker cause you thought he might say something

Jamie [Horton] whatever of dope floats your boat

Laughing

CI have no idea

[Trent tells Horton that Conway told him the reason Dotson was killed was because of a racketeering case. Horton says he has no idea why Dotson was killed.]

---

349 3118 TT Vol. III, at 76.

350 Exhibit 57, Nightingale's May 28, 2002 interrogation pp. 3 and 12.

---

351 "That's just what [Arthurs] wanted to be my fucking, trying to be fucking part of us is what he said..." **Exhibit 57**, Nightingale's May 28, 2002 interrogation, p. 5; "[Arthurs] wanted to do it so bad, he wanted to use a fucking gun is what he wanted to do... He wanted me to fucking give him a spot to do it and that's what I did." **Exhibit 57**, Nightingale's May 28, 2002 interrogation, p. 18.

352 **Exhibit 58**, Nightingale's August 12, 2002 proffer, p. 13.

353 **Exhibit 58**, Nightingale's August 12, 2002 proffer, p. 12.

354 **Exhibit 51**, Arthurs's May 23, 2002 interview, pp. 2-3; **3118 TT Vol. II**, pp. 211 and 256.

355 **3118 TT Vol. II**, at 262.

356 **3117 TT** at 494.

357 **Exhibit 57**, Nightingale's May 28, 2002 interrogation, p. 5.

358 **Exhibit 57**, Nightingale's May 28, 2002 interrogation, p. 18.

359 **Exhibit 50**, Arthurs's May 13, 2002 interview summary, p. 1.

360 **Exhibit 57**, Nightingale's May 28, 2002 interrogation, p. 4; **Exhibit 58**, Nightingale's August 12, 2002 proffer p. 23; and **Exhibit 66** Nightingale's post-conviction testimony, **3117 PCT** at 17. Nightingale has family in Kermit, WV, **Exhibit 66** Nightingale's post-conviction testimony, **3117 PCT** at 20; Arthurs knew Nightingale had family in Kermit, WV, **3117 TT** at 575.

361 **Exhibit 66** Nightingale's post-conviction testimony, **3117 PCT** at 11-12.

362 **Exhibit 57**, Nightingale's May 28, 2002 interrogation, pp. 2-3.

363 **3117 TT** at 555-556.

364 **Exhibit 52**, Arthurs's **3118 TT Vol. II**, p. 209.

365 **Exhibit 60**, Hannah's **3118 TT Vol. II**, p. 132-135 and 147-148.

- 
- 366 Exhibit 61, James shooting police report b.
- 367 3117 TT at 418-419, 421, 423, and 430-431.
- 368 Exhibit 59, Hannah's October 17, 2002 interview, p. 12.
- 369 3117 TT at 419-421.
- 370 3117 TT at 346.
- 371 Exhibit 50, Arthurs's May 13, 2002 summary of interview, p. 1.
- 372 Exhibit 58, Nightingale's August 12, 2002 proffer, p. 25.
- 373 Exhibit 66 Nightingale's post-conviction testimony, 3117 PCT at 13.
- 374 3117 TT at 497.
- 375 3117 TT at 481.
- 376 3117 TT at 491-492.
- 377 3117 TT at 535.
- 378 3117 TT at 870.
- 379 3117 TT at 869.
- 380 3117 TT at 434.
- 381 3117 TT at 483.
- 382 3117 TT at 542 and 609.

---

383 3117 TT at 481.

384 3117 TT at 609.

385 Exhibit 57, Nightingale's May 28, 2002 interrogation, p. 4; Exhibit 58, Nightingale's August 12, 2002 proffer, p. 23; Exhibit 66 Nightingale's post-conviction testimony, 3117 PCT at 20; 3118 TT Vol. II, at 269.

386 3117 TT at 501-502, and 577.

387 Exhibit 35, Trent's April 25, 2002 interview, p. 3.

388 Exhibit 32, p. 17 (000587). 5/25/02; CD# 000033; Tape# 02168; Transcript pages 000571-000589; Recording length 34:03, 36:05; at 29:00.

CI [Trent] Well I thought you guys was supposed to fucking left him down in the hills

NIGHTENGALE *didn't* happened *didn't* happen at all like that, I wish it would've

CI It's just a lot of this shit that don't make sense you know what I'm saying, I mean what, I mean just *on the real* why didn't you leave him down there dog, did you just not, was you not \_\_\_\_\_ I mean I don't understand

NIGHTENGALE I really can't even [I don't know].

[Trent asks Nightingale why Dotson wasn't left in West Virginia, and Nightingale replies that it didn't happen at all like that and that he doesn't know..]

---

389 Exhibit 32, p. 4 (000574). 5/25/02; CD# 000033; Tape# 02168; Transcript pages 000571-000589; Recording length 34:03, 36:05.

-This transcript reads:

CI [Trent] You think maybe fucking Mike [Arthurs] was just playing you guys, \_\_\_\_\_ that he really didn't want to smoke him

NIGHTENGALE \_\_\_\_\_ I mean, he was doing everything he fucking could, had his fucking hand up like this pushing *like* -hard as he fucking possibly fucking could

-The actual recording on CD # 33; tape #2168 approximately 04:00 is as follows:

---

CI You think maybe fucking Mike [Arthurs] was just playing you guys, you know what I'm saying, that he really didn't want to smoke him

Nightingale I don't think so. I mean, he was doing everything he fucking could. Had his fucking hand up like this pushing like, hard as he fucking possibly fucking could.

[Nightingale tells Trent that he doesn't think Arthurs ever changed his mind about killing Dotson because he was trying as hard as he could to kill him.]

---

390 Exhibit 23, p. 16 (000445). 5/22/02; CD# 00010\*, 000028\*\*; Tape# 02152, 02153; Transcript pages 000429-000451; Recording length 45:40, 30:23 37:12.

-This transcript reads:

NIGHTENGALE Yeah, I wasn't there wasn't no place I could do it there wasn't nothing \_\_\_\_\_ me and Mike went down there we just couldn't find a good spot

C.I. [Trent] \_\_\_\_\_

NIGHTENGALE \_\_\_\_\_ me and Mike and \_\_\_\_\_ went down there we just could find a real good spot

C.I. That's what he said, fuck it, \_\_\_\_\_ shit dog

NIGHTENGALE \_\_\_\_\_ i mean did a lot of shit with him  
\_\_\_\_\_

-The actual recording on CD # 10; tape #2152 at approximately 42:15 is as follows:

Nightingale: Yeah, I wasn't, there wasn't no place I could do it. There wasn't nothing. Me and [Arthurs] went down there. Just couldn't find a real good spot. [Dotson] got drugged up that's all I know.

Trent: That's what he said. Yeah, the fucking Valiums and shit.

Nightingale: Yeah like fucking 11.

[Nightingale is telling Trent that the only reason he and Arthurs didn't kill Dotson in West Virginia is they couldn't find a good place to do it.]

---

- 
- 391 **Exhibit 66** Nightingale's post-conviction testimony, **3117** PCT at 55.
- 392 **Exhibit 66** Nightingale's post-conviction testimony, **3117** PCT at 18.
- 393 **3117** TT at 555-556.
- 394 **Exhibit 66** Nightingale's post-conviction testimony, **3117** PCT pp 22, and 48-49.
- 395 **Exhibit 50**, Summary of Arthurs's May 13, 2002 interview at 1; **Exhibit 51**, Arthurs's May 23, 2002 interview at 4; **3118** TT **Vol. II**, at 216 and 293; and **3117** TT at 500.
- 396 **Exhibit 57**, Nightingale's May 28, 2002 interrogation, p. 3.
- 397 **Exhibit 57**, Nightingale's May 28, 2002 interrogation, p. 10.
- 398 **Exhibit 57**, Nightingale's May 28, 2002 interrogation, p. 6.
- 399 **3117** TT at 506-507.
- 400 **3117** TT at 950.
- 401 **Exhibit 58**, Nightingale's August 12, 2002 proffer, p. 32; **Exhibit 36**, Trent's May 26, 2002 interview, p. 7.
- 402 **Exhibit 57**, Nightingale's May 28, 2002 interrogation, p. 5.
- 403 **3117** TT at 558.
- 404 **Exhibit 51**, Arthurs's May 23, 2002 interview, pp. 2-3; **3118** TT **Vol. II**, pp. 211 and 256.
- 405 **Exhibit 66** Nightingale's post-conviction testimony, **3117** PCT at 26.
- 406 **Need this URL.**
- 407 **State v. Arthurs**, Ross County, Ohio Common Peas case no 08 CR 000037.

---

408 3117 TT at 511.

409 Exhibit 58, Nightingale's August 12, 2002 proffer, p. 36.

410 Exhibit 32, p. 4 (000574). 5/25/02; CD# 000033; Tape# 02168; Transcript pages 000571-000589; Recording length 34:03, 36:05; at 04:00.

NIGHTENGALE At least fucking, maybe not a half hour man, but it fucking seemed like it, you know what I mean, maybe 15 minutes maybe

CI [Trent] You think, cause see when you choke somebody that long dog, it's, he should have been gone, know what I'm saying.

NIGHTENGALE That's what I thought.

CI You think maybe fucking Mike [Arthurs] was just playing you guys, \_\_\_\_\_ that he really didn't want to smoke him

NIGHTENGALE \_\_\_\_\_ I mean, he was doing everything he fucking could, had his fucking hand up like this pushing like—hard as he fucking possibly fucking could

---

411 Arthurs never mentioned standing on Dotson's neck in his 5/13/02 (Exhibit 50) interview (see 3118 TT Vol. III, at 95), he later admitted it (Exhibit 51, Arthurs's May 23, 2002 interview, at 7; 3118 TT Vol. II, at 225, 227, and 278; 3118 TT Vol. IV, at 95, 97, and 103; 3117 TT at 511).

412 Exhibit 51, Arthurs's May 23, 2002 interview, pp. 7-8.

413 Exhibit 51, Arthurs's May 23, 2002 interview, pp. 7-8.

414 Exhibit 51, Arthurs's May 23, 2002 interview, p. 9.

415 Exhibit 58, Nightingale's August 12, 2002 proffer, p. 36.

416 Exhibit 57, Nightingale's May 28, 2002 interrogation, pp. 6-8; Exhibit 58, Nightingale's August 12, 2002 proffer, p. 36.

- 
- 417 Exhibit 58, Nightingale's August 12, 2002 proffer, p. 43.
- 418 Exhibit 66 Nightingale's post-conviction testimony, 3117 PCT at 25.
- 419 Exhibit 66 Nightingale's post-conviction testimony, 3117 PCT at 33.
- 420 Original autopsy.
- 421 Exhibit 66 Nightingale's post-conviction testimony, 3117 PCT at 19-20.
- 422 Exhibit 66 Nightingale's post-conviction testimony, 3117 PCT at 19-20.
- 423 Exhibit 66 Nightingale's post-conviction testimony, 3117 PCT at 23; and Arthurs, 3117 TT at 577.
- 424 3118 TT Vol. II, at 270.
- 425 3117 TT at 622.
- 426 3117 TT at 600.
- 427 Exhibit 51, Arthurs's May 23, 2002 interview at 9.
- 428 3117 TT at 508; 3117 TT at 579 and 584; 3118 TT Vol. II, at 280.
- 429 3118 TT Vol III, at 171-172, 197. Arthurs describes Dotson "flopping around" 3118 TT Vol II at 280.
- 430 3117 TT at 649.
- 431 3117 TT at 668-669, and 711.
- 432 3117 TT at 664-671; 3117 TT at 668.
- 433 Exhibit 66 Nightingale's post-conviction testimony, 3117 PCT at 20; 3118 TT Vol. II, at 269.

---

434 3117 TT at 668-669, and 711.

435 3117 TT at 680-681.

436 [REDACTED] Dr. Fardal's affidavit, paragraph 10.

437 See Dr. Spitz findings.

438 3117 TT at 690.

439 3117 TT at 690.

440 3117 TT at 689.

441 3117 TT at 695.

442 3117 TT at 659-660.

443 3117 TT at 686.

444 3118 TT Vol. IV, p. 94 of McGowan direct examination.

445 Exhibit 50, Arthurs's May 13, 2002 interview summary at 3; Exhibit 51, Arthurs's May 23, 2002 interview at 12; 3118 TT Vol. IV, at 93; and 3117 TT at 536.

446 3118 TT Vol. IV, at 114 and 121.

447 [REDACTED] Dr. Fardal's affidavit, paragraph 9 and 10.

448 [REDACTED] Dr. Fardal's affidavit, paragraph 14.

449 [REDACTED] Dr. Fardal's affidavit, paragraph 15(c).

450 [REDACTED] Dr. Fardal's affidavit, paragraph 15(d).

---

451 **Dr. Fardal's affidavit, paragraph 11.**

452 **3117 TT at 680-681.**

453 **3117 TT at 649 and 668.**

454 **3117 TT at 662.**

455 **3117 TT at 661.**

456 **3117 TT at 650-651.**

457 **Exhibit 36, Trent's May 26, 2002 interview, pp. 6-7;**

**Written Statement of Witness Ronald Trent dated 5/24/02**

...Shawn told me that him & Mike picked Andrew up around 12pm and fed him  
11 Zanaks 3 Somas and some red heart pills...

458 **1153 TT p. 1891.**

459 **Exhibit 12, p. 4.**